Perempuan-perempuan Surokonto Wetan
(The Women of Surokonto Wetan)

The women of Surokonto Wetan who are defending their land from the process of Kendeng Rembang land’s quid pro quo (tukar guling) by two state owned corporations (PT Semen Indonesia and PERHUTANI) are just few of the world’s one billion landless people who are facing food insecurity. With the country’s agricultural sector is experiencing irreparable damage with farmers and farm workers being snatched from their access to land, rice fields and plantation, the government of Central Java Province, especially of Kendal Regency, is responsible for preventing threats to the food self-sufficiency and nutrition supply and health of the deprived families in the acquisition of land from the Surokonto people. The international community also has the moral obligation to reconsider their investment initiatives in regards to sustainable and safe land redistribution and justice for local people. The women of Surokonto Wetan “have planted a lesung (a rice mortar)” in their wombs for the last two years. A lesung, a traditional tool for pounding rice grains, is a metaphorical symbol of a family unit’s food basket and vital for Indonesia’s food self-sufficiency. It is therefore the state’s duty to return the Lesung soon to the women. Only in this way may the process towards the nation’s food sovereignty be ensured.
INTERNATIONAL JOURNAL OF INDONESIAN STUDIES
SPRING 2016

CONTENTS

From the Editor
Yacinta Kurniasih

RESEARCH ARTICLES

Religious Ceremonies in Balinese Society: A Case Study of a Cremation Ritual in Tabanan
Anom Rajendra & Nicholas Temple

Re-inventing Tabloid Journalism in Indonesia
Diyah Hayu Rahmitasari

Code-switching and English Language Variations among Indonesian Facebooks
Billy Nathan Setiawan

Structuralism in Eastern Indonesia: An Origin for a Theory in the Social Sciences
Yancey Orr and Raymond I. Orr

“Au ume ma au ena”: my house and my mother: An investigation of environmental health and the traditional use of the ume kbubu in relation to maternal and neonatal mortality conditions in South Central Timor
Nicholas Metherall, Jawhari Effendi, Geoff Dews, Sandra Frans, Willhelmus Mella, Jimmy Pello, Claudya Dhaja, Ananias Besh

Living adat Law, Indigenous Peoples and the State Law: A Complex Map of Legal Pluralism in Indonesia
Mirza Satria Buana

The Impact of Information Communication and Technology on Students’ Academic Performance: Evidence from Indonesian EFL Classrooms
Arzal

ESSAYS

Poetic Reaction to Political Excess: W.S. Rendra, Peacock and People’s Poet
Moira Neagle

The Socio-Political Factors of the Emergence of Teaching English in Postcolonial Indonesia
Dewi Candraningrum

The FIQH Paradigm and the Moderate Theory of Secularization: Abdurrahman Wahid on Islam, Democracy and the Republic of Indonesia
Saefur Rochmat

The Influence of Walter Benjamin on Benedict Anderson
Anthony Taylor
From the Editor: Yacinta Kurniasih
Yacinta.Kurniasih@monash.edu

The International Journal of Indonesian Studies [IJIS] is proud to present its Spring Issue, 2016. It has been another difficult but also productive year for our fledgling journal and, again, we are always extremely grateful for everyone’s patience. A number of important steps have been taken including obtaining SCOPUS accreditation as well as imminent listing on the Open Access Journal’s database.

We have also reviewed and revised the IJIS Style Guide and request future contributors read and follow these guidelines exactly. Close adherence to the Style Guide will streamline the review and ultimately the publication process.

We cannot thank enough our reviewers. Without their contribution, it would be impossible to continue this project. The efficient review of papers is largely what has hindered timely publication of IJIS 3. Those reviewers who have stayed true to their word and reviewed and returned papers in a reasonable timeframe are making a genuine contribution to fostering contemporary and innovative Indonesian scholarship, which is what IJIS is all about! Thank you so much.

Of course, given recent developments in Indonesia regarding the importance of publishing in English in international, peer-reviewed journals such as IJIS, we are confident of a bright future for IJIS. As well, the role of reviewing for journals such as IJIS is also well recognised and so we again invite reviewers from all disciplines to contact us. But, again, please do not offer to review unless you can commit to a 6 week turn around. It is simply not fair to the authors to have their scholarship waiting so long and losing its currency.

Again, we are very appreciative of the artistic contribution made by Dewi Candraningrum. Special thanks also to Elisabet Titik Murtisari (Satya Wacana University) for her wonderful support, advice and guidance. Finally, we ask for your support firstly in disseminating news of IJIS’s Spring Issue through your networks; second, in constructive critique of this collaborative project; third, and most importantly, contributing your work for publication in future issues.

Yacinta Kurniasih

Special Acknowledgements:
Nasya Bahfen
Made Hery Santosa
Ribut Wahyudi
Richard Curtis
David Mitchell
Graeme MacRae
Religious Ceremonies in Balinese Society: A Case Study of a Cremation Ritual in Tabanan

Anom Rajendra and Nicholas Temple.

Biodata: Anom Rajendra is a PhD candidate in the Department of Architecture at University of Huddersfield, United Kingdom. He is also a lecturer at Udayana University in Bali. Email: u0055305@hud.ac.uk

Biodata: Nicholas Temple is a Professor of Architecture and Director of the Centre for Urban Design, Architecture and Sustainability (CUDAS) at the University of Huddersfield, United Kingdom. Email: N.Temple@hud.ac.uk

Abstract
This paper considers the cremation ceremony in the context of the life of the inhabitants of a Balinese community, tracing relationships between ritual itinerary and topography, and highlighting tensions and conflicts that have emerged between these ritual traditions and recent developments in tourism. The unique feature of the cremation ceremony is not only its procession, and particular architectural forms, but also the accompanying festival events that parade from the house of the deceased to the cemetery. In the investigation, we will explore the historically important site of the Tabanan Palace that forms the geographical and symbolic focus of the ceremony and the route of the procession in the context of the cremation service with its community of participants/onlookers. The processions, and their related rituals, have long been recognised as an integral part of the civic life of the community, which is increasingly being jeopardised as a result of the impact of commercial use. The investigation asks if the preservation of these ceremonies can exist in harmony with these recent developments, without undermining the still vibrant traditional practices of Balinese society.

Keywords: Religious ceremonies, cremation ritual, Tabanan Palace

Introduction
Balinese society today is intimately connected to the long historical development of Hinduism in Bali which was first identified in the eighth century along with the visit to Bali of Rsi Markandya, a Brahmin Hindu saint from India (Wikarman, 1997: 14-6; Ardhana, 2002: 59-60). The Hindu religion has inspired people to live in organised and harmonious communities, backed up by their own laws and creeds. Traditional communities still exist within this social structure, which are of three types: desa pakraman, banjar, and sekehe. Desa pakraman denotes a village in which a local community is defined by a sacred and political space and governed by certain taboos, ritual protocols, and laws, whilst banjar refers to a social community/organisation within the village based on mutual needs especially in religious activities (Sutjaja, 2009: 37). Finally, sekehe denotes an organised group, possibly derived from one or more villages with a specific social function and distinct professional roles and responsibilities. Clifford Geertz (1980: 47-8) argues that these social
structures were clustered as non-political entities which were specifically focused on rituals, public life, kin groups, and voluntary initiatives. Whilst the civic and religious organisations of these groups are supported by laws and religious obligations, the essence of Balinese society is commitment to a symbiotic relationship to communal (civic/religious) participation. This attitude has historically developed from three basic principles of Hindu philosophy, called *tri hita karana*. This threefold principle advocates that serenity and happiness results from harmonious relationships between individuals and the gods, between humans, as well as between humans and their surroundings. The root of *tri hita karana* can be found in the Hindu scriptures: the *Bhagavad Gita*,¹ states:

- Article 10: When he created creatures in the beginning, along with the sacrifice, Prajapati said: ‘May you be fruitful by this sacrifice, let this be the cow which produces all you desire.
- Article 11: ‘You should nourish the gods with this so that the gods may nourish you; nourishing each other, you shall achieve the highest good.
- Article 12: ‘For nourished by the sacrifice, the gods will give you the pleasures you desire. ‘The man who enjoys these gifts without repaying them is no more than a thief.’

These three basic principles of social organisation influence Balinese religious activities. The participation of family members in banjar, desa pakraman, or the majority of desa pakraman really depends on the level of ritual activity. Various rituals can be broadly categorised under three main conditions; the divine, the human and the environment. The essence of rituals in Balinese society is similar to Hindu rituals in other regions of Asia such India and Sri Lanka; differences arise however in the implementation, setting and contexts which are influenced by culture, traditions and customs. In addition to these differences, the Balinese have specific and unique ritual practices, in which processions are an integral part of religious festivals, supported by both banjar and desa pakraman. One of these rituals is the cremation ceremony. According to Hindu philosophy, death entails the release of the soul from the body, in which the body will disappear whilst the soul will stay in the spirit world awaiting the next life through reincarnation.² But in the Balinese tradition, death signals the beginning of the life cycle in which it is based on most anthropological descriptions (Lansing, 1995: 32). A cremation in Balinese language is called “pelebon” or “ngaben” (pelebon=cremation, ngaben=great effort). The ceremony in Balinese society in part constitutes a form of domestic ritual overseen by the family of the deceased, which carries great responsibility. Indeed, it may be said that this ceremony is owned and practised by the Balinese family members.

¹ See the Bhagavad Gita (III. 10-12) translated by Johnson (1994: 15-6).
² The *Wrhaspati Tattwa*, article 52, states that ‘dead’ is the release of the soul from the body in which the body will be disappeared, on the other hand the soul will still be there in the world awaiting the next life cycle into reincarnation.
Cremation is also a great public event, a distinctive ritual procession in which the soul of the deceased is expected to return to the creator through ritual acts. This culminates in the corpse being burnt, in a way that returns it to the original source from which it came. According to Balinese Hindu belief, the origins of the body derive from five main substances, or elements; ether/akasa, light/teja, air/bayu, water/apah and soil/pertiwi called panca maha bhuta. The purpose of the cremation ritual is to return all substances that constitute the human being to the universe or its creator. Besides paying full respect and thankfulness to the creator, this ceremony is also part of an ancestral homage, in which there is life after death, forged by an intimate relationship between the ancestors and descendants as mentioned in the scriptures of Manawa Dharma Sastra. If the ancestors have achieved the heavenly world, they will not abandon their descendants in this world, and therefore will maintain their health and prosperity. On the other hand, the reverse is also possible; descendants may have bad experiences in their lives, as a result of their ancestors being poorly located in the universe. For this reason, the family of the deceased must prepare the rituals of the cremation ‘with great effort’, in order to achieve the best outcome for the soul of the deceased as well as their family.

In the cremation procession, the body of the deceased is placed in a casket and then is placed in a deceased building, called bade/ wadah, which is sited in an auspicious location (Suastika, 2008). The form of bade/ wadah varies depending on the family’s ancestry and decorated with distinctive ornaments that give the site its shrine status. The timing of the procession can be determined in two ways; firstly, the family of the deceased can arrange a cremation ceremony by requesting a date for the ceremony from the Hindu priest; secondly, the family can choose to bury the body initially, and then after some time the body is exhumed and the cremation held as the next stage. However, the auspicious day of all ritual processions is ultimately determined by the Hindu priest, since he will lead the rituals and will be responsible for addressing both good and bad omens through offerings made during a special ceremony. The symbolic meaning of this ceremony is based on the scripture of Pamarissudha Alaning Dewasa. The priest offers several dates as options for holding the ceremony, responding appropriately to the family’s time and financial circumstances. The length of time normally requires completing all ritual acts in the ceremony within three weeks, but may in certain circumstances be up to three months.

As the case study for this investigation, Tabanan is a town located in the southern part of Bali and is the capital of the Tabanan Regency (Figure 1). The town has a long history which is closely related to the royal palace of Tabanan. The first royal palace was built in 1352 in the village of Buahan, and then moved further south-west to Tabanan, later serving as the new royal palace (Tabanan kingdom). From this complex of buildings developed a flourishing village. Throughout its history, the Tabanan has formed an integral part of the

---

3 The scripture of Manawa Dharma Sastra (III.82) stipulates that that cremation ritual is a form of respect and thankfulness to the ancestors since we are in the world because of them, see Pudja (1983:78).
4 The scripture of Pamarissudha Alaning Dewasa regulates about kinds of ritual to solve any bad omens during a special ceremony, see Anom (2002:46).
original site of the palace and the territory of the royal household. Today, remnants of the original village can still be seen within an enclave of an expanded Tabanan town. The village comprises 23 banjar/social communities, with around 30,000 inhabitants (Bappeda, 2006). The inhabitants have a large cemetery to facilitate their cremation rituals, located at the southeast of the central area. This area is approximately 35,000 square metres in area, making it one of the largest cemeteries in Bali. Even though the cemetery was relocated following the period of Dutch colonialism, the ceremony follows essentially the same route and adheres to the same ritual protocols. The only variation to the route is an additional 200 metres that extends to the more elevated relocation of the cemetery which is more demanding for the bearers.

We will explore the historically important site of the Tabanan palace that forms the geographical and symbolic focus of the ceremony, and the route of the procession in the context of the cremation service and its community of participants/onlookers. The processions and their related rituals have long been recognised as an integral part of the civic life of the community, which is increasingly being threatened by the impact of the changes of land ownership and the adoption of western models of commercialisation. Hence, the investigation asks if the preservation of this ceremony can exist in harmony with this ‘modernisation’, without the latter undermining the still vibrant traditional practices of Balinese society.

The site of the Tabanan palace as the geographical focus of the ceremony

The history of the Tabanan palace starts with the invasion of Bali by the Majapahit empire in 1343. After the invasion, Sira Arya Kenceng, one of the troop leaders (ksatryan), remained in Bali and built his royal palace in Buahan village as a part of Tabanan region (Darta et.al. 1996: 12-6). He had two sons, Sri Megada Prabu (Dewa Raka) and Sri Megada Natha (Dewa Made), both of whom continued this royal dynasty, whilst two other sons (by another wife) made their royal residence elsewhere in Badung. After Sira Arya Kenceng passed away, the younger brother (Sri Megada Natha) succeeded his father as the second King of Tabanan (the older son did not want to be the King). According to legend, Sri Megada Natha heard a voice which told him to move and build a new palace in a certain place, signalled by the release of lightning in the middle of the night. He found that place and then built a new palace located approximately 4 km to the southwest from the original site. However, Sri Megada Natha did not reside in this palace, but instead became a hermit and lived in isolation. The oldest son of the king (Sira Arya Ngurah Langwang) then became the third King in the new palace with the appropriate title of Sira Arya Ngurah Tabanan, the name given to the palace in the fifteenth century (Anonymous, 1960; Darta et.al. 1996: 16).

After becoming king, Sira Arya Ngurah devised a state structure which consisted of king/raja, spiritual adviser/purohito or brahmana, prime ministry/werdha mentri, head of defence/mahapatih, generals/patih, treasury officer/manca, and head of village/prebekel. The persons, who held these positions, commonly had family relationships with the king/raja, except the village head (Arnita et.al, 1997, 15-6; Geertz, 1980:57-9). From historical investigations, it is clear that the titles conferred on each member also constituted key elements of the political system (Table 1). But, in time, there was a modification of the state structure, when two kings ruled the dynasty of Tabanan (the first and second king/raja pemade); the southern territory was under the first king/Puri Gde, whilst the northern part was under the second king/Puri Kaleran, located only about 100 metres from the northern side of Puri Gde.6

Figure 1: The Initial State Structure: Name of Position and Household

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>No</th>
<th>Name of position</th>
<th>Name of living</th>
<th>State structure</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>King/Raja</td>
<td>Puri Gde</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>Spiritual Advisor/ Purohito</td>
<td>Grya/Dalem</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>Prime Ministry/Werdha Menteri</td>
<td>Puri</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>Head of Defence/Mahapatih</td>
<td>Jro Gde</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5</td>
<td>Generals/Pathih</td>
<td>Jro</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6</td>
<td>Treasury Officer/Manca</td>
<td>Jro</td>
<td>6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7</td>
<td>Head of Village/Perbekel/Mekel</td>
<td>Umah</td>
<td>7</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

As mentioned above, the site selection of Tabanan palace and royal households was foretold by a lightning strike, believing that the lightning originated from a deep well located in a small temple called Pusar Tasik. This temple was eventually incorporated into the Tabanan royal household complex. The selection of this site by supernatural means reiterates Joseph Rykwert’s argument about the role of founders of settlements in antiquity, in which the selection of a suitable site was determined first and foremost by mythical signs rather than by considerations of economic benefit, fertility of land or defence purposes (Rykwert, 1976: 33). Nevertheless, in the case of the Tabanan royal palace, the location had several practical advantages (relating to defence and fertile terrain), since it is bounded by two rivers to the east and west, and is located at the highest point. Though this region has high levels of humidity, with the dominant east-west winds, outdoor thermal comfort can be ensured since vegetation along the rivers is able to mitigate the high levels of humidity. These factors remind one of Aristotle’s four recommendations when choosing a suitable site for settlement; sloping terrain, healthy ambiance, east facing, and good for supporting civil

---

6 Deep interview with I Gusti Ngurah Agung is one of Tabanan nobles on 17th July 2013
and military activities. These criteria are further echoed by Vitruvius who proclaimed that a ‘healthy’ site (on account of orientation and prevailing winds) should be the first recommendation.

The initial arrangement of terrain of the Tabanan royal palace was in the form of a ‘cross pattern’, based on a motif that was synonymous with royalty in the Majapahit era, called catuspatha. The word derives from Sanskrit meaning that four main directions define the centre of a territory (Putra, 2005:61). According to this principle, the cross pattern gave rise to four zones that are utilised in the layout of the palace, temple, market and adjacent open space, whilst the intersection of the cross becomes an essential location for ritual activity. Significantly, the four zones in the cross pattern arrangement derive from a nine zone concept familiarly known as the ‘sanga mandala’ (sanga=nine, mandala=within a defined space), in which the zones refer to the nine wind directions called nawa sanga (Gelebet, 1982). The zone of the Tabanan palace, in the south-west quadrant of the cruciform layout, is however different, since other royal palaces in Bali are typically located in the north-east quadrant (Figure 2 & 3).

The central royal territory of the Tabanan is bounded by two rivers, at the east and west ends. The rivers are named Tukad Dikis and Tukad Empas, both of which may have served defensive purposes. The king’s palace is surrounded by a series of allied houses associated with the king’s families that collectively formed part of the state ceremonial structure. The cemetery, which served as an important facility for the state, is also located in this area on the west side of the river (Geertz, 1980: 56). The royal household of Tabanan, and its allied properties in the centre of the Tabanan village, can be seen in the schematic plan below (Figure 4). From this image, it seems that the north-south axis in front of Puri Gde and Kaleran is the main access to accommodate ritual activities in which this axis passes through three processional junctions (one is located between the palaces and two junctions are outer side of the palaces) that originally framed the Tabanan palace complex. Though using a different history and time period, this layout has some similarities with the village of Marzabotto in the province of Bologna, Italy, an example Roman era site dating back to the beginning of the sixth century (Rykwert, 1976:80).

Furthermore, the initial site of the Tabanan palace is approximately 4 hectares, and consists of 33 zones. This is substantially more than most other royal palaces in Bali which commonly consist of between 9 and 21 zones. For instance, Puri Kaleran, the second king of Tabanan, controlled only 9 zones. Hence, the Tabanan royal palace is one of the biggest palaces in Bali (Figure 5).


site, appropriately adorned with embellishments in accordance with the traditions of Balinese traditional architecture. The bayan tree referred to earlier is located at the north side of the Palace, and in front of the Puseh Temple and serving as a key stopping point in the ritual itinerary of the ancient ceremony. As Mircea Eliade (1959: 12) states, the adornment of trees gives their sacred status and their worship reinforces their hierophany (holy quality). This hierophany, moreover, reveals in the tree an order of reality that is wholly different from the “natural”.

Unfortunately, the Puri Gde, the central part of the royal residence, was partly destroyed in 1906 and became a ruin when the Dutch colonisers defeated the king of Badung and Tabanan. It was eventually demolished by the Dutch, during a revolt after the initial defeat. The images (figures 6 & 7) taken in 1906 show the Dutch troops in front of the Tabanan palace and the partly destroyed palace’s wall is on the north side. Hence, under Dutch colonial rule, the central power of the king practically disappeared, and the palace, as a centre of spiritual, culture, economic and politic life, significantly declined. In this era, one of the royal family houses, located at the northern side of the palace, was extended to the south by incorporating the main access to the Tabanan palace, thereby closing one direction of the cross pattern. This resulted in a significant change from the initial route of ritual processions in the centre of the village. During this period, the Dutch also built a bridge to connect the west and east sides of the river. Because of this strategically important connection, the cemetery on the east side of the river (previously owned by the former Malkangin kingdom), became the main cemetery for the Tabanan village. Indeed, the Dalem temple and its cemetery have served the Tabanan village inhabitants for centuries, especially the Balinese Hindu.

After the period of colonialism, the areas controlled by the Dutch came under local government ownership. What was left of the palace changed dramatically, since most of the area had changed to public and commercial use, such as shops, government offices, a town garden, and public access. The remaining area of Puri Gde in the Tabanan royal household is only approximately one fifth of the original total area that was settled by the royal family. The house of the king’s priest was relocated to the north, about 500 meters from its original location. In contrast, the Puri Kaleran (the palace of the second king) still remains relatively intact, although several building changes have occurred over time. Today, the historic site of the royal palace forms part of the central area of Tabanan town, whilst the former cemetery on the west side of the river has become a local government office and electricity service facility. Besides the relocation of the cemetery and street intersection, the physical changes to the Tabanan royal palace, and its surroundings, have significantly impacted on the ritual setting and its urban contexts. The changes in land use of the royal household, after colonialism, can be seen in figure 8 below.

These changes in ritual setting, and their urban contexts, have also taken place as a result of other developments in the town itself. Reconstruction of temples, for instance, has led to changes in the form and performance of rituals, whilst rivers and wellsprings, as the source of body purification, have also been altered as a result of river bank developments. Recently, the local government prohibited the disposal of body ash and ritual waste into rivers, thereby necessitating disposal exclusively by sea. At the same time, the bayan tree is traditionally a key part of the cremation ritual, planted as long ago as the fifteenth century as part of the sacred landscape of the royal palace in Tabanan town. Besides the existence of the bayan tree, the village temples still serve the community with several renewals in the use of building materials due to life of the buildings, weathering, and other factors (Figure 9).

In regard to ritual festivals, relating to the cremation ceremony, there are several important sites associated with the ceremony that have their roots in ancient forms of philosophical ethics that form part of their religious beliefs. These places serve as key locations in the ritual itinerary, as follows:

1) The village temples (the places to take holy water for purification of the deceased);
2) The street intersection of the village (the route of ritual procession);
3) The Hindu priest’s temple (the place where holy water for purification is used);
4) The wellspring (for purification of the corpse and related ritual equipment);
5) The cemetery (the area of cremation);
6) Sacred bayan tree (bayan’s leaf for ritual after the cremation ritual); and
7) The rivers (for transporting the ash after the cremation to the sea as an option to the offering ceremony).

The levels of intensity, among the important places highlighted above, can partly be determined by the number of rituals occurring in the places of Tabanan village (Figure 10). The village temples (Dalem, Puseh & Bale Agung temple) and the priest’s temple have high levels of activity, since the ritual of collecting holy water for purification takes place before, during and after the cremation. At the wellspring, rituals take place before and during the cremation ceremony, whilst at the cemetery, the street intersection and the sacred bayan Tree, the ritual only takes place once; the day or so after the cremation. The rivers, on the other hand, could not be used anymore after the prohibition refereed to earlier, resulting in the community of mourners using the sea as a medium for transporting the ashes of the deceased. The location of the coast from the cemetery is approximately 9 km to the southwest. Significantly, the banning of the use of rivers by local government did not provoke resentment, on the part of the local communities, since there was general recognition of the urgent need to avoid polluting the rivers and preserving their environmental balance.

The route of the procession in the context of the cremation service

The uniqueness of the cremation ceremony, in relation to the historically important site of the Tabanan palace and its larger geographical location and symbolic importance, persists
The vibrant religious festivals of the cremation ceremony continue to give communal identity and continuity. These and other festival events typically derive from the families of the king and the priest, whose social status ensured the continuation of the ‘ancestral line’. We can see how the relation of the rituals to the route of the procession and its social/cultural purpose are defined by the three stages of the procession: pre-cremation, cremation ceremony and the post cremation ceremony. These rituals, which take place in the Tabanan area, are a special case in point on the basis of their dependency on the presence of royal and priestly families. This can be summarised as follows:

**Pre-cremation day**

At this first stage, there are two main rituals that take place in the dwelling of the deceased, comprising the ritual bathing of the deceased’s body called melelet, and the purification and cremation preparations called Mereresik. Both rituals require holy water from the village temples, the priest’s temple and the wellspring. The involvement of the banjar community to participate in this ritual typically commences on the day after melelet. Meanwhile, mereresik, as the day before the cremation ceremony, could be construed as an independent ritual event which takes place in the house of the deceased as well as outside, from early morning to the middle of the night. Moreover, the routes of the procession for the Mereresik ritual can be described as follows:

- In the morning, members of the family and the banjar community have to collect holy water from different places. The first place to collect the holy water is at the wellspring, and then it is carried to the priest and the village temple respectively. In the course of the procession the holy water is paraded in the streets and concludes with a performance by the traditional orchestra of angklung and gong.
- The second parade takes place in the afternoon to collect the holy water at the wellspring for the purification of the deceased (Figure 11&12).

After the second collection of water at the wellspring, another event takes place which is called Mamios. This event is a unique ritual not found in other places in Bali. It entails walking around the inner enclave of the town, parading ritual ‘equipment’ such as; Saji (small offering with rolled pork), purification tools, bandrang (a complete javelin and umbrella), a miniature of the corpse tower, etc. followed by Baris Dapdap (ritual dancers), Ratu Gde Tanah Pegat (as a demon to protect the ritual), angklung and gong (traditional orchestras). This only occurs in the presence of the king and the priest’s family. It indicates that the ancient culture and customs of the royal household still persist. The main purpose of this tradition is to announce to the families and society in generally, that the cremation ceremony will take place the following day.

**Cremation day**

On the final day, the ritual does not occur in just one place (i.e. the cemetery), but takes place across a number of locations, as highlighted in the following sequences of events:
The route of the procession begins by collecting holy water for the final purification at the same places and the using the same formation of the parade as the previous ritual.

After the final purification at a pavilion, the body of the deceased, which is placed in the casket, is ceremoniously left in a tall structure, called bade or wadah. This structure is then carried by family members and the banjar community to the cemetery. The formation of the parade is headed by the traditional orchestra of Angklung, followed by the ritual equipments and special offerings, trajang/stair, lembu/singa/petulangan (a giant in the form of bull/lion used as the sarcophagus for cremating the corpse of nobility), bade/tower and the traditional orchestra of gong serve as the last row of the parade formation. The route of the procession goes through the street intersection to the cemetery as the final ground of the cremation ceremony. At the main street intersection and nearby funeral ground, the three building structures (trajang, lembu/singa, and bade) are circumnavigated three times in opposite directions, as a symbol of the funerary ritual (Figure 13&14).

After finishing this parade to the cemetery, the sarcophagus is then placed in the funeral ground; the bull’s backbone is opened and the sarcophagus is removed and placed in the burning procession. After the burning ceremony, the remaining ash is then blessed and placed in an urn (a yellow coconut), and wrapped finally with white cloth, called a bukur. This cloth is carried by family members to the coast and delivered into the sea, a ritual undertaking called nyukat/nganyud. As members now use private cars, to travel to the coast, there is no longer a parade by road as existed in the past.

Post cremation day

The post-cremation stage does not entail a reduction in ritual activity: indeed, parades still take place to designated locations. But there are different options for the deceased’s family to arrange these rituals which depend, in the main, on their personal preferences. In some cases, the family can choose to perform a continuous ritual event, which normally takes a whole day to complete. The royal family of Tabanan usually choose the 11th and 12th days after the cremation for offering the post cremation rituals, though they are also required to perform smaller rituals on the 3rd and 5th days after cremation. In regard to the route of the procession, those rituals on the 11th and 12th days entail the following:

- The ritual of removing the leaves from the bayan tree (ngalap don bingin) takes place on the 11th day. The bayan tree is a symbol of condescendence, in which the soul is expected to obtain protection from the new world, and the ancestors are able to give ‘condescendence’ to their descendant. In this ritual, a parade is held on the road to the Bayan tree, accompanied by the traditional orchestra of gong. The bayan leaf is used in relation to the next day ceremony, called ngerorasin (ngerorasin
means ritual of the 12th day). Other names of this ritual include mamukur, nyekah, or ngelanus (Suastika, 2008:38).

The ritual ceremony then returns to the sea in order to call back the soul from the dead, through offerings to the goddess of the sea. The soul, is then brought back and symbolically placed in the family temple which is in a specific shrine called rong tiga (containing three spaces; the right side for the men, the women at the left side, and the centre space as the inner ‘sanctum’ of the divine (from where immortal originate). As was the previous case, the procession to the coast is undertaken by private car; a short parade then takes place after the family members park their cars and ‘process’ to the sea.

From the various rituals mentioned above, there are several routes of the procession which have been carried out by family members of the deceased to symbolically important places. In spite of significant physical changes to the area, as a result of tourism et cetera, the routes of the procession reveal only minor changes over time, with the relocation of the residence of the royal priest to the north from the initial Tabanan royal palace. In addition, the Dalem Temple and its cemetery were relocated further east. The imposition of a one way system at the street intersection, however, may have had a significant impact on the essence of the historical rite. With a new intersection located near the initial site, the sacred nuance may be slightly different. However, some royal family members still use the historic intersection as the route of the procession, whilst other members do not. As a consequence, the routes of the procession have become longer with different paths introduced toward the cemetery (Figure 15).

From the route of the procession it can be recorded that the three main access points from Tabanan town have become the busiest routes for cremation ceremonies which pass along Gunung Agung, Pahlawan, and Gajah Mada Street. Even though Tabanan inhabitants have a different method for collecting holy water, when compared to royal members or the king’s priest family, they follow the same direction towards the village temples. Since the location of the sacred bayan tree is in front of Puseh and Bale Agung temple, this area is one of intensive ritual activity when the cremation ceremonies take place. The concentration of people, in relation to the route of the procession, is apparent both before and after the cremation. Another interesting aspect of this area is that the locations of the temple and tree have not changed from the beginning, serving as enduring evidence of the historically important role of the palace and temple in the life of the town.

Even though the ancient Tabanan village has become the centre of the expanded town, most routes of the religious cremation festival still have a dynamic relationship with the urban fabric which has persisted over time. Another important urban feature of these ceremonies is their relationship to the 23 banjar communities, highlighted at the beginning of this paper, which forms an integral part of the village community and the larger civic life.

11 The source of basic map is from Laporan RTRK. Tabanan Tahun 2006: p.III-6.
of the town. These communities further support the continuity of Balinese society, and form an essential component of the traditional community that sustains the meaning of every cremation ritual. The basic concept of the *banjar* community is *sukha-dukkha*, from Sanskrit meaning ‘pleasant-unpleasant’ (Monier-Williams & Cappeller, 1889: 483, 1220-21). The term conveys the respect and sympathy for each community even in difficult and challenging times. Without this, it is unlikely that the family of the deceased would be able to prepare the cremation ceremony and use the cemetery in a meaningful way.

From what I can ascertain there is no evidence of a conflict or friction in the use of the cemetery or other facilities in Tabanan village today. *Banjar* community members participate in the cremation rituals, and the onlookers are still eager to witness the route of the religious festival and cremation ritual processions, treating these as a part of their culture and life. The members still carry the tower/bade, sarcophagus and stair/trajang on their shoulders toward the cemetery, though in other places these ceremonial structures (the ‘ritual equipment’ I referred to earlier) are transported on wheel-bearing floats rather than being carried. Because of the extension of the Tabanan village area, the distance between the deceased place and the cemetery has increased by more than 1 km. The use of wheel-bearing floats for these parades in Tabanan helps the participants to more efficiently transport the sarcophagus, even though it may be less spectacular for the onlookers.

**The religious procession in relation to the civic life of the community**

The symbolic meanings of sacred arts, their ethical dimensions and the respect for nature, are basic principles for Balinese life in actualising their religion, culture and tradition. For instance, a festival procession to collect holy water in the place of a wellspring, the priest temple and the village temples for purification of the dead body, does not reveal the totality of the procession, but merely pays homage to the gods and the power of nature at these specific places. In addition, as I have already indicated, three traditional orchestras participate in the cremation rituals and festivals in Tabanan namely *angklung*, *gong* and *gambang*, whose names contain syllables that invoke sacred symbols.

As Bandem (1986) argues, every tone of Balinese traditional music has its own character and place, such as; *dang, ding, dung, deng, dong or ang, ing, ung, eng, ong* that relate to the cardinal directions; east, west, north, south, centre. The sacred Hinduism symbol of ‘*OM*’, or ‘*ONG*’, signifies the universe and is derived from three letters; *A, U, M* or *Ang, Ung, Mang* (in Bali). These letters also symbolise three worlds: mother, father, and heaven world, and the sounds emanating from the orchestras derive from the words *ang, ung, mang* and *ong*, each of which has symbolic connections to the deities Brahma, Vishnu, and Shiva (Bangli, 2005: 104. The *angklung* orchestra consists of two words; ‘*ang*’ and ‘*ung*’, meaning that this orchestra is only used for cremation and temple ceremonies. *Gong*, on the other hand, derives from ‘*ong*’, a word which is used in most kinds of rituals. *Gambang* contains ‘*mang*’ and is the orchestra that direct the soul to the heavenly realm which consists of five players, placed near the pavilion of the deceased. Bangli (2005: 114) also
argues that the purpose of these orchestras in the cremation ceremony is to direct the soul to the heavenly realm. Based on these symbols, only *angklung* and *gong* participate in the festival procession of the cremation, whereby *angklung* is in the front line and *gong* in the back.

The groups of the orchestras are called *sekehe*, professional groups who mostly come from the *banjar* community. If the cremation ritual takes place among the *banjar* themselves, then the *banjar* members do not perform in the orchestra, as they must be directly involved in the ritual and festival activities. As a result, the family of the deceased will be required to use groups from other places. Due to their laws, all families become members of *banjar* community, and males and females in one family must be involved in the cremation ritual from the initial purification rituals of the deceased to the final day of the cremation. This involvement is an essential part of the ‘*sukha-dukkha*’, to the dead and the living family. If members are absent from this ritual, they will get fines according to the law. In exceptional cases, *banjar* organisations, in a final meeting called ‘*sangkep banjar*’, can decide to evict one of members from their home and the community, if a family does not participate in the rituals of the ‘*sukha-dukkha*’. Though it seems harsh, it may be a strategy to secure a unity of the community. So far, there have been no cases of evicting a citizen in Tabanan for this misdemeanour.

As mentioned earlier, the eagerness to carry the tower/*bade* without using wheels might indicate that the *banjar* community members are still strong enough to handle the ritual cremation festivals as before. The involvement of the community in the festival procession emerged during the time of *mamios*, involving ritual walking around the inner Tabanan village carrying ritual equipments. This festival is mostly supported by the younger members, while the elders handle activities to construct temporary buildings for cremation and the priest worship (*Bale Pemasmian* and *Bale Pemujan*) at the cemetery. They work at the cemetery from morning to afternoon, organising the serving of refreshments and food which are provided by other members. On the final day of the cremation the young and the old (both female and male) come to the funeral ground of the deceased to fully support the ceremony that takes place from morning to afternoon. In the festival procession, the men carrying the tower/*bade* attempt to hold the load on their shoulders on the uphill slope of the route, whilst women carry the ritual equipment and ceremonial materials.

Recently, a major dilemma has confronted the *banjar* communities in Tabanan village, who not only carry the deceased’s *ceremonial structures*, but also must bear the increasing economic costs of the event. Even though Miguel Covarrubias and others have demonstrated clearly that the expenses of a cremation are enormous there is generally no regret or concern on the part of the Balinese, as they believe the cremation represents the accomplishment of the most sacred duty (Covarrubias, 1937:359-60).

Besides the enormous expenses, there is also consideration of time and labour in the preparation of these events; labour migrants from other islands who build their own houses,
places of worship and cemeteries have contributed to transforming the town during these occasions. There are now Muslim communities in Banjar Lod Rurung and Pasekan Delodan, located at the southern and northern part of the town centre. This transformation has also led to the development of new laws and a different sense of unity of the village and banjar community. For instance, banjar, as the lowest level local organisation, has faced some difficulties in implementing laws and regulations for new residents who have different religious beliefs and cultural backgrounds to follow the principles of ‘sukha-dukkha’, even in the ritual cremation activities. The different treatments of and particular laws relating to immigrants have resulted in some claims of a degradation of social unity. Intensive migration followed by changes of the law, setting and context of settlement, should be considered in parallel to the significant impacts of tourism development on the island.

Related to these pressures is the growing competition between Balinese and non-Balinese members of society in all aspects of life. Non-Balinese residents, particularly from other parts of Indonesia, have traditionally struggled to secure employment, which has given them greater motivation in an increasingly competitive job’s market. The Balinese, on the other hand, may not have the same level of incentive, partly a result of a different philosophy of life guided by Hindu beliefs. Today, Javanese and Lombok labourers have been harvesting rice in southern parts of Bali, whilst agricultural land has decreased rapidly due to reuse of land for tourist facilities and other commercial initiatives (Pringle, 2004:9).

Related to issues of economy, fines imposed by non-attendance to ceremonies and competition in the commercial market are other conflictual challenges faced by the Balinese community in achieving a balance between the increasingly strict time management in working environments and the need to conform to traditional religious practice. As government employees those Balinese involved in such ceremonies and festivals may have less resistance than residents employed in commercial organisations, since local government must be seen to respect the local culture and traditions. Indeed, there is growing evidence that private companies are increasingly resistant to allowing their staff to participate in such events, by providing more flexible shifts and periods of works. These challenges sometimes give rise to conflicts in the workplace, in regard to adhering and respecting ceremonial protocols and traditions. The situation is usually more problematic if the owner of a company is not Balinese and does not respect – or understand - the Balinese culture and way of life. As there are many ceremonies that traditionally take place in Bali, this can lead to a negative image of the society, in regard to what is perceive by some as unduly long holiday periods against the increasing priority on commitment to employment and commercial competitiveness. More specific to this investigation, such issues have a bearing on the nature and meaning of a civil society in Bali, and how traditional ceremonial practices can sustain a sense of the civic realm against a backdrop of encroaching commercialization.
Whilst Tabanan is not located close to Kuta and Sanur, the main centres of growth in tourism in Bali since the early 1970s, the regional government has introduced wider investment in the tourist sector of this area which is impacting on socio-cultural, economic, political, and environmental aspects of Bali as a whole. Indeed, the central government in Indonesia, in conjunction with regional governments, has identified the island of Bali as the main centre of tourism in the country. A number of corporations in tourism are playing a significant role in encouraging the government to continually develop tourist areas, without proper consideration of the needs of the local community. Land purchases and sales are inevitable and will continue, as well as the conversion of agricultural land for tourism and housing which has seen a major expansion in recent years.

Existing laws and regulations seem powerless to prevent such land conversion, largely due to abuse of power, corruption, vested interests and nepotism. According to the chairman of the Regional Subak Society of Bali the rate of conversion of rice fields to residential dwelling is approximately 750 hectares per year (Windia, 2009:9). Previously, the Tabanan region was well known as the rice barn of Bali, having the largest area of rice fields on the island, a situation that is under threat by rapid (unchecked) development. This also relates more specifically to the expansion of Tabanan town centre, which is now up to four times the size of its original area 100 years ago (Figure 16), further contributing to a significant decrease of rice fields in this area.

In recognition of these changes, the Balinese provincial government has attempted to protect religious areas through the implementation of the Regional Land Use Planning Policy (No. 16/2009). However, most of the regency governments have rejected this planning regulation, believing that it will not hinder further development of tourism in new areas. In any case, with the National Law (No. 32/2004), the regency governments have an authority to manage their territories without considering provincial regulations. This inconsistency in the formulation and implementation of planning policy in Bali is further exacerbating the problem of unchecked tourism and commercial development.

It is perhaps not surprising that religious ceremonies in Bali, such as the impressive cremation ceremonies examined in this paper, have become key spectacles in the tourism sector, and therefore contribute in a positive way to sustaining (and even enhancing) the tourist economy on the island. The challenge facing all stakeholders on the island is to ensure that the Balinese are able to continue to participate actively in the religious life of their community, and that such religious event, and the cremation ceremonies in particular, are protected and preserved for the benefit of future generations.

Conclusion

This article has investigated the traditional cremation ceremony in Bali as a significant and memorable event that continues to be performed during a period of significant change on

---

12 The figure is reproduced from the source of Bappeda, 2006).
the island in the era of globalisation. The investigation has focused on the historically important site of the Tabanan palace, which forms the geographic and symbolic focus of the ceremony, and constitutes a historically essential element in the civic and religious life of the community.

The ancestral relationship between the descendants of the Tabanan king, and other members in the banjar community, still exists as the main support for the cremation rituals. Participation in these rituals demands much time and manpower and the tradition is sufficiently strong to maintain a continuity of funeral practice, without any obvious internal conflict between participants and stakeholders. However, several external factors are beginning to have a negative impact on securing the future for these important public events, as highlighted below:

- The arrival of migrants from other islands in Indonesia, who become residents in the banjar, has created some tensions in the otherwise harmonious relationship among community members.
- The lack of proper employment laws means that taking time off work, to participate in these ceremonies, is becoming more difficult.
- Since openness and accessibility of land is a fundamental aspect of Balinese Hindu culture, the conversion of agriculture land to commercial use is leading to an unbalanced environment.
- Globalisation and the impact of modern lifestyles continue to impose new challenges on the culture and traditions of the Balinese people.

Though tourism has been the prime driver of economic growth in Bali, most tourist businesses are actually owned by non-Balinese. This fact has made it difficult to claim that tourism in general has empowered the Balinese, in terms of maintaining or enhancing their culture and traditions, as well as their environment. The government and other stakeholders, responsible for protecting and maintaining these vital assets of Bali, remain focused on enhancing government revenue through unchecked development of the tourism industry, without considering the carrying capacity of the island. The case of the cremation ceremony, and its role in Balinese society today, highlights the fragility of the situation, and the need to identity policies that will secure its survival as a lived tradition.

**Acknowledgement**
The majority of this article derives from a historical and empirical study. We would like to thank Tabanan Government for supporting additional documents. Also special thanks to the School of Art, Design and Architecture, and School of Human, and Health Sciences at University of Huddersfield for their Writing Retreat Workshop Programme to encourage the completion of this article, as well as the Directorate of High Education of Indonesia Republic for their support.
Reference


Undang-Undang Republik Indonesia No. 32/2004 tentang Pemerintahan Daerah (Jakarta: Pemerintah Pusat, 2004), article 3, 10.


Re-inventing Tabloid Journalism in Indonesia
Diyah Hayu Rahmitasari

**Biodata:** Diyah Hayu Rahmitasari is a junior lecturer at the Department of Communications, Universitas Atma Jaya Yogyakarta, Indonesia. She holds a master degree in Mass Communications from Edith Cowan University, Australia. Her research interests are in journalism production, media use, media engagement, and social media participation. She can be contacted at dhrahmitasari@gmail.com

**Abstract**
Tabloid journalism is a contentious phenomenon that has provoked debate in many countries, including Indonesia. The main accusation levelled at this genre of journalism is sensationalism. However, tabloid journalism actually offers new perspectives by catering to the taste of the ‘untouched’ readers previously ignored by mainstream newspapers. This article describes the phenomenon of tabloid journalism in Indonesia through an analysis of the two highest circulating Indonesian tabloid newspapers, *Pos Kota* and *Lampu Hijau*. It is based on a combination of quantitative content analysis and qualitative email interviews (conducted in 2011-2012) as its research methods. The main goals of this research are to reinvent the characteristics of tabloid journalism in Indonesia as exemplified by *Pos Kota* and *Lampu Hijau*, as well as to discover the role these papers play in the development of Indonesian journalism.

**Keywords:** Indonesia, Lampu Hijau, Daily Newspaper, Pos Kota, Tabloid Journalism

**Introduction**
Tabloid journalism is a rapidly growing phenomenon around the world. In the United Kingdom, for example, tabloids are the most popular newspapers and hold the majority share of the total newspaper circulation (Johansson, 2007, p. 83). In addition, in South Africa, until quite recently, *The Daily Sun* was the leading newspaper with a circulation of around 500,000 copies per day (Wasserman, 2010, p. 1). The same situation can be found in Australia where tabloids such as *The Daily Telegraph* and *Herald Sun* are daily newspapers with the highest circulation (Janda, 2013). In Indonesia, the tabloid newspaper *Pos Kota* registers the highest sales figures (Yusuf, 2009, p. 26).

Despite their popularity, tabloid newspapers are often met with negative views from scholars and media practitioners due to their perceived low quality. Some people argue that tabloid newspapers lower the standard of democratic communication and exercise a negative influence on their readers (Johansson, 2007, p. 83). According to Kitch (2009), tabloid journalism often involves dramatization in order ‘to shock and provoke strong emotional responses among readers’ (p. 29), which is normally avoided by conventional journalists.
In contrast, there are those who praise tabloid journalism for its readability and affordability. According to Conboy (2002, p. 44), tabloid journalism is becoming acceptable, compared to other kinds of journalism, because it offers lighter issues that are easier to read and accessible to sections of the population who, due to increasing literacy in developing countries, are first-time newspaper readers. Furthermore, tabloid journalism addresses problems of the common people, as distinct from the wealthy. It meets the information needs of people in lower socioeconomic groups and creates an opportunity for them to understand current affairs. As Kavanagh (2011) argues, ‘We turn complex subjects (politics, commerce, war) into crisp easily understood copy’ (p. 27). Thus, tabloid newspapers extend the scope of newspapers’ readers.

In addition to differences of perspective on the value of tabloid journalism, there are also different views about the definition of a ‘tabloid’. According to Bessie (as cited in Franklin, Hamer, Hanna, Kinsey & Richardson, 2005, p. 279) tabloids are defined by their focus on sensational and emotional content. Bird (as cited in Wasserman, 2010, p. 14) says that tabloid journalism is well known for its distinctive content. Distinctive, according to Bird (as cited in Wasserman, 2010, p.14) refers to ‘the human-interest, graphically told story, heavy on pictures and short, pithy, highly stereotyped prose.’ Similarly, Fox, Van Sickel and Steiger (2007) argue that ‘the so-called Yellow Journalism, pulp magazines, and “muckraking” investigative reports of the early twentieth century can be considered examples’ (p. 2) of tabloid journalism. However, according to some definitions ‘tabloid’ can also refer to the format or period of the publication (Wasserman, 2010, p. 14).

Tabloid journalism is perceived differently in different countries. In Britain, with a well-known case of the phone hacking scandal (see Barnett, 2012), tabloid journalism is often perceived as something untrustworthy and unethical. By contrast, in South Africa, tabloid journalism has a more positive meaning for readers since it ‘articulates an experience of daily life in post-apartheid South Africa … which remains precarious, dangerous, difficult and uncertain’ (Wasserman, 2010, p. xi). Media content and formats are definitely ‘shaped by cultural, political and market forces’ (Wasserman, 2010, p. 2). Therefore, more comprehensive localized studies about tabloid journalism are needed to better understand the tabloid journalism phenomenon.

Characteristics of the newspapers studied

*Pos Kota*

*Pos Kota* was established on 15 April 1970 and was the first tabloid newspaper in Indonesia. It was the pioneer of tabloid style newspapers in the country. *Pos Kota*, with its tagline ‘Harian Independen’, literally means ‘independent daily newspaper’, had the goal of providing a different style of newspaper to the major newspapers of the time, which tended to focus on national political news. By contrast, *Pos Kota* focused on local issues, crime,
According to Soebekti (as cited in Ghazali & Nasution, 2000, p. 6), Pos Kota sought to serve and educate the urban workers in Jakarta and its surrounds. Pos Kota tried to address the needs of that particular social stratum by providing information perceived to be of interest to them. The first edition was published after Harmoko, the then editor-in-chief at that time, conducted research in Glodok, Jatinegara, Tanah Abang and Senen—the areas in which most of the city’s urban workers lived, worked and shopped in and around Jakarta. Based on that research into a potential new market, he published the first edition of Pos Kota (Ghazali & Nasution, 2000, p. 8).

For its very first edition in 1970, Pos Kota printed 3,500 copies. Circulation increased quickly and the newspaper was printing 30,000 to 60,000 copies in a matter of months (Soebekti, 2000, p. 8). In 2010-2012, the circulation of Pos Kota ranged from 500,000 to 600,000 copies per day (Litbang Grup Pos Kota, 2011).

As Pos Kota is a Jakarta-based newspaper, its primary aim is to cover issues that are happening in Jakarta. This is why the paper has the logo of the National Monument ‘Monas’ (which stands outside the presidential palace) logo -- the symbol of Jakarta -- on its masthead. This logo is located inside the letter ‘O’ in the word ‘KOTA’. However, the newspaper is also distributed to areas that surround Jakarta, and even to areas outside Java. The Pos Kota area of distribution is usually called ‘Jabodetabek’, which is an abbreviation of Jakarta, Bogor, Depok, Tangerang and Bekasi. Jakarta is the capital city of Indonesia. Bogor, Depok, Tangerang and Bekasi are the commuter belts around Jakarta that play an important role in the life of the city. Most people who work in Jakarta live in these areas. Thus, issues occurring in Jakarta have significance to people who live in these cities, and vice versa.

Most Pos Kota readers are men with ages ranging from 30 to 49 years of age. However, women also read Pos Kota. In 2010, the Nielsen Media Index revealed that there were at least 209,000 women reading Pos Kota spanning teenagers, career women or women who were based at home (Litbang Grup Pos Kota, 2011). The paper also has a space for children in one of the sections, Pos Bocah (‘Toddler’s Post’), which is published every Sunday. In addition, Pos Kota has begun to cover national issues in order to attract skilled urban professional workers, such as office workers and public servants, who have slightly higher incomes. Pos Kota claims that the paper has become a daily necessity for this particular group (Litbang Grup Pos Kota, 2011). The Nielsen Media Index shows that 63% of Pos Kota readers have a regular income of Rp. 2,000,000 per month (approximately AUD$210) (as cited in Litbang Grup Pos Kota, 2011).

As a tabloid newspaper, Pos Kota has some typical features: strong visuals, catchy, informal and easy to read copy, local news focusing on crimes, scandals and sensations,
space allocation for advertisements, providing space for the public and communities, and general life guidance as described below.

**Strong visuals**

*Pos Kota* uses big and colourful headlines. These are sometimes red and at other times green, yellow or pink. They are accompanied by engaging pictures or cartoons and a combination of font that is in upper case, italicised and underlined.

![Figure 1. Some *Pos Kota* editions from December 2011 and January 2012.](image)

**Catchy, informal and easy to read copy**

*Pos Kota* uses vernacular language in most of its headlines; thus, it is catchy and stimulates people to read further. *Pos Kota* also uses informal and simple diction for its news, which makes the stories easy to read and understandable. For example, one of its headlines in the edition of 24 December 2011 edition was very straightforward and sensational: ‘A 4 months pregnant widow has died after being slaughtered by her new boyfriend’ [translation is by the author]. In addition, *Pos Kota* uses a ‘sneak peek’ style in that the story is begun on the cover and continued on another page.

**Local news focusing on crimes, scandals and sensations**

The focus of *Pos Kota* is on crime, scandals and sensational issues. In its first year, the paper extensively reported on Cut Zahara Fona, who stated that the baby in her womb could speak and pray (Wirosardjono, 2000, p. 63). Although it was discovered that Cut Zahara Fona had lied to people by hiding a tape-recorder under her clothes, this contributed to a rapid increase in *Pos Kota*’s circulation. *Pos Kota* even admitted that they knew it was a hoax, but chose to continue presenting the story because it was marketable (Wirosardjono, 2000, p. 62). While the paper does report on political and social issues, it mostly chooses scandal and sensation as its focus.
Some sections in Pos Kota specifically provide space for the police department, such as the Question and Answer and Polmas sections. This demonstrates that criminal activity has significant news value for Pos Kota. In terms of page allocation, crime news is ranked first, followed by local news, national news, celebrity news and advertisements. Crime news is always located on the most accessible pages: pages one, two and three.

When analysed quantitatively based on section allocation, local news ranks in first position, with 36%, which means that 11 of 31 sections in Pos Kota are allocated to local news. Sections about crimes and human interest share the same allocation, with 13% each. This shows that news about crime does not actually dominate the paper’s space. The analysis of the front pages of Pos Kota shows that 42% of the copy is devoted to local issues.

The importance the paper places on local news is much higher than other categories, such as crime, sport, national politics or celebrity news; this is further evidenced by Pos Kota’s stated commitment to be a local newspaper for Jakarta and its surrounds.

Space allocation for advertisements

Since its establishment, Pos Kota has been committed to serving the local people in Jakarta and its surrounds (Ghazali & Nasution, 2000, p. 2). According to data from Litbang Grup Pos Kota (2011), one of the attempts to serve local people is by providing more space for advertisements over editorial copy space. In 2011-2012, the space allocated to advertisements in Pos Kota was higher than that allocated to editorial content—59% of Pos Kota’s space on Saturdays was devoted to advertisements and 41% to editorial copy.

The advertisements in Pos Kota can be divided into two categories: public service and private. The public service advertisements mostly focus on announcements to avoid crime—similar to Crime Stoppers in Australia—while the private advertisements include regular classified and display classified. The advertisements can also be differentiated into goods and service advertisements and job vacancies. Most of the goods and service advertisements contain advertisements about properties, cars, motorcycles, and medicines to overcome sexual problems, while the job vacancy section contains vacancies for unskilled workers, such as drivers, bricklayers and cleaners.

Providing space for the public and communities

Realizing that people use newspapers for many reasons and with different motives, Pos Kota gives space for ordinary people to be in the paper. Anyone can invite a journalist from Pos Kota to write a story about local social activities. Indeed, the main formula of Pos Kota is ‘local news’, ‘local people’ and ‘local events’ (Wibisono, 2000, p. 161).

The sections of Kavling Warga (‘Family Tales’), Komunitas (‘Community’) and Koran RT/RW (‘Local District/Council Paper’) are specifically allocated for Pos Kota readers who want to be included in the paper. Social activities, such as charities or community services, can be reported in Pos Kota. This is one reason that readers have a strong engagement with
the paper because *Pos Kota* is one of the few newspapers that publishes such news. There is also special section called *SMS Andai Anda* (‘If only I were texts’), which contains text messages from readers who express their feelings and write comments about recent issues.

*General life guidance*

In addition to giving a space to the public and community, *Pos Kota* also gives some general guidance about daily life, such as dealing with crime, sexual problems and other health issues. There is also a section called *Rohani* that focuses on religious matters. This is an important section for some readers because it offers advice on how to be a good person and how to deal with crimes in an Islamic manner.

*Lampu Hijau*

*Lampu Hijau* (‘Green Light’) is the second, most well known tabloid newspaper in Indonesia. It was first published on 23 November 2001 by PT Cahaya Rakyat Merdeka and was previously called *Lampu Merah* (‘Red Light’). On 18 October 2008, the name was changed to *Lampu Hijau* (‘Green Light’), which was supposed to create a ‘cooler’ image, since the name *Lampu Merah* tended to be perceived as synonymous with crime and sex stories (Interview with the editor-in-chief of *Lampu Hijau*, 25 December 2011). The logo is located between the two words in the masthead. *Lampu Hijau* has the tagline ‘Love, Pren, Piss’, which translated into English means ‘Love, Friendship and Peace’. Nowadays, its readers call it *Lamjo*, which is the abbreviation of *Lampu Hijau*.

![Figure 2. An example of *Lampu Hijau*’s front page.](image)

According to its editor-in-chief, *Lampu Hijau* was established to present comprehensive news about crime to readers in the Jakarta, Bogor, Depok, Tangerang and Bekasi areas. Unlike *Pos Kota*, *Lampu Hijau* emphasises crime issues not local issues. In addition, *Lampu Hijau* wanted to be close to the local communities in Jakarta and its
surrounds, and to bring peace and security to these communities by giving resident readers information on crime hot spots.

The daily circulation of *Lampu Hijau* in July 2011 was 50,000 copies. The highest circulation of 130,000 copies was reached between 2004 to 2006, when it was still using the name *Lampu Merah*. Although its circulation has dropped to an average of 50,000 copies since 2011, *Lampu Hijau* remains successful in terms of circulation and readership.

The area of distribution of *Lampu Hijau* includes Jakarta, Bogor, Depok, Bekasi, Tangerang, West Java (Karawang, Purwakarta, Bandung, Tasikmalaya, Garut, Banjar, Ciamis and Cirebon), Banten (Serang, Lebak, Cilegon and Pandeglang) and Lampung (Sumatra Island). *Lampu Hijau*’s target readers can be described as 19 to 45 years old and categorised as urban workers. The paper also specifically targets young communities (such as motor clubs and fan clubs). *Lampu Hijau* is a paper for low-income people, which is why it is sold at a low price—Rp. 2,000 or equal to AUD$0.20. *Lampu Hijau* tends to use simple words to cater to its readers who are mostly not well educated and have low literacy levels (Interview with the editor-in-chief of *Lampu Hijau*, 25 December 2011).

Similar to *Pos Kota*, *Lampu Hijau* uses some tabloid-specific styles, as described in the following section.

*Strong visuals*

According to the editor-in-chief, colourful headlines and engaging pictures are the main strengths of *Lampu Hijau*. Its headlines, which use a combination of upper case, underlining and italics, are eye-catching. In addition, *Lampu Hijau* uses unusual formats for its titles, such as snippets of conversation or bullet points. The paper often uses rhymes as well as local slang, which make the titles very catchy.

![Figure 3. Some editions of Lampu Hijau from December 2011 and January 2012.](image)
Catchy, informal and easy to read.

_Lampu Hijau_ uses vernacular language in most of its headlines, but it uses more serious and formal language for social and political news, particularly in the _Metro Jabodetabek_ section. _Lampu Hijau_ also often uses very long headlines (up to 40 words), and tends to ignore the grammatical rules of Bahasa Indonesia. For example, its headline on 1 December 2011 read:

> Asked to go to the Mosque, a girl hasn’t returned to her house for three days. She was kidnapped by her ex boyfriend and raped by her ex and his 2 friends. One friend admitted he raped her once, another friend admitted he raped her twice, while her ex did not admit yet because he is still on the run.

In addition, _Lampu Hijau_ often uses metaphors and anecdotes in their titles to allow readers to get an idea of the stories quickly and easily. The paper also uses local daily jargon to create familiarity with its readers. Furthermore, _Lampu Hijau_ uses an unusual form of censorship. The image will be covered by black boxes that include comments from the editor or editor-in-chief. These act as censor mechanisms. More details of this can be found in Figure 4.

![Figure 4. The ‘censor mechanism’ in Lampu Hijau.](image)

The yellow sentences in the black box translate as, ‘This has been censored by the editor-in-chief’. These boxes are the censor mechanisms of _Lampu Hijau_. This form of censorship can always be found in the international celebrity news, but is not used for the crime news.

**Local news focusing on crimes**

Analysis of the front page reveals that _Lampu Hijau_ gives more space to crime issues than _Pos Kota_ does. During the research period, the front page of _Lampu Hijau_ was dominated by
crime news, with 46% of all news articles reporting crime, while local news was in second position, with 25% of the total news articles. However, 66.5% of Lampu Hijau’s back page was dominated by local news, with no crime items at all. Thus, similar to Pos Kota, Lampu Hijau is committed its stated goal of to being a local newspaper and focusing on local issues. Specifically, in the case of Lampu Hijau, the paper focuses on local crime-related issues.

Large allotment of space for advertisement

Advertisements are found on every page in Lampu Hijau. The paper has advertorials as well as ‘Iklan Baris’—classified advertisements. On a weekly basis, advertisements occupy 43% of each page in Lampu Hijau. Most of the advertisements address readers with lower incomes. The advertisements concentrate on products such as ring tones for mobile telephones, motorcycles, utility vehicles, supplements for sexual vitality, sexual therapy, matchmaker websites, and traditional medicines. At the time of research, there were also several political campaigns in progress because Jakarta was about to hold its gubernatorial election; thus, the paper also presented political advertisements.

Providing space for the public

Lampu Hijau gives space for its readers to be in the newspaper—through true story sections, personal greetings and public opinion spaces. There are subsections in the KomBes section that are specifically designed to provide space for readers. These contain pictures of readers, greetings and quizzes.

It appears Lampu Hijau realises that most of its readers are workers who come from villages or rural areas. They are used to unmediated communication and want to catch up on recent gossip, scandals and local issues through social channels such as gatherings or meetings. Thus, they use Lampu Hijau as a replacement for their traditional social channels, which creates a strong bond between Lampu Hijau and its readers.

Lampu Hijau also has two subsections on its front page that cover community issues. These sections provide a space for local communities to be in the media. It is no wonder that the tagline for one of the subsections is ‘berani narsis, biar eksis’, which means ‘it is fine to be a little narcissistic in order to exist in the media’.

General life guidance

Lampu Hijau has a specific section that includes general life guidance, particularly relating to sexual and psychological problems. This section is called Seksitainment and is located on page six. It includes consultation with experts and personal stories.

Findings: Pos Kota and Lampu Hijau as newspapers for urban workers

Wasserman (2010) articulated one of the perspectives from which to consider the phenomenon of tabloid journalism, ‘as an extension of [the] move toward market-driven (as opposed to explicitly ideologically motivated) media ... [that is] set on extracting as much
profit as possible from the communities they cater to’ (p. 3). In the case of Pos Kota, it can be argued that the commitment to serve the urban workers is based on profit calculation rather than any idealistic goals.

When Pos Kota was founded in 1970, mainstream newspapers only focused on Indonesian national politics. In addition, due to rapid development in Jakarta, many people were attracted to move to Jakarta to work as unskilled workers. This socioeconomic shift had an immense effect on the media’s target markets. Pos Kota was aware of this change in demographic and realised that it had good prospects for business. Thus, the decision to target urban workers who were previously ignored by the mainstream media can be seen as a smart move by Pos Kota’s founders to cater to a new, promising market. The editor-in-chief of Pos Kota testified that there were two reasons behind the decision to target urban workers as Pos Kota readers. The first was commercial, and the second was based on a service-orientated factor, as denoted in his statement:

Pos Kota focuses on the urban workers since they are the highest percentage of people who live in Jakarta and surrounds, and also because this group needs media to give them access and information so that they can increase the quality of their lives (Interview with Pos Kota editor-in-chief, 7 August 2012).

The editor and journalists described the aims of Pos Kota as both commercial and idealistic. One of the journalists depicted the mission of Pos Kota as follows: ‘Just like any other publication, Pos Kota wants to be a reliable newspaper as well as to earn increasing profit for the company’ (Interview with journalist 1 of Pos Kota, 25 December 2011). However, the paper does not employ the two missions—commercial and idealistic—equally. The space allocated to advertisements during the research period was higher than that given to editorial content. This data can be perceived as evidence that the paper’s commercial success is considered more important than its role of serving the public. Furthermore, data from Litbang Grup Pos Kota (2011) says that the paper is proud to be the main reference on car pricing, thus emphasising its information role in a commercial context. This circumstance reflects the influence of market factors on Pos Kota, which affect the paper’s operation as a business—a standard contemporary practice, as noted by McQuail (2003): ‘Communications and the media are now predominantly, if not primarily, run as business organisations’ (p. 233).

As urban workers over the past four decades have become the biggest reader group of Pos Kota, the paper has made a more conscious effort to ‘maintain’ this market. As the editor-in-chief described: ‘We devote our paper to the urban workers since they are our loyal readers. We are committed to taking care of them and helping them to solve their problems’ (Interview with Pos Kota editor-in-chief, 7 August 2012). In order to enable the urban workers to be heard, Pos Kota created a specific section to allow the urban readers to discuss their grievances, as the editor-in-chief explained:
Pos Kota wants to be a paper, which is able to connect the public with the government. It is not only about socialisation or education, but also finding solutions to current problems or issues. That is why Pos Kota has a section named Aspirasi Warga ['public aspiration'] to accommodate the aspirations of public in Jakarta and surrounds. We follow up any aspiration from the public, confirm it to some sources, then publish it in the paper so the readers would know that their aspirations are not being neglected. Pos Kota believes that it has a moral responsibility to help educate the public through coverage of issues that answer their needs (Interview with Pos Kota editor-in-chief, 7 August 2012).

Pos Kota has a section entitled ‘Public Aspiration’ and its readers are active in this forum. However, in the case of a public desire for influence on the local government’s policy, for example, when urban workers write aspirational letters to Pos Kota and the paper publishes them, do these actually reach the people in charge? In other words, will the governor read and listen to this kind of ‘aspiration’? This question remains open, as Pos Kota does not provide any section that contains the responses from local government officials to these letters.

Despite the fact that the commitment to serve urban workers in Jakarta and its surrounds was primarily a commercial decision, Pos Kota tries seriously to make the paper suitable for urban workers. This is most clearly seen in its role as a local paper, as expressed by a Pos Kota journalist: ‘The paper is always concerned with local issues such as crime, fire, flood, traffic and so on. We believe that this kind of news is important for people who live in Jakarta and surrounds’ (Interview with journalist 1 of Pos Kota, 25 December 2011).

Local news is certainly the main topic of Pos Kota. However, this does not necessarily mean that any local issues can be published in the paper. According to the editor of Pos Kota, only local issues that relate to wider public issues, such as a new policy on fuel prices, are those covered by Pos Kota. Moreover, for local news relating to crimes, the news item has to meet three requirements:

First, it has to involve many people or broad society. Second, it has to have an element of the new so we need to cover it as part of warning or prevention mechanism. Third, it has to be in relation to a public figure (Interview with Pos Kota editor-in-chief, 7 August 2012).

Another attempt to accommodate the needs of the urban workers appears in the use of the distinctive style and vernacular language used in Pos Kota. As the editor stated: ‘The unusual layout, the concise stories and the distinctive style are nothing more than Pos Kota’s attempts to meet the reader’s expectation’ (Interview with Pos Kota editor-in-chief, 7 August 2012). The statement ‘to meet the reader’s expectation’ can be also read as ‘to gain profit for the paper’. It is evident that the paper is comfortable dwelling on drama and sensationalism as long as this is marketable.
Interestingly, the editor of Pos Kota said that the paper was not concerned with such criticisms. He stated that ‘time has revealed that Pos Kota has a distinctive style that people cannot resist. After all, many media, including television, have followed the style of Pos Kota’. Indeed, Pos Kota has become a trendsetter for the tabloid genre in Indonesian journalism. One journalist claimed that for crime news, Pos Kota is the ‘guru’ for all media: ‘We are the trendsetters for crime news. Many media follow our style’ (Interview with journalist 2 of Pos Kota, 25 December 2011).

In addition to that, the editor-in-chief of Lampu Hijau described the demographic profile of the target readers as follows: ‘The target readers of Lampu Hijau are the urban workers who are still in the productive age, around 19 to 45 years old, with little to medium financial capacity’ (Interview with the editor-in-chief of Lampu Hijau, 25 December 2011). He emphasised: ‘Lampu Hijau wants to be the main newspaper for the urban workers to get any information related to crimes, entertainment, sex education and so on’ (Interview with the editor-in-chief of Lampu Hijau, 25 December 2011).

Similar to Pos Kota, Lampu Hijau also has two ‘paradoxical’ aims: to serve its target readers and to advance its market position. The decision to be a local newspaper is also based on profit consideration because, at the time of its founding, not many newspapers addressed this reader segment and these topics. As a journalist stated: ‘Lampu Hijau focuses on crimes, local politics or local issues and sexual issues since they are still rarely reported’ (Interview with the journalist 2 of Lampu Hijau, 13 August 2012). For the same reasons, Lampu Hijau also focuses on funny and weird stories: ‘Distinctive stories also become our interest since they are actually marketable though often ignored by other media’ (Interview with journalist 3 of Lampu Hijau, 13 August 2012). The effort to win further market segments is the underlying reason for an attempt to accommodate all circles of urban workers. As one Lampu Hijau journalist said: ‘We target all workers in Jakarta, not only unskilled workers but also public servants. We have the sections to accommodate all of them; however, the portion for unskilled workers is higher’ (Interview with journalist 1 of Lampu Hijau, 17 December 2011). By attempting to accommodate all strata of urban workers, the paper can make itself ever more profitable.

In an attempt to carve out its own readership and distinguish itself, Lampu Hijau has chosen to focus on crime. By selecting this narrow scope, it minimises competition with other newspapers, including Pos Kota. The editor-in-chief stated:

The birth of Lampu Merah [the previous name of Lampu Hijau] was started with the commitment to create a very segmented newspaper. Many segments were being considered at that time, but finally we decided to focus on crime since there is no newspaper that fully covers this issue. Indonesian readers, especially urban workers, were mostly ignorant about the crime information, even though crime is an inevitable part of the daily urban lives … By providing comprehensive information
about crime, I believe we will help to create a more safe and secure feeling in our society (Interview with the editor-in-chief of Lampu Hijau, 25 December 2011).

‘Crime issues have been the main topic in Lampu Hijau from its beginning’ (Interview with journalist 1 of Lampu Hijau, 17 December 2011). Indeed, Lampu Hijau seeks to play a significant role in preventing crimes. One of the journalists reasoned that the function of the paper is ‘to make people realise that crime can happen anywhere at any time to anyone. Lampu Hijau tries to encourage its readers to be aware of this’ (Interview with journalist 3 of Lampu Hijau, 13 August 2012). Another Lampu Hijau journalist supported this by saying: ‘People need to be aware of any crime that might happen to them or their beloved ones. For that reason, Lampu Hijau tries its best to provide its readers with accurate and comprehensive crime news’ (Interview with journalist 2 of Lampu Hijau, 13 August 2012).

By focusing on crime issues, Lampu Hijau has become a specialised newspaper, and is thus able to face intense competition after the 1998 period of political reform that signified the beginning of a democratic era in Indonesia. The momentum of the 1998 reform has significantly influenced the development of journalism in Indonesia, especially since the passing of The Act of the Republic Indonesia No. 40 in 1999, concerning the press. This act marked the establishment of press freedom in Indonesia, which has led to enormous growth in Indonesian journalism. At the end of the New Order (the era before the 1998 reform), only 289 publications had a license to publish (Romano, 2003, p. 35); however, soon after the reform, the number of publications in Indonesia had reached the thousands. According to the data from Direktorat Pembinaan Pers, on 23 September 1999, the number of print media in Indonesia — which included newspapers, tabloids, magazines and bulletins — reached 1,678 publications (cited in Yusuf, 2009, p. 1). Under pressure from market competition, Lampu Hijau sought what Bennet (2003) called ‘audience-grabbing stories on short deadlines with scarce resources’ (p. 3). On a daily basis, each journalist of Lampu Hijau is required to submit at least three stories about local and crime issues. Thus, sensational stories become their main preference because these are popular, profitable, cheap and easy to cover (McChesney, 2008, p. 46).

Based on the assumption that urban workers are less educated, Lampu Hijau turns complex subjects into copy that is easy to understand by using daily jargon, simple phrases and easy diction. In nearly all of Lampu Hijau’s sections, the paper uses vernacular language, strong visuals and anecdotes or jargon to make the content more easily understood by readers. As stated by a journalist, ‘The style and the format of Lampu Hijau are very attractive and suitable for its target readers because they are easy to “digest”’ (Interview with journalist 3 of Lampu Hijau, 13 August 2012). Undeniably, the journalists and editors believe that their style is appropriate for their target readers. One of the journalists confirmed that she wants to keep the style of the paper: ‘I don’t want to change anything. This is the unique characteristic of Lampu Hijau” (Interview with journalist 1 of Lampu Hijau, 17 December 2011).
Consequently, Lampu Hijau often receives negative judgement and criticism regarding its layout and writing style, which relies on dramatisation and sensationalism. One of the major accusations is that Lampu Hijau is too sexually explicit: ‘Many people think that Lampu Hijau is a pornographic newspaper. For me, it is completely a misinterpretation. Reporting about sexual issues does not equal to porn, does it?’ (Interview with journalist 3 of Lampu Hijau, 13 August 2012). Lampu Hijau is struggling with its image in this respect. One of the journalists admitted that it is difficult to overcome the image of Lampu Hijau: ‘Lampu Hijau is still considered as a porn newspaper for some people. The paper finds that it is difficult to get out from that image’ (Interview with journalist 2 of Lampu Hijau, 13 August 2012).

The image as a pornographic newspaper stems from the paper always reports about rape, sexual abuse, sexual harassment and so on, and places these stories on the front page. This, of course, is also part of its marketing strategy. Lampu Hijau uses the global formula for tabloid headlines, which, according to Wasserman (2010) are ‘brightly coloured … printed in big capital letters and often underlined, italicised, or with an exclamation mark adding emphasis, [the headlines] scream out a sensational bit of news across the whole of the front page’ (p. 43).

Actually, Lampu Hijau has made some efforts to move away from its image as a pornographic newspaper. When shifting from its old name, Lampu Merah, to the new name, Lampu Hijau, the newspaper received a makeover and was supposed to become more elegant and ‘soft’ in terms of style. According to the editor-in-chief, the layout, headlines, sections, pictures and writing style of Lampu Hijau were supposed to become different from Lampu Merah, which historically were distinctly vulgar and sensational. However, ultimately, Lampu Hijau had to keep its sensational style because the paper found this was more appealing to its target readers. The editor reasoned: ‘We have to be realistic and consider what is most suitable for our readers who are mostly urban workers. It is a market requirement we cannot escape’ (Interview with the editor-in-chief of Lampu Hijau, 25 December 2011). On one hand, this confirms the commitment of Lampu Hijau to align with what is suitable for its target readers. On the other hand, it indicates the vulnerability of the paper to market forces, as described by Keeble (2001), ‘economic pressure becomes a justification to sacrifice standards of significance, depth, and diversity, for insider viewpoints, scandals, violence, sex, the invasion of privacy of individuals and sensationalism’ (p. 61).

**Discussion: Tabloid newspapers as an urban phenomenon**

Tabloid journalism in Indonesia characterises newspapers that focus on local issues, especially crimes, local incidents and sensationalised stories. It targets urban workers who have moved to the capital (Jakarta and its surrounds) from rural villages and who use the newspapers as a replacement for their traditional media to find out about recent gossip, scandals, rumours and local issues. It also targets urban workers who do not come from
rural villages, but whose social networks have been disrupted due to their high workload in Jakarta and its surrounds.

For that reason, tabloid newspapers in Indonesia have attained success in Jakarta because the city is the most popular urban destination of their target readers who come from rural villages and miss the social or unmediated communication they previously experienced. Attempts to begin tabloid newspapers in other Indonesian cities have failed. These tabloid newspapers—even though they tried to apply a similar formula to Pos Kota and Lampu Hijau, such as relying on locality and distinctive style—were not successful. For example, Surya and Memorandum failed in Surabaya, East Java, even though this is the second-largest city in Indonesia, with over 2.7 million inhabitants (Wibisono, 2000, p. 164).

One explanation for this is that people in Surabaya, Yogyakarta and other cities in Indonesia do not need tabloid journalism because they have not experienced the same level of social disruption that characterizes the wider Jakarta area. They do not need these alternatives to traditional communication and media because their daily lives are still full of social engagement. Besides, cities other than Jakarta are not the focus of urbanization. In the other cities, there are more choices of media because people are less frequently trapped in traffic jams or may not need to commute daily, thereby lacking the contextual circumstances in which a tabloid readership might arise. This circumstance also verifies that tabloid journalism is a fit-for-context phenomenon, which means that different contexts may lead to different kinds of tabloid journalism. In this case, tabloid journalism in Indonesia is a phenomenon that only fits the context of urban life in Jakarta and its surrounds.

This circumstance leads to the conclusion that, in Indonesia, the tabloid newspaper is an urban phenomenon. However, the concept of urban, here, only refers to Jakarta and its commuter belts (Bekasi, Tangerang, Bogor and Depok) because these cities have special characteristics as a consequence of urbanization—spatially and culturally—and are thus different from other cities in Indonesia.

Like other cities in developing countries, the urban population in Jakarta and its surrounds is growing significantly due to massive urbanization. Jakarta and its commuter belts are flooded by people from rural areas in all parts of Indonesia in search of work. According to Giddens (2006), economic reasons are the background of urbanization: ‘People are drawn to cities in the developing world either because their traditional systems of rural production have disintegrated, or because the urban areas offer superior job opportunity’ (p. 919). In addition, Tyner (2003) argues that ‘Jakarta’s population is also impacted by seasonal and daily commuting. Hundreds of thousands of workers, the majority of whom live in the Jabodetabek [Jakarta, Bogor, Depok, Tangerang and Bekasi] region commute daily to Jakarta’ (p. 391).

As a consequence of the amount of time spent commuting, urban workers in Jakarta are forced to commit the majority of their time to employment since ‘most contacts
between city dwellers are fleeting and partial, and are means to other ends, rather than being satisfying relationships in themselves’ (Wirth, as cited in Giddens, 2006, p. 898). In addition, according to Siregar (2000, p. 43), urban workers in Jakarta barely have social lives. They are too busy to lead the ‘normal’ lives they used to have in their rural backgrounds.

In Jakarta, workers often have to live separately from their family and their community, which makes it difficult for them to maintain social and cultural ties. As Giddens (2006) argues: ‘despite the rich opportunities that big cities offer, many people find them lonely or unfriendly places’ (p. 894). Furthermore, in Jakarta and its supporting cities, relationship is transitory and instrumental (Giddens, 2006, p. 896). Thus, tabloid newspapers can fill the emptiness of daily life.

Tabloid newspapers also help people understand and learn about the Jakarta milieu. Pos Kota and Lampu Hijau have been found to help urban workers in Jakarta learn about the place in which they live by providing them with information and gossip relating to their urban lives.

Conclusion

The term ‘tabloid’ in Indonesia is often perceived as referring to the format of the newspaper, which is smaller than a broadsheet newspaper. There is no concept of ‘tabloid journalism’ in Indonesia; instead, most people call this form of newspaper a ‘crime newspaper’ or ‘pornographic newspaper’. Despite such judgmental labels, tabloid journalism in Indonesia has actually played an important role in creating a new market for newspaper consumption. Tabloid journalism in Indonesia has created an opportunity for everyday people to become newspaper readers.

Unsurprisingly, in addition to serving these as yet ‘untouched’ readers, tabloid newspapers in Indonesia also belong to large conglomerates that, according to Wasserman (2010, p. 3), exploit their readers for commercial purposes. Thus, ‘their poor and working-class audiences remain merely a market to be tapped’ (Wasserman, 2010, p. 30). The choice to be a local newspaper and to use crude and salacious headlines on the front and back page is made for marketing purposes, as was admitted by the journalists and the editors of Pos Kota and Lampu Hijau during the interviews.

In response to such criticisms, both Pos Kota and Lampu Hijau editorial boards, always take cover under the shield that it is the urban worker’s taste. They state that their readers’ taste ‘forces’ them to publish sensationalized stories. However, in most cases, taste is a construction, which means that taste can be constructed through limited choice and regular exposure. It is the tabloid newspaper, itself, that creates this particular taste for the urban workers. As Anwar (2000) argues, ‘people might not really like it [a tabloid newspaper], but after all they got used to it’ (p. 27). Thus, their justifications can be seen more as a side effect than a main purpose like Wasserman (2010) claims: ‘If they [tabloids]
manage to contribute to the good of society in the process, this might be seen as a positive spin-off rather than the main aim’ (p. 3).

Having said that, to simply ignore or downgrade this kind of journalism within the Indonesian print media landscape represents a narrow-minded perspective. This kind of journalism will always there and develops as long as the market is existed, and tabloids present value to their target readers. As an alternative, tabloid journalism could be reinvented in a way that ‘preserves its best elements, subtracts the worst and still glows’ (Shafer, 2009). In this case, tabloid journalism in Indonesia could be reinvented by remaining local in terms of the issues it discusses instead of dwelling on drama and sensationalism.

Reference


Biodata: Billy Nathan Setiawan is a lecturer at Institute of Languages and Communication, Sampoerna University. He completed an MA in Intercultural Communication at The University of Manchester, UK. His research interests are in the area of intercultural communication and the connection among foreign language learning, identity and culture. His email address: billy.setiawan@sampoernauniversity.ac.id / bilzy_1@yahoo.com.

Abstract

Among Indonesians, English has also been used to communicate through social network sites such as Facebook, Twitter and so on. The use of English in such media has contributed to the development of Indonesian-English norms. This paper aims to analyse the English language variations and the Indonesian-English code-switching among Indonesian Facebookers (Indonesian term for Facebook users). Analysis will be based on similarities and patterns of linguistic features such as grammar, vocabulary and discourse style used by some Indonesians while writing English texts on Facebook. This study reveals that the use of English of some Indonesians on Facebook is sometimes influenced by the colloquial Indonesian, local pragmatic context and communicative norms. Code-switching has also been used to help the speakers convey the message better.

Keywords: Code-switching, language variations, Indonesian-English

Introduction

This paper aims to investigate the English language variations and the Indonesian-English code-switching among Indonesian Facebookers (Indonesian term for Facebook users). The use of English, both in spoken and written form (such as on online blog, Facebook or Twitter) has been a ‘pride’ among the Indonesian young generation (Hassall, Murtisari, Donnelly & Wood, 2008). With the influence of the native Indonesian language and over 500 local dialects in Indonesia, Indonesian-English could become a new variety of Englishes. Some existing studies have revealed that Indonesian-English code-switching does not only occur in spoken form. Indonesian-English code-switching has been found in Indonesian blogs (da Silva, 2003). Moreover, a number of final year students have attempted to investigate code-switching on Facebook (such as in Sutrismi, 2014). However, such studies mostly acknowledge the types and the reasons only.

This paper seeks answers for the following questions:

1. Which patterns (grammatical structures, vocabulary and other discourse styles) could be traced from the use of English among Indonesian Facebookers?
2. What has influenced the patterns?
Data were collected from observation of the author’s Facebook timeline. Similarities and patterns of English linguistic features such as grammar, vocabulary and discourse style will be identified. The history and the recent use of English in Indonesia will be explained in the first section, followed by the role of internet in the development of a language variation. The methodology is outlined in section two. Finally, the result of this study is disclosed in the next section. A brief summary will conclude the study.

It should be noted that the sample of this study is limited. The participants are those on the author’s personal online social network platform. Thus, this study might not represent all of the Indonesian-English language variation.

**Literature review**

*History of English in Indonesia*

Kachru (1992a), cited in Jenkins (2015), indicated that Indonesia lies in the expanding circle of the spread of English. In the expanding circle, according to Kachru (1992a cited in Jenkins 2015), English is used as a foreign language (EFL). Xiaogiong & Xianxing (2011) explained that the use of English in the outer and expanding circles is influenced by the local histories, literary traditions, pragmatic background and communicative norms. However, unlike in the outer circle countries such as Bangladesh, India, Kenya where English has become institutionalised and serves as a second language, English in the expanding circles performs as a new variety and the standards are considered dependent (ibid). Yoo (2014) argued that, since the people in the expanding circles do not use English to communicate among themselves (it is rather used to communicate with people from different countries as a lingua franca or a means of international communication), their own independent norms will be difficult to establish. We may find ‘a native speaker of Indian-English’. However, defining ‘a native speaker of Chinese-English’ or ‘a native speaker of Korean-English’ is less feasible.

Historically, English was first taught to Indonesians in the middle schools in 1914 (Lauder, 2008). In this era, Indonesia was still occupied by the Dutch. Only few indigenous Indonesians had access to education. Thus, English never functioned as a medium of communication. Although British colonial power was exercised in Indonesia for a very short time (1801 – 1824), it is difficult to see English as having been an official language in Indonesia (Dardjowidjojo, 2003 in Lauder, 2008) in the colonial period.

However, since the mid-1990s, English has played a substantial role in Indonesian education. English has been one of the compulsory subjects in middle and high schools (Larson, 2014). English used to be a mandatory subject in primary school until 2013 when the Indonesian Ministry of Education and Culture dismissed it. It then became an optional subject in primary schools. Still, many schools decided to keep the English subject to boost the school’s prestige.
Although most content only covered grammar and translation from English to Indonesian or vice versa and there may not have been direct access to native speakers of English, more Indonesians learned English for the first time. The influence of western products and cultures such as fast food chains, Hollywood movies, western popular music and TV shows (especially MTV) has made English familiar, particularly among young Indonesians. While certain people feared that English would degrade the national and local languages and cultures (Alwasilah, 1997), those residing in big cities have noticed that English is helpful in education and business. Gunarwan (1998 in Lauder 2008) pointed out that English owns prestige among Indonesians. Recently, many job vacancies include English skills as one of the most vital requirements. The ability to speak English may boost an applicant’s chance to get a decent job. English brings along a symbol of education, modernity and sophistication (Lauder, 2008).

The norm, however, still leans to either British or American English (ibid). Although it is predicted that Indonesia will develop its own standard of English, Lauder (2008) argued that it will take quite a while to have something equivalent to such English varieties like Singaporean or Indian English. Nevertheless, it is worth noticing some loanwords and phonological adaption of English which have long been used in Indonesian English. Take the example of ‘fren ciken’, ‘ayam kentaki’ (Kentucky chicken), or ‘ayam fren ciken’ (chicken fried chicken) which refers to the fried chicken in the American fast food restaurant and was commonly heard in the 1990s. It is interesting to see how Indonesians would never call their own traditional fried chicken (with different recipes) ‘fried chicken’. It remains to be called ‘ayam goreng’ (ayam = chicken; goreng = fried).

Recent scholars indicate that English has been used in more contexts and media. Da Silva (2013) found a high percentage of English borrowings and code-switching in her study of two blog short stories. Certain words such as ‘meeting’, ‘game’, ‘chatting’ and ‘update’ are commonly found in Indonesian sentences. According to Haugen (150, pp. 210-231) and Sneddon (2003) in da Silva (2013), borrowings can be categorised as loanwords (original words in one language which are used in another, such as ‘stop’, ‘baseball’, ‘game’ etc), loanblends (when a linguistic item in a language is mixed with an item in another language, such as ‘diupload’), loanshift (extension of meanings in the other language, such as ‘kerja sama’) and coinage (combination of units from two different languages, such as ‘ilmuwan’ – “ilm” from Arabic and ‘wan’ functions as a suffix in Sanskrit). In her study of the two blog short stories, da Silva (2013) also found apparent phonological adaption of some lexical items such as ‘oke’ (English: okay), ‘eniwei’ (anyway) and ‘meibi’ (maybe). Several cases of code-switching are also discovered in the study. Code-switching occurs when there is a shift of words, clauses or sentences from one language to another (Baker, 2001). According to Poplack (1980), tag-switching includes an insertion of a tag from one language into an utterance in another language. Intra-sentential switching is classified when a word, a phrase
or a clause of a language is inserted in a text of another language (ibid). Inter-sentential
switching occurs when the speaker changes the language from one sentence to another
(MacSwan, 2006).

Furthermore, Hassall et al (2008) investigated the attitude towards western
loanwords (used to be Dutch then mostly English recently). Among 153 Indonesian
undergraduate students, western loanwords are viewed as nice-sounding and enriching
Indonesian. The participants disagree that the use of western loanwords should be avoided.
Western loanwords do not necessarily pollute the national language (Indonesian). This
finding may contradict the early attitude towards the use of English in Indonesia. For a long
period, English was viewed as a threat that might harm the national language, culture,
values and behaviour (Lauder, 2008). English was believed to bring with it ‘western liberal
values’ which potentially collided with traditional Indonesian values. Questions sparked on
the ability of Indonesians to protect their values and nationalism and to resist the
imperialism and liberalism brought along by the use of English (Alwasilah, 1997). The
attitude towards loanwords may contribute to the findings of this study, as the participants
of this study might have related reasons (to the explanation above) for using English on
Facebook.

English lexis has also been used extensively in Indonesian adolescent slang and
colloquial Indonesian. Wijana (2012) in examining Indonesian slang dictionaries produced by
Lavia (2007), Sahertian (2008) and Mastuti (2008) found the following loanwords from
English:

1. ‘master’ when talking about an expert
2. ‘hunting’ (to look for/to explore/to find something among many options such as
   when going shopping for clothes)
3. ‘affair’ (when someone cheats on partner or is in an unusual relationship)
4. ‘error’ (mistake, or when someone makes a mistake; could function as a noun or an
   adjective)
5. ‘stand by’ (to be ready)
6. ‘nyemok’ (to smoke).

It is also worth looking at how the internet has played an important role in making
June 2014 over 71 million Indonesians (out of a total population 250 million) were internet
users. Around 51 million are registered on Facebook. Facebook has been used to report
their activities, express their feelings or even to show where they hang out or what they eat.
The tone of the language on Facebook is often casual. Early findings on computer-mediated
communication (CMC) explored extensive use of abbreviations, acronyms, emoticons,
irregular sentence patterns and rude language (Baron, 2008). Social network sites such as
Facebook and Twitter have been found powerful for the development of certain language
norms, especially those against the standard or majority norms (Wei, 2000). Based on that
argument, I predict that the language used on Facebook among my Indonesian peers includes English borrowing and Indonesian-English code-switching, and these contribute to the development of Indonesian-English norms.

**Methodology**

The data were taken from my personal Facebook timeline. From 26 March to 30 March 2015 I captured incidents of English borrowing and English-Indonesian code-switching. Identities of the respondents are not featured. Although there is no exact data of their profile, I would describe the people on my Facebook timeline as mostly 18 – 45 years old. Their education level may vary. Some of them were my students at undergraduate level, while some others have completed a Bachelor’s degree and are either working or pursuing a higher degree. Since the samples are taken randomly, the English proficiency level of the respondents cannot be tracked. Gender may not be an issue since that is not the focus of the study. A notice was sent to each of the respondents whose text is used in this study. Objection has not been received.

Similar to da Silva’s (2013) study, I then classified the types of borrowing based on Haugen’s (1956) typology of borrowings. Poplack’s (1980) classification of code-switching guided the analysis. More importantly, grammar, vocabulary and discourse style of the incidents were identified to help define the characteristics of Indonesian English. The three features, together with the pronunciation, are described by Jenkins (2015) as the main levels which distinguish English variations from that in the inner circle. I eliminate the pronunciation aspect since the data are in written form.

**Findings and discussion**

There were 47 incidents in which at least one English word or acronym or abbreviation was used in the Facebook posts written by my Indonesian peers. Please note that this is not a thorough observation. Since the display on Facebook shows random posts from several different days, it is rather difficult to get the exact percentage of texts using Indonesian only, English only or English-Indonesian code-switching.

**The code-switching and borrowing**

Among the 47 incidents, 25 of the texts are in full English. The other 22 include Indonesian-English code-switching, 2 of which consist of tag-switching, 10 consist of intra-sentential switching and 7 of them include inter-sentential switching. The other 3 incidents, however, insert an Indonesian word as a switch in an English context.

In the tag-switching and intra-sentential switching, 22 English borrowings are found. One of them shows loan blend as in:

(1) *Sebarkan informasi ini dengan mengklik tombol “bagikan” atau “share”*  
[Share this information by clicking the “share” icon]
'mengklik' is formed by an Indonesian prefix me(N) + an English verb ‘to click’. In formal standard Indonesian, a prefix is inserted prior to a verb (Englebretson: 2003, pp. 17-21).

Most English lexical items found in the borrowing incidents are nouns (12 out of 22). It reflects Poplack, Sankoff, and Miller’s (1988) finding that nouns have the highest amount among other English function words and they are usually borrowed.

(2) Lomba fashion show kreasi daur ulang oleh designer nak smanses.

[Fashion show competition featuring recycled creations by students of SMANSES.]

(3) ... Open house nya seminggu lho, dari tanggal 1 – 8 April ...

[... The open house will be held for a week from April 1 – 8 ...]

Example (2) and (3) show some English nouns which are preferred to the Indonesian words. ‘fashion show’ and ‘designer’ sound more familiar and more casual than the Indonesian translation ‘peragaan busana’ and ‘perancang busana’. They are more familiar because they might be more frequently written or spoken in media such as TV or internet. The affixes pe- and –an in the Indonesian translation may make it sound more formal and used less frequently.

‘open house’ became popular after some important people in Indonesia such as the former president, some politicians and some religious leaders held an open house or an open day to welcome people to their house on some big days (independence day or religious days) and it was usually broadcast in the news.

Four occurrences of common abbreviations are found such as ‘LOL’ (laugh out loud, found twice), ‘BB’ for Blackberry smartphone and ‘BTW’ (by the way). The contraction of ‘wanna’ occurs four times while the actual ‘want to’ occurs three times.

Some code-switching occur because the tone of the sentence would sound different if it were done in only one language. Indonesian discourse particles might play a role in it.

(4) We’re just metres away from our destination eh keburu ujan. Neduh dulu lah.

[We’re just metres away from our destination but it starts to rain. Gotta find a shelter, then.]

(5) I am going to sell my car in Jakarta. Interested PM ya. Thanks

[I am going to sell my car in Jakarta. If any of you are interested, send me a private message, won’t you (or please)? Thanks]

Discourse particles are often used in colloquial Indonesian. Just like other discourse particles, ‘eh’ in (4) does not really mean anything. It helps the sentence sound more friendly. ‘lah’, still in (4) shows that the language is colloquial. It switches the somehow serious tone in the first part of the sentence, to a wittier one in the rest of the sentence. In (5), ‘ya’ functions as a tag question as mentioned by Sneddon (2006). Again it might show a
more friendly tone. As in (5), the speaker is trying to persuade readers to buy his or her car and ‘ya’ could be used to make the request sound nicer.

The code-switching incidents in this study may not necessarily show that the speakers have low competence in one of the languages. The speakers might feel more comfortable expressing words or phrases in the chosen language. Code-switching also occurs to help the sentence sound more casual or friendly. It might help the speakers convey the message and show their intention better without sounding offensive.

**Discourse style and the problems**

The study shows that American English spelling is favoured more than British English spelling. Three occurrences of American English spelling are found (‘favorite’, ‘realize’ and ‘favor’) while there is only one incident of British English spelling (metre). Presumably, as from my own experience learning English since primary school, most English textbooks in Indonesia use American English spelling. We may also refer to the textbooks used by informal English schools such as *EF English First* which tend to implement American English spelling systems. Thus, Indonesians are more familiar with American English spelling. Furthermore, we cannot ignore the influence of Hollywood and the American music industry in the development of the English language in Indonesia.

Since English in Indonesia is norm-dependent, most people in the country learn basic grammatical structures from school or textbooks. The basic knowledge tends to be applied in all contexts, which results in frequent errors. The errors have then developed some new, acceptable norms such as in:

**Missing articles**

An occasional error which becomes quite common when Indonesians speak or write in English, as reflected in this study, is that the articles are missing.

(6)   *I wanna have baby.*

(7)   *I got red shoes, Red Hoodie, Red Iphone case from abc. I still want a red watch and today i wore red dress for my presentation :D ...*

The articles, when they are actually needed before the nouns in (6) – ‘a baby’ instead of just ‘baby’ and more frequent in (7) – a red hoodie, a red iPhone case and a red dress – are missing. It could correspond with the complexity of indefinite articles in Indonesian. Indefinite articles differ depending on the nouns which follow. For example, for most non-living things, the article must be ‘sebuah’ such as in ‘sebuah mobil’ (a car), ‘sebuah computer’ (a computer). ‘seorang’ is the article for humans, such as in ‘seorang polisi’ (a police officer). ‘selembar’ is followed by paper or paper-like nouns such as in ‘selembar kertas’ (a piece of paper) or ‘selembar uang’ (a piece of paper money). Such complexity could trigger some Indonesians to skip the indefinite articles. Thus, when using English, they assume that the articles are not obligatory either.
Misuse of gerund

The study also shows the use of the gerund when it is not really necessary.

(8) *Ini jadwal Lesmils launching di Jatomi Kuningan City.*

[This is the schedule of the launch in Jatomi Kuningan City.]

(9) *Guys, besok jangan lupa launching yaaa!!*

[Guys, don’t forget the launch (of our event) tomorrow!!]

(8) and (9) display how a gerund (verb + -ing) has become a new noun. In English, ‘launch’ can function as either a verb or a noun. Not knowing that ‘launch’ is also a noun, some Indonesians in this study add –ing and invent their own version of noun.

Missing subjects and verbs

In colloquial Indonesian, it is common to have a conversation as the following:

i

A: *Lagi apa?*

[(indicating present activity) what]

[What are you doing?]

B: *Lagi makan.*

[(indicating present activity) eat.]

[I’m eating]

The subjects and verbs are sometimes dismissed because they are not seen necessary. The same pattern shows in this study.

(10) 1Had a great time working on a special project in Surabaya and Malang for three weeks. A big thanks to friends, colleagues, and students who always welcome me in these cities. 2Get ready for another adventure in Banyuwangi before going back to Jakarta. 3Have a great weekend. 4Stay active, positive, and productive. #ExploringEastJava

Example (10) displays a confusion about which subjects the speakers is talking about. Sentence 1, 2, 3 or 4 might have different subjects, yet the speaker does not clearly state it. It might reflect the sentence structure in Indonesian which often relies on the context.

Missing ‘be’

Another frequent occurrence in this study is that the auxiliary verb ‘be’ is sometimes missing as in:

(11) *I know you (...) worried about me.*
This (...) how you learn to drive at driving school.

In (11), the speaker might presume that ‘worried’ is a verb, just like in Indonesian. Thus, the ‘be’ is missing.

Another factor that could contribute to this mistake is that in Indonesian, ‘be’ or ‘adalah’ is used in formal context only. In informal context, ‘adalah’ is often eliminated, such as in:

ii Saya guru.

[I teacher.]

[I am a teacher.]

It may then apply when some Indonesians speak or write in English. The ‘be’ is missing in (12).

See + object + verb

In English, when the verb ‘see’ is followed by an object then another verb, the second verb must be either in the base form (when the action is completed) or -ing form (action in progress). For some Indonesians, this formula is taught only at the advanced level. Thus, some people on my Facebook timeline were not aware of this and errors occurred as in:

(13) Do you wanna see XYZ was playing with her friend ...
(14) She saw a stranger wanted to enter our home ...

Untidy punctuation mark

Although it may not be the best indicator of a language variety, punctuation mark is often mistaken by some people in this study. ‘,’ (the comma) is often missing when it should be inserted in the sentence, such as in:

(15) See you later DC!
(16) Happy birthday my dearest husband
(17) thank you for the trust on me crystal

The same pattern can be traced from example (15), (16) and (17). It is understandable that in spoken language, a comma might not be visible. However, in written language, the comma should be inserted when the speaker says something to someone and the referee is included in the sentence.

Capitalisation also seems to be an issue here. Some uses of ‘I’ are not capitalised. In English, the first person singular ‘I’ needs to be capitalised at all time, both at the beginning of the sentence and in the sentence. In 50% of the ‘I’ incidents in this study, the first person singular pronoun ‘I’ is not capitalised in the middle of the sentence. A few examples can be found in:

(18) do u think i’m wasting my time ...
(19) *finally I know exactly what I want to do in my life*

(20) *And now I try hard to make it happen.*

(21) *Feels like a nightmare I wanna wake up.*

This echoes the early studies of computer-mediated communication when untidy sentence mechanics (punctuation, spelling and grammar) were commonly found (Baron: 2008).

Word for word translation

A number of word to word translations also occur in this study, as in:

(22) *what happen with you*

(23) *Distance cannot separate the friendship.*

Example (22) shows that the speaker directly translates the sentence from Indonesian to English. In Indonesian, it is correct to say:

iii  

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Apa yang terjadi dengan -mu?</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>[What happen with you?]</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

This particular example demonstrates that communicative norms of Indonesian have influenced the use of English by some Indonesians.

Furthermore, example (23) exhibits pragmatic context or background of the speaker affects his or her use of English. In Indonesian, it will be fine to say:

iv  

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Jarak tidak bisa memisahkan persahabatan.</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>[Distance cannot separate friendship.]</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

However, the English translation may not be correct. The speaker might mean ‘Distance cannot separate me and my best friends’ or ‘Distance cannot ruin friendship.’

Other grammatical mistakes

The following examples exhibit some broken grammatical rules:

(24) *there’s always be consequences you should face.*

(25) *is anyone here want to be a speaker in a seminar?*

The ‘be’ is often mistaken and sometimes used to replace the other auxiliary forms. In sentence (25), for example, instead of using ‘does’, the speaker writes ‘is’. It could be influenced by some early English language learning which usually teaches sentences that include ‘be’ in it such as present progressive tense (‘I am studying’). Other auxiliary forms are not often displayed. Thus, some learners might assume that ‘be’ could be applied in all contexts.
Another misuse of gerund is also found in:

(26) In every decision that you have decided, there’s always be consequences you should face. Either it would fail or nah, it depends on how wiser you live in it. Just trying your best, and God will gives his best too to everyone who can fight for it. Just trying your best ...

In sentence (26), ‘just trying your best’ is imperative and base form of the verb should be used instead of gerund. I would argue the present progressive tense which is usually taught in the early learning of English and has verb –ing in it has played a role in this kind of mistake.

The English users’ or speakers’ inability to use correct grammar (in the examples above) may not indicate that they do not have English knowledge at all. Rather, the knowledge which they gained while learning English at the early age (such as in primary school or early stages) may have constructed particular patterns. The particular patterns have been used repeatedly and applied in all contexts. It then created what we may call ‘broken English’. However, these norms seem to be understood by the other Indonesians as such mistakes do not interrupt the communication process.

Conclusion

The study shows frequent use of code-switching and English borrowing words among Indonesia users of Facebook. In some cases, code-switching is used to make better the meaning conveyed by the hearers. Some English words are more commonly used than the Indonesian translation.

The study also illustrates that the use of English among Indonesians is influenced by how colloquial Indonesian is used. The mistakes might reflect how some Indonesians combine their native language skills and knowledge of English. The pragmatic context and communicative norms of Indonesian also seem to play a role. Some ‘broken patterns’ of English have started to emerge. Still, these patterns of English are understood quite well among Indonesians and might have become ‘acceptable’.

We then may agree with the nature of English outside the Inner Circle countries as described by Jenkins:

just because a language item differs from the way it is produced by Inner Circle speakers, it cannot be assumed to be an error but maybe an example of contingent creativity and adaption, or even of a language contact and change in progress. (2015: pp. 41-42)

The mistakes found in this study may not necessarily show that the respondents are incapable of using English. In fact, it might indicate a new variety of Englishes in Indonesia, as the (Indonesian) speakers of English adapt their pragmatic contexts and communicative norms and create particular patterns. As the sample of this study is limited, broader
research especially in the spoken form of Indonesian-English variation needs to be conducted.

Acknowledgement
The author acknowledges support from Lembaga Pengelola Dana Pendidikan (LPDP) / Indonesia Endowment Fund for Education, Kemeterian Keuangan Republik Indonesia.

Reference


Lavia, N. (2007).*Kamus Istilah Gaul SMS*. Jakarta: Gagas Media


Mastuti, I. (2008).*Bahasa Baku vs Bahasa Gaul*. Jakarta: Hi-Fest


Appendix

The incidents of English borrowings and Indonesian-English code-switching, retrieved from my personal Facebook timeline:

[...]: translation; any names replaced by random alphabets

1. **LOL wkwkwkwk**

   [LOL (laughing)]

2. **Bus panjang dipake offroad? Ada di kampung saya ;)**

   [A long bus for off-roading? Yes, in my village ;)]

3. **Lomba fashion show kreasi daur ulang oleh designer nak smanse.**

   [Fashion show competition featuring recycled creations by students of SMANSES.]

4. **Monica’s assistants still on their hard-working and here stunning bride on the day … thank you for the trust on me crystal. Gown by @abc. Make up & hair do @def**

5. **Microsoft and US Embassy Jakarta’s invitation to empower women and to learn how to code. – I received price of Lumia 535 for coding, hahah in #WeSpeakCode as I have never expected and coincidentally as my early birthday present. Either have I expected that coding can be this Fun. Thank you Microsoft and @usembassyjakarta for the amazing program ...**

6. **Heaven!**

   *Penjelasan: Ind*mie rebus, bakso, siomay and bawang goreng (made in Indonesia).*

   [Explanation: instant noodles soup, meatball, dumplings and fried onion.]

   Thanks to abc

   *Hari terakhir Bcd di Tsukuba*

   [Last day of Bcd in Tsukuba]

   *Hari terakhir Mbak Cde sebelum packing hehe.*

   [Last day of Sister Cde before packing *grinning.]*

   Ah.. andai kalian gak harus pulang....

   [Ah. Wish you didn’t have to leave.]

7. **See you later DC!**

8. **Right brain work #imagine #brainwork #mind**

9. **Ini jadwal Lesmils launching di Jatomi Kuningan City. Open house nya seminggu lho, dari**
[This is the schedule of the launch of Lesmils in Jatomi, Kuningan City. The open house is held for a week, from ...]

tanggal 1 – 8 April. Silahkan merapat kemari !?!?

1 – 8 April. Feel free to come.]

(10) *It’s nice to see you again, Man! Anyone can bring us some Martabak? Lol*

(11) *Prior to taking off from Jakarta to Semarang.*

(12) *Wishing you all the best for your new post in Switzerland, Deputy Chief of Mission, Embassy of Japan in Jakarta Abc :D*

You left a great legacy through your upcoming book “Other Side of Japan” (get it soon at your nearest BCD stores!).

*We hope you can visit Indonesia soon, and perhaps be posted to Indonesia again as Ambassador :D*

(13) *Wess BB style ini langka.. Dijual apa adanya.. 295 Ribu pass, duit mau dipake sponsorship*

[Wow, this Blackberry phone is rare. Sold as the way it is. Fixed IDR 295, the money will be spent for sponsoring ... an event for children.]

(14) *Lesson I learned today “do good while you are able to do so, because kindness is all we need” thanks for the kindness today.*

(15) *Stretching in the morning is always a good way to start the class.*

(16) *Had a great time working on a special project in Surabaya and Malang for three weeks. A big thanks to friends, colleagues, and students who always welcome me in these cities. Get ready for another adventure in Banyuwangi before going back to Jakarta. Have a great weekend. Stay active, positive, and productive. #ExploringEastJava*

(17) *We’re just metres away from our destination eh keburu ujan. Neduh dulu lah.*

[but then it started to rain. Gotta find a shelter, then.]

(18) *Eating tortilla chips while watching the cutscenes from RE Revelations 2 since I could not play it ... 😊*

(19) *Pak, kalo mau ngemaki kita sebagai warga minoritas udah ga boleh pake kata ‘cina lu’ lagi*

[Sir, if you want to insult us as the minority group, you shouldn’t say ‘You, Cina’ anymore,
pak .. Lain kali kalo ngatain pake kata2 ‘tiongkok lu’ gitu ya pak.. Biar ga melanggar Sir .. Next time, you may insult us by saying ‘You Tiongkok, Sir.. So you won’t violate keputusan presiden taun 2014 lho pak .. Btw makasih atas dagelannya pak polisi, kita the 2014 President decree .. Btw, thanks for the joke, Mr. Policeman, we are bangga kalo punya kepolisian yang dicap sebagai terjelek sedunia. At least punya proud that our police department is acknowledged as the worst in the world. At least we have achievement lah ...

an achievement ...

(20) Distance can’t separate the friendship.

(21) Kuliah lagi ah ke Cina #lol

[Going to school again in China #lol]

(22) Selamat ulang tahun, FGM! Here’s a proper cake for your birthday.

[Happy birthday, FGM! …]

(23) Dad,,,,,do u think i’m wasting my time doing things i wanna do?

I know u worried about me, but it hurts when u disapprove at all So,,,Please trust me,,,e verything was more difficult when u didn’t trust me..... Did u know Dad,, finally i know exactly what i want to do in my life,, And now i try hard to make it happen. . .

(24) I just ate a stingray fish but I forgot to take a picture of it. It was soooooo yummy. I’ll have more stingray tomorrow... hahahaha.. I love this place. Can I live here forever??

(25) This how you learn to drive at driving school

(26) In every decision that you have decided, there’s always be consequences you should face. Either it would fail or nah, it depends on how wiser you live in it. Just trying your best, and God will gives his best too to everyone who can fight for it.

(27) Happy birthday my dearest husband Abc ..... terima kasih selalu menjadi suami dan ayah[thanks for always being a great husband and father …
yang baik bagi kami ....... <3 <3 kiss kiss bunda n’ Naila for us.]


I still can't believe u gone. Feels like a nightmare i wanna wake up. Farewell and rest in peace my friend

Sekarang whatsapp-web sudah bisa untuk firefox dan opera.

[Now I can access Whatsapp-web from firefox and opera.]

I can ditch my disk-consuming chrome now

Good morniiiing, mari sarapan 😊

[let’s have breakfast]

Do you wanna see XYZ was playing with her friend, come on check this out ...

Saya happy!!!

[I’m happy!!!]

Saya bersyukur!!!

[I’m grateful!!!]

God is Good to Me

My favorite kacang... 😊

[My favorite peanut.]

How I can escape from you... ( Thanks Ka Ika Puspita what you’ve done to me )

No way saya akan membeli KAOS di atas 50rb..

[No way I will buy a T-shirt for more than IDR 50000.]

Thanks for the lesson. Again about not to put unnecessary burden on our kids (#4). Let them enjoy their childhood.

Do you realize bahwa bagaimana cara kita memandang dunia itu nyeplak dari ibu kita?

[that the way we see the world is modelled from our mother?]

Poinnya adalah kalo kita mau majuin bangsa ini ......

[The point is that if we want to develop this nation ...]

Ayo rame-rame nonton Film Indonesia! Sebarkan informasi ini dengan mengklik tombol

[Let’s watch Indonesian films! Share this information by clicking ...

“bagikan” atau “share”

“share”]
In the early morning my Mom was in garage. She prepared herself for going to traditional market. From the garage, she saw a stranger wanted to enter our home ... I totally woke up and saw from my room’s window ... It was weird when someone approached your home without say hello or permission ...

In a recent time you have told a strange story abc.. what happen with u

is anyone here want to be a speaker in a seminar? The topic is about dollar currency against rupiahs. need some favor here!

Just share, no words to say... love our moment

I am going to sell my car in Jakarta ... Interested PM ya. Thanks

Mau pulang dr sekolah, tapi keretanya delay kn gangguan teknis.

[On the way back from school, the train was delayed because of technical problems ...]

Disitu saya kadang merasa sedih.
That’s when I feel sad ...

I wish I could apparate right now, just like thewiches and wizards in Harry Potter 😊

Guys, besok jangan lupa launching yaaa!!
[don’t forget the launch (of our event0 tomorrow!!]

I wanna have baby

I got red shoes, Red Hoodie, Red Iphone case from abc. I still want a red watch and today i wore red dress for my presentation :D Ah ya.. I ate red grape ...
Structuralism in Eastern Indonesia: An Origin for a Theory in the Social Sciences

Yancey Orr and Raymond I. Orr

Biodata: Yancey Orr is an anthropologist at the University of Queensland.

Biodata: Raymond I. Orr is a political scientist at the University of Melbourne.

Abstract

Structuralism in anthropology is often attributed to Claude Lévi-Strauss and the ethnography of Amazonian tribes. Over a decade before Lévi-Strauss first published on the subject, the publication of van Wouden's Sociale Structuurtypen in de Groote Oost in 1935 inspired a robust program of structuralist ethnographic studies in eastern Indonesia that has only recently slowed down. This article examines the key structuralist insights from ethnographies in Nusa Tenggara to demonstrate an alternative origin of one of anthropology's most important theories and the contribution that this part of Indonesia has made to social science and the study of culture.

Keywords: Structuralism, Nusa Tenggara, Leiden School, Asymmetric Connubium

Introduction

Structuralism is often attributed to the linguistic theory of Ferdinand de Saussure or the myth and kinship analysis of Claude Lévi-Strauss. Over a decade before The Elementary Structures of Kinship (1949), Dutch colonial officials and anthropologists called the “Leiden School” developed a type of social analysis that could be categorized as structuralist. Though J.P.B. de Josselin de Jong was the central figure of the Leiden School because of his direct links to French and German traditions (Otterspeer 1989, pp. 307), it was his student, Van Wouden, who best codified this brand of structuralism in his Social Structure in Eastern Indonesia (1968 [1935]). The Leiden School held the view that all “social phenomena are formerly rooted in the totality of culture” (van Wouden 1968; pp. 1) and used ethnographic evidence to demonstrate the nature of this totality. According to van Wouden and other Leiden Eastern Indonesianists, the totality of culture sprang from kinship and marriage rules which were the organizing principles of society, thought, art, mythology, belief, material culture, et omnia. In van Wouden’s introduction to Social Structure in Eastern Indonesia (1968 [1935]), their ambitious view of the explanatory power of marriage is succinctly explained:

We hope to be able to show that this marriage custom [originally cross-cousin, but then an asymmetric marriage alliance emerged as the important category]\(^{13}\) is the pivot on which turns the activity of the social groups, the clans. The scheme of social categories thus found serves as the model for an

\(^{13}\) The insertion is my own and not the translators.
all-embracing classification. Cosmos and human society are organized in the same way, and through this there emerges the essential interconnection and similarity of the human and the cosmic. (pp. 2)

The novel insight and ethnographic discovery that launched structuralism in anthropology before Lévi-Strauss was the asymmetric marriage alliance, or as it is known in Dutch and French anthropology, the *asymmetric connubium* of Eastern Indonesia (Fox 1980, pp. 5). In this article, I will refer to the asymmetric marriage alliance as the asymmetric marriage system because “system” suggests the degree to which it influences symbolic meaning and structural patterning beyond marriage alliances. As I have elaborated in my essay on the household, the basic law of the asymmetric marriage system is that group \(a\) take wives from group \(b\) who take wives from group \(c\) who take wives from group \(a\) (appendix: figure 2). The discovery of this type of social structure was the most influential structuralist work in anthropology from the Leiden School (van Wouden 1935; deJong 1951; Lévi-Strauss 1949) and had a strong influence on Lévi-Strauss. Although it is a precursor to a theory of culture that certain sections of modern anthropology used to analyze culture with from approximately 1960 to 1985, it originated in what now seems like the archaic attempt to show the development of patrilineality out of matrilineality in the social evolution of man (Fox 1980, pp.4). Though the impetus may have been from another epoch, van Wouden’s structuralism and theory of culture gave creative energy to structuralist studies in this part of Southeast Asia which is broadly described as Eastern Indonesia. However, what van Wouden and others describe as “Eastern Indonesia” is more appropriately defined as the Lesser Sunda Islands and the South Moluccas (appendix: figure 1). This being said, I will continue the tradition of referring to the Lesser Sunda Island and the South Moluccas as Eastern Indonesia for the sake of simplicity and continuity.

The enthusiasm of van Wouden’s claim that the pivot on which culture turns is marriage, and thus kinship organization, started a zealous program that at times came close to a form of ideologically induced *apophenia*. However, those holding to a unifying theory of symbols have investigated many forms of Eastern Indonesian culture with interesting results. I will start by describing the asymmetric marriage system because it is credited with shaping the other elements of the social world and was the most significant contribution from this region for the discipline of anthropology as a whole. Next, I will examine how structuralism has studied the expressions of this ordering in: a) the house; b) the village; c) ritual exchange; d) language; and e) textiles.

---

14 I have cited the original dates and not the publication dates of the English translations to show that asymmetric marriage alliances were the subject of incipient structuralism.

15 Their structural analyses rightfully exclude the complex wet rice societies of the island of Sulawesi and the Province of West Papua (the Melanesian Zone) that comprise the vast majority of the land and people of Eastern Indonesia but are not part of the system orientated around asymmetric marriage alliance (see figure 1). Though East Timor is not part politically of Indonesia, it falls in this cultural grouping.
Asymmetric marriages

Asymmetric marriage, according to structuralists, does more than combine reproductive units in prescribed ways. Lévi-Strauss (1963) claimed that asymmetric marriages resulted in symbolic systems of “concentric dualism.” This differs from the more common “reciprocal dualism” or “diametric dualism” of exchange or moiety systems (Errington 1987). Defining marriage and kinship in the context of houses creates a condition in which one can only marry through the relation of their house (in East Sumba class is also relevant). This is unlike in Western Indonesia, where households are less coherent structures and one can marry according to one’s status but that status is not completely defined by one’s house. Societies that preference the material and moral relationships between “houses” through generations over the relationships among people within a generation, have been traditionally called a “house society” (Lévi-Strauss 1982). East Sumba fits this category and Eastern Indonesia was one of the places that inspired this conceptual categorization.

At a tangible level, marriage rules also create different forms in which people are socially defined. Shelly Errington (1987) demonstrated how marriage rules in Western Indonesia created sets of siblings (cousins and distant cousins) who are marriageable or not depending on specific idioms of taboo. Social siblings, who may be similar or not in age, are of the same generation within a kinship system (their extended uncles and aunts were siblings at the same number of generations). Under this system, people cannot marry outside of their sibling set because their offspring could not properly be placed into a generational grouping or having a sibling set of their own. However, in asymmetric marriage systems, people are not defined by generational associations, but through house relations; thus, they can marry vertically between what could be described as generations (pp. 411). This means that there are two fundamentally different ways in which people relate to their social world and are constituted by it. Society in a house society with the asymmetric marriage system, instead of being sliced into generations of siblings, which are better described as cousins, is vertically separated between households that span generations.

There is a much more encompassing and profound approach to the asymmetric marriage systems that has implications for the entire structure of reality according to certain theorists. According to Lévi-Strauss (1971), Fox (1980), Adams (1980), Kuiper (1987), Keane (1994) and Errington (1987), asymmetric marriage systems reflect a different type of the universal expression of dyadic oppositions through symbols. Instead of diving straight into the implications of the theory, I will present how asymmetric marriage systems are different than symmetric ones while they also deal with some similar dyadic opposition. In an asymmetric marriage system, male and female siblings begin as opposite yet complementary sets within the household. This unity is broken when sisters are moved from their natal homes to those of the wife-takers. They are replaced with someone else’s sisters from the wife-givers. This may appear to be a similar dynamic if people either exchanged women between groups or practiced another form of exogamous/endogamous marriage.
system. It is different in this regard. Though the original unity is temporarily broken and then temporarily mended, it is ultimately reconciled three generations later (or more depending upon how many households participate). If a gives wives to b then in the next generation b will give a’s granddaughter c will then in the generation after that c will give a’s great-granddaughter back to the men of a. The unity of the womb becomes complementary opposites in brother and sister siblings who are then rearranged within one generation and ultimately united in three (see top part of figure 2).

This type of marriage system orders, or reflects an order, of symbolic systems in several ways. It makes notions of original unity, intermittent separation, and ultimate unification central themes of society and it gives the cosmos a more sublimated form of binary opposition. Lévi-Strauss, as I mentioned earlier, the asymmetric marriage system creates a “concentric dualism” rather than the more common “diametric dualism” found in moiety exchange systems (see the opposition between circles in figure 2). The society and cosmos are unconsciously constructed as the outer circle. The inner circle is the person, couple or house. In the asymmetric marriage process, the house through the person of its daughter, contacts the outer circle, but through the process of asymmetric marriage, the great-granddaughter returns back to the house (the red arrows in figure 2). “The flow of life,” as James Fox called it (1980), has its headwaters in the house but life flows out to society but then ultimately return back to the house. The conception of cosmos and society in a moiety system is that of diametric dualism where the essential relationship is not between micro and macrocosm regulated by a flow out, then around, and finally back in, but one of opposition that is overcome in a different manner or not at all (Lévi-Strauss 1973; Downes 2003). Moreover, hierarchy is a natural result of concentric dualism because the outer circle (the social world) only exists in its relation to the inner circle (the house), which is closer to the cosmic and biological center of conception (Lévi-Strauss 1963, pp. 140). Though there exists hierarchy and a “spiraling flow”16 of people and objects back into the house, duality still exists (examples of duality are boxed in the bottom of figure 2) and the concentric system is a means by which that duality is only managed and reordered but never fully overcome.

The apparent overcoming of separation through the flow of the asymmetric marriage system has hidden consequences for the structural ordering of the cosmos at an even more abstract level. First of all, the duality of male and female (and of all things) remains at fundamental levels. Just as importantly, there are now three different symbolic systems through which the cosmos is understood: a) unity; b) duality; and c) the asymmetrical triadic relationship between wife-givers and wife-takers (Lévi-Strauss 1973, Adams 1980, Downes 2003) (the bottom half of figure 2). The following are examples of how social structure and symbolism in Eastern Indonesia have been understood as

---

16 A spiral seems to be the most accurate representation of the flow from the outer-world back into the inner-world but I have yet to see it used as a metaphor in this context.
expressing these structural unities and oppositions modeled off of the asymmetric marriage system. They express the importance of dualistic systems of metaphor, the pairing of complementary yet opposition concepts, triadic divisions and the rearrangement of all these orderings of reality.

House and island

Physical aspects of the house (not the household) have been interpreted several times by structuralists in Eastern Indonesia. Though the house can be read symbolically, I can see little evidence from these analyses that succinctly demonstrates that the specific asymmetric marriage systems with its concentric dualism explains its underlying structure or terminology of the house. Likely many Eastern Indonesian cultures, the Savunese who live on the island of Savu approximately 100 km east of Sumba, have a set of metaphors linking the social and physical world. They have a double system of metaphors which are both complementary and opposing about the landscape and house (Kana 1980). The island is spoken about and referenced with both aspects of a body and a ship. The island has a head, mouth, tongue and tail (Kana, pp. 222). The Savunese also refer to it as a ship with a bow where hilly and stern where flat and rudder where mountainous (ibid, pp. 223).

The house should follow this pattern because when placed on an east-west axis facing west making it is metaphorically “sweet”—a desirable state according to the Savunese. If a house does not follow this prescription, it is believed to be cursed. The only constructions built on a north-south axis are graves for those who died in ways contrary to the natural order such as drowning, being struck by lightning, committing suicide, or falling from the important lontar palm (ibid, pp. 225). Such deaths, and the tombs for the victims, are called “salty”. Elements of the house share both ship and body names. Houses have tails and heads as well as hulls and masts (ibid, pp. 228). The theme of unity and division expressed in kinship terms and marriage arrangements finds form in the division of the house between male and female. Women are associated with the part of the house that is dark and in the back. It is either the area where guests do not visit or an area that is literally dark such as the attic where women’s goods such as cloth and food are storied (ibid, pp. 229).

Village

The metaphor of the ship extends to the organization of the village. I will use Moni Adams’s *Symbols of the Organized Community in East Sumba, Indonesia* (1974) instead of the example from Savu because of the greater detail and symbolic cohesion of the example and further analysis. In East Sumba the ship is paired with the tree instead of the body but there remains the dual metaphor pattern in Eastern Indonesia (Fox 1971, Lévi-Strauss 1963, van Wouden 1968). Adams analyzed the ritual village of *Paraingu Bakulu* (Big Capital City) of the

17 Flat and hilly has no necessarily geometric relations to shape of the bow or stern of a ship. Kana and the Savunese do not explain why there is this connection.
Kapunduku inhabiting the highlands of East Sumba. The village is only occupied during the dry season and for certain ceremonies (Adams 1974, pp. 328). The migration pattern, which may also be a case of transhumance, reflects the concentric dualism because uma live in their private dwellings for most of the year but return to the social world in the form of the ritual capital each year to perform their specific functions for communal ceremonies.

The ritual village layout is that of an oval (the middle sketch in figure 3 from Adams 1974) divided lengthwise into three sections named corresponding to the terms used to describe the sections of a ship (ibid, pp. 332). The symbolic sides of the village are given the same name as they are in the ship and “warrior” uma live at the edges with the “priest” uma stay in the center. This creates a trinity, dualism and symmetry within the village (see the middle of figure 3). The large wooden poles, depending on the specific ceremony, are referred to as either masts of a ship or branches of a tree (ibid, pp. 333). Dualism exists within the unit of the ship-tree-village. Houses line two sides of the courtyard facing one another creating another form of symmetry. The two lines of houses are conceptualized as houses of the morning side and houses of the afternoon side and they have complementary and opposing ritual functions (ibid, pp. 327). Offerings are also divided into the categories of natural and man-made which can either be defined as cooked and raw or natural fruit and constructed images of fruit that are associated with the ultimate duality of male and female (Friedberg 1980). Typically food offerings are hung from the symbolic tree or forked pole at the center of the village. Offerings of man-made objects themselves are further divided between masculine and feminine in metal and cloth respectively and placed at the village altar associated with the rudder of a ship (Adams 1974, pp.333).

**Ritual exchange**

Though Lévi-Strauss, Fox, van Wouden, Adams and Errington contend that concentric dualism places exchange within an overarching cosmic flow where exchange has a less vivid hold on the ordering of the world, exchange still exists if only momentarily in the context of the whole system. Women, things and animals are exchanged in marriage ceremonies and men and marapu (spirits/ancestors) exchange the same things for blessings. The exchange between men and spirits sometimes takes place during wedding ceremonies while at other times concurrently with crop harvests or sowing. Webb Keane uses the dualism pattern of Eastern Indonesia to explain ceremonial and sacrificial offerings and blessings between men and spirits (Keane 1994). Keane extended the duality from within similar substances such as women/men, sunset/sunrise or natural/manmade, to between what are generally considered different substances such as words and things. Whether or not this is keeping

---

18 In West Sumba these trees often were the places were skulls taken from captives were hung. The term “skull tree” is used to describe the dead tree or collection of branches pointing toward the sky that are found in villages throughout Sumba. However their association with skulls should likely be limited to West Sumba though it is applied throughout Sumba.
with the tradition of duality in Eastern Indonesia is debatable, but by doing so, he gives a unique analysis of sacrifice and how it has changed in West Sumba.

Keane noticed that Calvinist missionaries during the 1980s in West Sumba had emphasized, as they did during the Reformation, that words do not have power in and of themselves and objects, specifically offerings, are not mystical (see Keane’s Christian Moderns (2007) for a thorough analysis of this process). Where Calvinists were successful, ritual sacrifices of buffalo at marriage ceremonies were conducted without ritual words and became only means of feeding the wedding guests making it a variation of a barbeque. This transformation did not go unnoticed by older Sumbanese at the event who were distraught because the spirits did not receive their sacrifice because they can only understand ritualized speech (Keane 1994, pp. 607). Similarly, prayers made to the spirits (or God) in a church without offerings leave the spirits hungry and unsatisfied. As with other dualities in Eastern Indonesia, words and things are connected to other dualisms. The art of verbal expression, which is highly stylized in pre-existing matching couplets, is the domain of men while textiles, the major visual art in Eastern Indonesia, it associated with women. Though some masculine items are exchanged such as swords and gold, the most common and quintessential item exchanged with other men during marriage ceremonies or spirits during funerals are textiles (Keane 1994; Forshee 2000; Adams 1969; Hoskins 1989).

Language

Ritualized speech is an integral part of exchange between communities and routinely used for communal activities like the building of a house or harvests in Eastern Indonesia. The most common pattern of ritual speech is in the form of rhyming couplets in which the second line complements the meaning of the first. James Fox described couplets in Roti, an island east of Sumba, as language in which “semantic elements comprise prescribed dyadic sets; these sets are structured in formulaic phrases; and as a result, composition generally consists in production of parallel poetic lines” (1971, pp. 215). Couplet speech was generally known by most adult members of the community though only certain men perform them. In West Sumba, the Weyewa have a couplet about the act of performing couplets which will serve as my example: “The complete sets of eyes; the paired sets of lips” to be followed on certain occasions with “because of them, I blow my flute; because of them, I pluck my guitar” (Kuipers1998, pp.6).19 Though couplets are a common form of ritual speech and poetry, the vast number of couples, (3100 were found in East Sumba)20 and the broad contexts in which they are used, has been used as evidence for the expression of the unity of asymmetric duality in Eastern Indonesia (Errington 1989).

19 Completeness/paired & eyes/lips hints at the asymmetrical complementarity between speaker and listener and inter-sensory perception. Blow/pluck & flute/guitar suggests the harmonic coordination of different actions.
Textiles

As previously mentioned, textiles are the dominant visual art in Eastern Indonesia. In Kambera, the language of East Sumba, “cloth” is categorized as banda la uma meaning “goods of the house” which are feminine and contrasted with banda la marada “goods of the field” which are masculine (Adams 1969). The asymmetric unity between the male speech and female cloth is also expressed in the words for weaving and ritual speech used in negotiating marriages. The word wunangu means both the wooden heddle used to push layers of cloth together and the representatives of the marriage groups who must speak in couplets during negotiations. Additionally, a woman’s planning of the design of a textile, called pahamburungu, is also the term used when arranging exchanges of only material (Adams 1980, pp. 213).

Aside from how the cloth was produced and its association with gender, it expresses the elements of the asymmetric marriage system in its formal composition. The textile design contains both dyadic and triadic elements (see figure 3; bottom). The composition is broken into three sections using two elements (facing-animals, ovals, facing-animals). This also fits the pattern of the village-ship broken into three sections corresponding to the three categories of an Austronesian boat in which the front and back are called the same things because they are extended out of the water while the middle is closer to it (see figure 3; top). Within each side tiles, the animals or trees face one another. This breaks down the bilateral symmetry within that section (see figure 4) when the cloth is held horizontally. However, the textile is a hinggi, which is draped over the shoulder and diagonally attached to the opposite hip. When viewed on the wearing from the front and back as it is intended to be, it presents the same image regardless of perspective. Within the animal tiles there still remains that confrontational duality of the animals which is a near universal motif in East Sumba (bottom of figure 4). According to Adams (1969), the formal patterning in textiles represents the triadic, symmetric and asymmetric dyadic relationships, and unity both as a whole and within oppositions, that comprise the symbolic ordering of the universe from the asymmetric marriage system (see figures 2, 3 and 4).

Conclusion

There are three overarching insights from the structuralist studies of Eastern Indonesia. Firstly, culture as a totalized system of symbols shaping every aspect of social phenomena was first developed within anthropology in the Leiden School from studies of Eastern Indonesia. Secondly, the type of marriage arrangements structured other cultural forms that altered society. Finally, the asymmetric marriage system was an alternative ordering of reality creating different forms of concepts about how the world was ordered: concentric dualism, symmetric dualism, asymmetric dualism, triadic relations and unity between and among these concepts. The metaphors of ships, trees and bodies (all containing bilateral symmetry) were used in cultural media such as speech, houses, villages and rituals. Just as importantly for structuralism and insightful for anthropology, cultural formations in Eastern
Indonesia also expressed the varying types and levels of symbolic opposition and unity that according so some, lies at the core of human individual and social experience.

Reference


Appendices

Figure 1: “Eastern Indonesia”; Lesser Sundas and the South Moluccas

![Map of Eastern Indonesia and Lesser Sundas](image-url)
Figure 2: Asymmetric Marriage System and Types of Structural Relationships House/Uma A Perspective

Notice that the types of symbols: unity, duality and trinity have their own unifying yet triadic relationship.
Figure 3: Triadic patterning
“Au ume ma au ena”: my house and my mother

An investigation of environmental health and the traditional use of the *ume kbubu* in relation to maternal and neonatal mortality conditions in South Central Timor

Nicholas Metherall, Jauhari Effendi, Geoff Dews, Sandra Frans, Willhelmus Mella, Jimmy Pello, Claudya Dhaja, Ananias Besh

**Biodata:** Nicholas Metherall completed his honours at La Trobe University through a joint cooperation program with the University of Nusa Cendana in Kupang, West Timor and the University of Cenderawasih in Jayapura, Papua. He was the chief researcher for this research project which was conducted through internship with the Australia-Indonesia Partnership for Maternal and Neonatal Health (AIPMNH). His wider research interests are in environment studies, international development and climate change resilience. Nick's contact email is nicholas.metherall@gmail.com

**Biodata:** Jauhari Effendi is supervising lecturer in the Postgraduate Environmental Health study program at the University of Nusa Cendana. Jauhari provided content and literature on his area of environmental health and human settlements. His contact email is jafe64@yahoo.co.id

**Biodata:** Geoff Dews is an adjunct lecturer with the Global Change Institute at the University of Queensland. Geoff is a practitioner working in developing countries with expertise in the application of project interventions for climate change adaptation through the use of ecosystem based management approaches. This is supported with his expertise in international development, natural resource management, climate change resilience and food security. His contact email is dews@ozemail.com.au

**Biodata:** Sandra Frans is a Masters of public health student at the University of Melbourne, focusing on women’s health and social science. She used to work as a general practitioner at Puskesmas Kota Soe (health clinic) in East Nusa Tenggara. She obtained her bachelor’s degree in medicine from Brawijaya University in Malang, Indonesia. Her contact email is sandrafrans1988@gmail.com

**Biodata:** Wellhelmus Mella is a lecturer at the University of Nusa Cendana’s Postgraduate School in the Agriculture study program area. Wellhelmus comes from South Central Timor and was able to share his contextual expertise and connect us with the Bupati and the communities of Timor. His area of expertise includes soil science and local traditional knowledge or *kearifan local*. His contact email is welhelmus.mella@gmail.com

**Biodata:** Jimmy Pello is a lecturer at the University of Nusa Cendana Postgraduate School in the law study program. Jimmy provided readings related to South Central Timor’s culture and his area of expertise: environmental law and policy. His contact email is jimmypello@yahoo.co.id
**Biodata:** Claudya Dhaja is a Bachelors candidate at the University of Nusa Cendana who was also a research assistant in this project. She assisted in the editing process. Her area of study is veterinary medicine – her contact email is claudyadhaja@gmail.com

**Biodata:** Ananias Besh holds a Bachelors degree in English Education from Artha Wacana Christian University in Kupang. He was born and raised in rural South Central Timor in kecamatan Niki-Niki. Ananias helped as field work assistant. His contact email is ananiasbees@ymail.com

**Acknowledgments**
The authors deeply appreciate the comments provided by the reviewers whose feedback and advice was adopted to make some substantial improvements on this article. The work of IJIS head editor, Yacinta Kurniasih, whose tireless efforts have made this publication possible. Thanks also to editors Matthew Piscioneri and Elisabet Titik Murtisari for their edits. Gratitude is also felt towards IJIS for creating a platform which enables us to form these multi-disciplinary teams of researchers from both Indonesia and Australia. Thanks should also be shared with the staff of the Australia Indonesia Partnership for Maternal and Neonatal Health (AIPMNH). This research was further enabled through the generous help of the communities of the villages of Nusa, Supul and Boti and the town of Soe who welcomed us into their homes and shared their stories and experiences with us.

**Abstract**
Using data from focus discussion groups gathered through field work, this paper examines key environmental health conditions across three specific rural and remote village communities in South Central Timor. Through a mixed methods approach, this study attempts to shed light on identified information gaps relating to maternal and neonatal health. The study adopts an environmental health framework which examines five main factors: these factors include access to clean water, draining, sanitation, management of rubbish, as well as access to roads and health facilities. Local community focus discussion groups across the three sample villages all identified access to clean water as the most important factor in relation to public health. Adequate draining was commonly ranked second most important largely due to the environmental health impacts of floods and contamination of water sources. Through a participatory research approach, the use of the traditional grass thatch hut granary or ume kbubu was also identified as a key focal point of this study. The process of panggang, a customary resting process for mothers and newborns within the ume kbubu was examined. The study found that in the past, the use of the ume kbubu as a resting place for mothers and their newborns has provided warmth and traditional medicinal benefits. However, the effects of the fire and smoke inside the well-insulated ume kbubu may also be perceived as a risk to maternal and neonatal health. No qualitative links were drawn between the use of the ume kbubu and perceptions of adverse health outcomes among community groups. The authors recommend further more detailed empirical investigations of environmental health conditions and the use of the ume kbubu in maternal and neonatal health in more remote villages.

**Keywords:** Environmental health, South Central Timor, maternal and neonatal health, ume kbubu, panggang, Dawan.
Introduction

This study examines community perspectives towards 5 factors of environmental health as well as the role of the *ume kbubu* traditional hut in the context of maternal and neonatal health challenges. Indonesia has the highest maternal mortality rate in South East Asia. Approximately 228 women die for every 100,000 live births (AIPMNH, 2016). In disadvantaged and peripheral provinces in Eastern Indonesia, the rates are more extreme (AIPMNH, 2016). This is demonstrated through data from the Central Bureau of Statistics (BPS NTT, 2013, pp. 152-155). In the Eastern Indonesian province of Nusa Tenggara Timur (NTT), the death rate is 306 women per 100,000 live births (BPS NTT, 2013, pp. 152-155). Neonatal mortality in NTT is also extremely high, at 3100 deaths per 100,000 live births (AIPMNH, 2016). Data from the NTT provincial Bureau of Statistics further highlights South Central Timor as the district with the highest number of infant deaths for 2012 with a total of 125 deaths (BPS NTT, 2013, pp. 152-155).

In 2012, TTS’ neonatal mortality reached 1.35% (BPS NTT, 2013, pp. 152-155). Most of these deaths were attributed to malnourishment, asphyxiation and infection (BPS NTT, 2013, pp. 152-155). Notably, a concerning 16.13% of the neonatal deaths in TTS: 15 deaths out of a total of 93 throughout 2012 were categorized as resulting from ‘other’ reasons (BPS NTT, 2013, pp. 152-155). This is a dilemma as it highlights a lack of detail in investigating the causes of neonatal death. Deaths placed within the category of ‘other’ may also may have greater likelihood of being easily preventable deaths. This investigation seeks to shed light on this previously unclear area relating to the underlying ‘other’ causes of maternal and neonatal mortality. In doing so, the study adopts an environmental health framework which is strengthened through a participatory research method. The role of traditional housing is also explored within the study. In particular, the function of the *panggang* process which involves mothers staying in the traditional *ume kbubu* huts for 40 days after child birth (Kause, 2013). In the past, this has become a particularly controversial issue. The debated use of the *ume kbubu* has come to symbolize a wider clash between external government intervention for modernization and local traditional customs and belief systems.

The conceptual framework used within this paper relates to environmental health and protection. This concept provides a more concrete understanding of the real life applications of environmental health. Environmental health and protection is defined as:

the art and science of protecting against environmental factors that may adversely impact human health or the ecological balances essential to long-term human health and environmental quality. Such factors include, but are not limited to: air, food and water contaminants; radiation; toxic chemicals; disease vectors; safety hazards; and habitat alterations. (Gordon 2006).

Environmental health conditions in Indonesia have suffered over the past decades. This pattern has been analysed in ‘Indonesia Betrayed: How Development Fails’, Elizabeth Collins
Paundralinga (2009) further highlights how the formative economic push of the New Order regime shaped the environmental health predisposition of Indonesia. The structural adjustments and liberalization of Indonesia were successful not only in increasing working class poverty and overexploitation of labour. They were also effective in creating a culture of environmental degradation through overexploitation, deforestation, and weak enforcement of environmental regulations such as draining, sanitation, and waste and rubbish management. The resulting government culture has consistently chosen industrialization over environmental protection and promotion of social welfare and public health (Paundralinga, 2009).

We begin our paper with a brief literature review outlining past relevant academic papers. Here we have identified a gap. There are a lack of studies which investigate these ‘other causes’ for maternal and neonatal mortality in South Central Timor. Research on the *ume kbubu* also remains limited. We have found even fewer studies which have adopted participatory research approaches which involve local communities in the shaping of the direction and questions asked within the research. The remainder of the paper is structured as follows: section 2 outlines three of the key background concepts including development gaps in Indonesia, environmental health conditions in South Central Timor ad the role of the *ume kbubu*. Section 3 outlines the research method including the field work structure and the paper’s environmental health framework. Section 4 covers the results of the research and field work including the focus group discussions and participatory statistics.

**Literature review**

There have been a number of international reports which have assessed environmental health conditions in East Timor. Ardhikary (2002) in the report for the World Health Organisation has identified both water management and sanitation as key historic issues in East Timor. However, there have not yet been equivalent reports analyzing health conditions in South Central Timor (TTS). In addressing this gap, the paper provides a characterization of the environmental health conditions within a small sample of villages in TTS.

There are a range of studies on traditional housing in South Central Timor. Situmeang (2013), in her Masters thesis, provides a deep and insightful account of the primary use of the *ume kbubu* as a granary and kitchen. This is an important aspect of food security in TTS. In relation to the impact of the *ume kbubu* grass thatch hut on maternal and neonatal health, past literature yields more mixed results. Most controversial, is the role of *panggang*. The debate regarding the use of the *ume kbubu* for *panggang* processes has already come to symbolize a clash between local traditional belief and external government interventions for ‘healthy homes’ (Windi and Whittaker, 2012). Reports from external and national government agencies have argued for greater intervention measures to reduce the use of *ume kbubu* for traditional *panggang* processes (Soerachman and Wiryawan, 2013; Athena and Soerachman, 2014). One such paper identifies correlations between the use of
ume kbubu for panggang and the occurrence of Respiratory Acute Infection (ISPA) on babies (Budiyono, 2004). However, none of these papers involve in-depth or long-term medical trails to provide sufficient evidence of causation between the use of the ume kbubu and panggang processes and resultant negative health outcomes.

In contrast to the external reports, are ethnographic studies which identify intrinsic cultural value within the use of the ume kbubu (Windi and Whittaker, 2012). This ethnographic approach examines the cultural and traditional beliefs of the Dawan people of Timor. Drawing on this ethnographic approach, this paper further highlights the dichotomy and controversy surrounding the role of the ume kbubu. Windi and Whittaker (2012) finds that the ume kbubu is fundamental to the “Dawan's sense of psychosocial well-being and ethnic identity.” While the ume kbubu represents indigenous identity, modern houses or healthy ‘rumah sehat’ are associated with prosperity, public image, social status and external interventions imposed by the state. However, as Windi and Whittaker (2012) argue, this modernity does not provide the “warmth, security and emotional nurturance” that the Dawan perceive as necessary for optimum health and to protect them from disease. Indeed, warmth is a key factor identified by Nugrahaeni & Suwantara (2012). Their scientific study finds that the architectural design of the ume kbubu significantly improves thermal performance retaining heat and temperatures of approximately 24.6 degrees Celsius in the rainy season and 27.6 degrees in the dry season.

Papers from local researchers from Timor should also be considered. One example is a research paper from the local Universitas Kristen Artha Wacana (Kause, 2013). This paper demonstrates the important contributions of local researchers as these people often hold a greater contextual knowledge including an understanding of local cultural and historical factors. The paper from UKAW defines the ume kbubu as part of a family's home. This means that only people who possess blood ties are permitted free entry and exit of the ume kbubu. Thus local researchers identify the ume kbubu as an important possession not only of the household and family but also of the Dawan people and culture itself.

There is a clear diversity of perspectives within the literature and policy areas surrounding these maternal and neonatal health issues. Some have even likened this diversity of perspectives to a clash of ideas. McWilliam (1999) suggests that the relationship between indigenous peoples of West Timor and the Indonesian state reflects an ongoing tension inherent across Indonesia between local ‘traditional practice’ and authority and the ‘modern’ ideological prescriptions and administrative powers of the national government. As a result, this paper contributes to a wider discourse surrounding debates about the devaluing of local traditions and imposition of centralized policies within a discourse of public health interventions.
Development gaps

This next section discusses three main contextual factors related to the local issues of maternal and neonatal health: firstly the development gaps within Indonesia, secondly the environmental health conditions in South Central Timor and thirdly, a deeper investigation of the traditional use of the *ume kbubu*.

Within Indonesia there are dramatic development and health service gaps. This disparity can be found between various cores and peripheries. Commonly highlighted in the wider literature is a clear urban-rural gap, see studies from Makowiecka K (2008), Erlyana E (2011). The gap between the rich and poor is widened through vast income disparities which are seen throughout Indonesia; see Budi Utomo (2011) and Suryadarma D (2006). Perhaps most troubling is the vast inter-provincial development gap (UNICEF 2012).

Across the 33 provinces of Indonesia the province of NTT generally faces more difficult public health conditions (UNICEF, 2012): lower government revenues, higher rates of poverty, and poor health indicators (AIPMNH, 2008). There are also a range of health system constraints such as dysfunctional referral systems, poor quality and low numbers of key health workforce, as well as poor governance, weak accountability to clients and communities and a range of other problems (AIPMNH, 2008). These difficult conditions are further exacerbated by complicated environmental factors such as droughts, floods and environmental health degradation. The cumulative impact of these factors further adds to the prevailing disadvantage, structural inequality and stigma which separate the diverse provinces of Eastern Indonesia from core Indonesia.

In a context of such diversity and inequality it becomes increasingly difficult to implement wide-scale government health interventions. Nationwide studies, blanket policies and interventions are unlikely to be able to pay adequate attention to diverse local historical, cultural, socio-economic and environmental conditions. In order for programs to be more effective a clear understanding of the local context is needed.

As a result, this study examines the specific context of *Timor Tengah Selatan* (TTS). Particular focus is given to the district’s unique conditions in terms of geography, local public health systems, social cultural customs and beliefs, environmental health conditions and the resulting government programs and interventions.

Environmental health

In essence, environmental health refers to all the physical, chemical and biological factors of our environment that have the potential to influence health and behavior. According to the World Health Organisation (WHO), at its broadest, environmental health addresses: -

all the physical, chemical, and biological factors external to a person, and all the related factors impacting behaviours. It encompasses the assessment and control of those environmental factors that can potentially affect health. It is targeted towards
preventing disease and creating health-supportive environments. This definition excludes behaviour not related to environment, as well as behaviour related to the social and cultural environment, and genetics. \(\textit{WHO}, 2013\)

This study investigated five key factors of environmental health and protection found by local researchers to be most relevant to the context of NTT. \textit{Effendi (2013)} lists five key factors as crucial to guarding the environmental health of settlements: access to clean water, adequate draining, sanitation, management of rubbish, roads and paving and access to health facilities, markets and district capitals.

**Environmental health in South Central Timor.**

Timor Tenggah Selatan (TTS), or \textit{South Central Timor}, is composed of 394,000 hectares of land making it the third largest district in NTT \(\textit{BPS NTT, 2012/2013}\). The district is also composed of 32 \textit{Kecamatan} or sub-districts and 278 \textit{kelurahan} or village subunits \(\textit{BPS NTT, 2012/2013}\). Located in the South-Central hills, the capital city of TTS, Soe and the surrounding area sits at an altitude of 900+ metres above sea level. As a result of its higher altitude (the 3\textsuperscript{rd} highest in the province) the district of TTS experiences a cooler climate and greater volume of rainfall than most other parts of Timor. Because of its mountainous terrain, many of the sub-districts and villages in TTS are very remote and difficult to access. As a result, many of these villages must also face a range of challenges in accessing health services.

Not having access to trained medical staff has been proven to increase the risk of maternal and neonatal death. In 2012 TTS recorded 25 maternal deaths (14.53\% of the entire province), the highest number recorded in NTT \(\textit{NTT 2012}\). In the breakdown of these figures, 16 of these deaths were attributed to loss of blood and hemorrhaging \(\textit{BPS NTT, 2013, pp. 152-155}\). A further three deaths were caused by hypertension during pregnancy and four more were linked to infection \(\textit{BPS NTT, 2013, pp. 152-155}\). These conditions may have also been interrelated and mothers may have experienced two or more of these illnesses as a cause of death.
Of all the 21 districts of Nusa Tenggara Timur (NTT) Province, in 2012 TTS recorded 32.55% (the 3rd highest proportion) of mothers entering labour without a trained health practitioner (such as a doctor or midwife). This was well above the province’s average of 28.29% (BPS NTT, 2013, pp. 152-155). These results may be attributed to the hilly, rural and remote nature of the district. There may also be a range of other contributing factors such as the cultural and traditional mystical belief of the Dawan people. One such belief lends credence to the ibu dukun, who act as faith healers and midwives.

Within Dawan tradition the dukun act as a traditional healer and midwife. With substantial experience in delivering babies and expertise in traditional natural medicine, the dukun has traditionally been a medical authority. Communities have turned to these dukun to assist in the delivery of newborn babies even until more recent times. In situations where communities have greater difficulty in accessing health facilities and medical staff, the dukun are more likely to be consulted with. In recent years with various government interventions, consultation with the dukun has steadily been limited. However, reliance on dukun remains the most viable option in situations where no other options or health workers are available. The lack of trained medical workers remains a problem in TTS. Local village level health clinics are not always staffed and when they are their staff are not always adequately trained.

Interestingly, interviews with local village communities highlighted a concerning number of community members who held more faith in the dukun than in some of the medical staff in village health clinics. According to various correspondents, often midwives, nurses and directors, despite having completed their education and training may often lack real practical experience, leading to complications and even death.

Figure 2 below tabulates data relating to maternal and neonatal death through 2010, 2011 and 2012 (BPS NTT, 2013, pp. 152-155). Interestingly, the number of maternal deaths has dropped since 2010 (46 deaths) to 25 deaths in 2012. However, this has coincided with an increase in neonatal deaths from 75 in 2010 to 93 in 2012. The proportion of neonatal deaths attributed to ‘other’ causes has been disturbingly high. This verifies the need for further investigation and more detailed explanation of the causes of neonatal deaths.
Amidst dire health conditions, clear and detailed information about the health conditions in the most difficult and remote areas becomes increasingly important. This study intends to shed light on the concerning information gaps relating to ‘other causes’. Shedding light on these unknowns is crucial in providing a clear understanding of the root causes of maternal and neonatal health thereby illuminating a direction or path and the measures needed to address these concerns.

The high number of maternal and neonatal deaths as seen in TTS in 2012, may be linked to a number of complex conditions and factors. This paper explores a number of environmental health factors as well as the social-cultural context of these villages.

**The ume kbubu**

This study of the environmental health of village communities in TTS would not be complete without a clear understanding of the role of the ume kbubu. An examination of the role of the ume kbubu as a resting place for mothers and their newborn babies is especially relevant to maternal and neonatal health conditions.

The ume kbubu remains an iconic representation of the traditional culture of the Dawan people of Central Timor. According to Situmeang (2013), the ume kbubu is used as “a round kitchen” (Situmeang, 2013). The bee-hive shaped huts are commonly found adjacent to village households of TTS. Some of the villages further away from the core (Soe city) still use the ume kbubu as resting places for mothers and newborn babies through the process of warming or panggang ‘roast’ through the fire and insulation within the ume kbubu. However, this tradition is becoming increasingly difficult to find.

Environmental health and the process of panggang in the ume kbubu are largely passed on through spoken word from generation to generation. In terms of environmental health conditions – the dust, ash, smoke and extreme heat are potential environmental health threats. Also there have been reported cases where flames have caused the bed to catch fire (Mr. Mella 2013 pers. Comm). These risks are conferred by the multifunctional nature of the ume kbubu as a resting place, granary and kitchen. As a kitchen and store room for food, the ume kbubu is more closely associated with the traditional gender role of women. The ume kbubu has traditionally been a place of rest for mothers during childbirth.
As mentioned, this has raised a number of questions regarding the delicate balance between modern health standards and respect for tradition.

The process of *panggang* has been of particular concern. The custom is based on an ancient belief. In essence, *panggang* is all about providing a place of warmth for mothers and their newborn children while they recover from childbirth. As a result, most of those who practice *panggang* are located in the colder, more mountainous parts of TTS. For the purpose of warmth, the *ume kbubu* provides an ideal resting place as the thick walls insulate against the cold mountain winds (Nugrahaeni & Suwantara, 2012). Without any windows or other forms of ventilation, the warmth of the fireplace is retained within the *ume kbubu*.

The process of *panggang* begins after giving birth. Within this process, the mother and her child should remain in the *ume kbubu* on top of the woven bed or resting place for four days and four nights (Mr. Mella 2013 pers. Comm). During this time the mother and child are forbidden from leaving the resting place. The rules are strict and even placing ones feet upon the ground can be seen in breach of these rules.

*Panggang* also involves a small fire and boiling water to be placed underneath the woven resting place of the mother. Hot water and steam are applied to the mother’s body. The water is prepared by boiling the water with some medicinal herbs. The water is then applied by using a cloth dipped into the hot water and then pressed to the mother’s body. In local languages this process is referred to as *tas* or *tatobi* (Mr. Mella 2013 pers. Comm). It is believed that the medicinal and therapeutic properties of this process help to cleanse the body of unclean blood and other residues left over from the process of child birth. Through bathing in this hot water in the *ume kbubu*, the additional warmth is also believed to help the mothers regain their strength and recover more quickly. The mothers and children must remain on the woven resting places inside of the *ume kbubu*. This belief and custom has been most firmly defended by the *dukun*. Some mothers also spoke of elders, in particular their mother in laws as who use their position of power in the family as to pressure them to follow this tradition.

Throughout Timor, the *ume kbubu* otherwise known as *Rumah Bulat* (Round House) is relatively standardized in terms of structure (Nubatonis, 2013). The *ume kbubu* have been built practically for warmth. Naturally, these structures can only be found in the cooler parts of Timor. To retain heat from small indoor wood-fires and prevent cold winds and rain from entering, the *ume kbubu* are built without windows or other forms of ventilation. The *ume kbubu* usually has a one metre high doorway. The *Dawan* people prepare food inside of the house using wood as fuel for their fires. This often creates large amounts of smoke which has contributed to the government’s concerns and motivations to build new houses for the *Dawan* people. Some of the images below illustrate the appearance and contents of the *ume kbubu*. Appendix 1-2 also provide further imagery and insights relating to the *ume kbubu*. 
Figure 3: The Ume kbubu – a rendered illustration

Sketches based on measurements and observation (Metherall 2013)

Figure 4: Inside the ume kbubu

Sketches based on measurements and observation (Metherall 2013)

The top left image shows the material makeup of the ume kbubu. A one metre high stone wall provides the foundation of the ume kbubu. On top of this the structure utilizes bundles of grass tied together with a rope like thread. Corn, legumes, seeds and other food stores are kept inside the ume kbubu. Corn can be tied to the ceiling or stored in the attic. A ladder allows the mother to climb up to the attic to retrieve more of the food stores. The image highlights the primary function of the ume kbubu as a granary and kitchen. The top right
image shows the environmental health risks associated with the Ume kbubu. Smoke, ash and dust were categorized as respiratory threats. The fire itself, and extreme heat from the *panggang* process also constitutes an environmental health hazard.

The bottom image illustrates a floor plan of the *ume kbubu*: the stone wall, the firewood storage, the fireplace, resting place and second fire for *panggang*.

**Research method**

The method utilized in this study involved collection of data through interviews at the District level Centre of Health Intelligence, *Dinas Kesehatan TTS*. This process was followed by interviews and the facilitation of discussion to fill in participatory matrices forms with midwife staff and local community members regarding their experiences with the factors of environmental health, the key factors affecting neonatal and maternal health and the traditional use of the *ume kbubu*. This data was sorted into matrices (see appendix figures 5 and 6) to form a foundation of participatory statistics (Holland, 2013).

After the foundational data was collected over a couple of days, the next step was to visit some of the village case studies. Nusa, Supul and Boti were selected for the purpose of providing illustrative cases of villages with varying proximities to the core of TTS. Nusa, the first village chosen was the closest to Soe; Supul was a medium distance to Soe but still easily connected to a main road. Finally, Boti was chosen as an indicative example of a more remote village. More importantly, Boti is a village renowned for its strong adherence to traditional customs or *adat*. As a result, the use of *panggang* and the *ume kbubu* are still widespread and the effects of expansive modernization have been limited by remoteness. Within these villages a mixture of participatory matrices and mapping was used in small focus groups. Semi-structured interviews and focus groups served as the main method of gathering information. Conversational approaches were supplemented with questionnaire like structures.

In the field, perspectives and experience were gathered from three expert staff from the Dinas Kesehatan TTS. Two midwife staff working in local village health clinics were also interviewed. Six mothers who had experienced giving birth in the *ume kbubu* as well as the process of *Panggang*. Perspectives from a small farmers group were also gathered from two members who were both born in the *ume kbubu*. Small focus groups in each of the three villages provided additional insights into environmental health conditions into these villages. Through comparative study, wider conclusions indicative of the wider TTS were also drawn.

Limitations to this study’s method include the small size of the sample which was limited to just 3 villages. In particular, the sample of 6 mothers who participated in semi-structured interviews and the 3 small focus groups in each of the three villages may not provide enough participatory statistics to be representative of each of these villages individually. Furthermore, the results from the limited volume of respondents in these samples may not provide enough data to be sufficient for generalization across wider TTS.
Consequently, the results of this paper should not be taken to generalize the conditions across the vast and complex district of South Central Timor. Instead, this research is more useful as a means of shedding light on people’s experiences and attitudes towards more general environmental health conditions as well as the use of the *ume kbubu*.

The subjectivity of ideal health practice is also worth noting. The participants interviewed in the three sample villages may have differing perceptions of concepts such as environmental health. This is particularly the case in relation to how village communities hold diverse scales of perception in gauging their own physical condition and wellbeing, especially when compared to perceptions in urban populations. Indeed, the study also highlights that ‘good health’ is an inherently subjective idea. This is also the case in relation to traditional belief systems vs. modern medicine and environmental health best practice.

**Results**

Community focus discussion groups across the three sample villages all identified access to clean water as the most important factor in relation to public health. Adequate draining was commonly ranked second most important, largely due to the environmental health impacts of floods and contamination of water sources. In Nusa Village, access to water was perceived as the most important criterion, with draining as the second most. Rubbish management was third and sanitation and roads and access were not seen to be as important.

In Supul Village access to water was also perceived as the most important criterion. However, roads, paving and access received almost as high a score through these participatory statistics. Draining received the third highest ranking. The community stated that even with access to clean water, inadequate draining means it will only be a matter of time before the water becomes contaminated by waste or the nearby manganese mine. Supul village has already begun building separate water taps and sinks adjacent to each house with positive effect of reducing the risk and spread of contamination. However, this process of building taps and sinks has not yet been socialized to the furthest households, while sanitation and rubbish were fourth and fifth, respectively. The interesting variables in Supul village include the large manganese mine and large lake located to either side of the watershed ridge. See village maps for further information (appendices fig.7, 8, 9).

In Boti Village access to water was perceived as the most important criterion. Drainage was perceived as the second most important. In order to prevent flooding, the people of Boti use stone fence and dam structures. Sanitation was the third most important since it could often be worsened through flooding of toilets and waste areas. Rubbish management was not perceived to be important at all. Correspondents in Boti stated this was because they guard their environment and have little to no need for rubbish which use plastics or papers. As a result, the criterion for rubbish management was left blank.
Semi-structured interviews were also conducted with people who had experienced *panggang* in the past. The sample included interviews with 2 women (mothers) from each of the 3 sample villages. The results showed that almost all the women had experienced *panggang* in the past. Whether the *panggang* is ‘strict’ (follows the rules of the *dukun*), ‘not strict’ more nominal following of the practice of *panggang*; this usually involves just sitting in the *ume kbubu* for warmth rather than *panggang* strictly in accordance with the instruction of the *dukun*. It was found that age usually plays an important role since women over the age of 30-40 (born in the 70s – 80s) would have had their children during a time when *panggang* and childbirth in the *ume kbubu* was not yet considered a health hazard. As a result, women of an older age were more often likely to have practiced strict *panggang* when compared to women below 35.

The women who were interview in Boti still continue to practice *panggang* in accordance with traditional *adat* rules. These were the only women who would continue the practice of *panggang* in the future. The other women would not continue this practice since they fear having to pay penalties. This deterrent mechanism was implemented between 2009 and 2013). The results showed that most women would not continue the practice of *panggang* even if they had practiced it in the last 5-10 years. This demonstrates that the process of *panggang* and the tradition of the *ume kbubu* is now at a stage of transition. Recent government interventions have restricted the use of *panggang* and other traditional medicines. Through some of the interviews it was found that some mothers had experienced discomfort and pain when they took both modern and traditional medicine (papaya leaves and other salves). Some community members stated that the mixing of traditional and modern medicines has been found to react badly. As a result, mothers must often make a choice: modern or traditional. It is very difficult to incorporate both.

From surveys, focus groups and in-depth interviews no substantial causative link could be drawn connecting use of the *ume kbubu* and the incidence of maternal and neonatal death. No link could be drawn between the environmental health hazards and long-term negative effects on health. A range of environmental health hazards were identified inside the *ume kbubu* and through the process of *panggang*: smoke, ash, dust, fire, and other environmental health hazards. Information collected through the interviews, focus groups and other experiences involving mothers and other community members yielded a mixture of different results. Some of the interview subjects had also been born in *ume kbubu* and had experienced *panggang* as babies. Participants were unable to draw on examples of people who had experienced long-term negative health, respiratory or other effects from these traditional processes. Three mothers even spoke of how they felt better through the process of *panggang* as it helped them quickly regain their strength after birth. The other three mothers interviewed, said that after comparing both modern and traditional medicine and child birth processes they would prefer to use modern treatment, injections, and medicine if they were given the choice again.
One interesting theme which arose from discussions with some local community members in Nusa village was the idea that modernization has actually led to an increase in the rate of illnesses in these villages. When reflecting on their childhoods, the communities of Nusa spoke of a time when food and medicine was much simpler and more natural. No chemicals were used in eating, cooking, cleaning or in the development of agriculture and livestock. According to these communities, people were stronger and lived longer back in the old days.

There have been a range of advances in medical technology, the revolution of maternal and neonatal health as well as the reformation of health clinics and a plethora of other government programs. Within this context there has been not only an increase in medical staff and research but also an increase in the number of diagnoses of illnesses. These community perceptives raised the idea of a potential risk of paranoia contributing to increased diagnoses.

‘Other’ emergent causes of maternal and neonatal mortality

Through discussions with the focus groups, local village health clinic workers, and Dinas Kesehatan expert staff as well as various other community a number of ‘other’ potential causes of maternal and neonatal mortality were identified. These factors included transportation, rural isolation and difficult road conditions. Such factors present obstacles for mothers in labour from accessing adequate health services and safe health facilities in time. Ambulances, cars and sometimes motorbikes cannot always access the most distant and remote village households. This situation may be worsened by poor and slow decision making, lack of awareness of good practice in assisting expectant mothers, slow decision making and poor decisions which may put these mothers at further risk.

Even if these mothers are able to make the often long and arduous journey to a health care facility. Medical health staff are not always guaranteed to be available at these facilities. Well trained medical health staff may be even more difficult to come across. While inexperience and the rates of malpractice have not been studied in this context, these are factors which should not be neglected as possible causes of maternal and neonatal death. This was an issue that was largely dependent on geographic factors.
Figure 5: Core and Peripheral Villages:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Core villages (Nusa and Supul)</th>
<th>Peripheral Villages (Boti)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Distance from main city</td>
<td>Minimal</td>
<td>Relatively far</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Distance from main roads</td>
<td>Minimal</td>
<td>Relatively far</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Environmental Health Conditions</td>
<td>Protected through modern practices</td>
<td>Protected through traditional practices</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Use of <em>Ume kbubu</em> (panggang)</td>
<td>Limited</td>
<td>Common</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Use of modern medicines</td>
<td>Common</td>
<td>Limited</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Economy</td>
<td>Market dependent economies</td>
<td>Subsistence and independent economies</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

In terms of the gap identified between these various villages, a clear distinction could be made between “core villages” and “peripheral villages”. This table presents a useful conceptualization of this gap between villages. This gap is not always a negative one. Some conditions in peripheral villages may even be preferable to conditions in the more core villages: for example, conditions in rubbish management and drainage. However, these conditions were found to vary.

Figure 6: Distance between the core and periphery – map of TTS villages in relation to the City of Soe:
This figure illustrates the distance between Soe, Nusa, Supul and Boti. Through the study, a pattern was found in which the villages further from the core city were considered more traditional and less influenced by both modernization and often also less influenced by government policies.

In accordance with the mandate of the National Constitution of the Republic of Indonesia, the government has introduced a number of programs with the stated purpose of providing quality health services to all of its citizens. Consequently, over the past four decades the Indonesian health care system has rapidly expanded (Utomo, 2011). With a large number of government programs with multiple purposes: for community welfare, political gain and standardization for unification of the diverse archipelago; a table can be useful in displaying these programs chronologically. It is useful to analyze these programs in sequence and their progress overall rather than analyzing them disjointedly and individually (see appendix 4.1).

It is also important to recognize the context of these various government interventions. Most of these programs have taken place within the Revolusi Kesehatan Ibu dan Anak or the Revolution in Maternal and Neonatal Health, as well as the transformation of bureaucracy and reformation of health clinics in Indonesia (Pandie 2009). Various case studies indicate that even in the light of the Revolution of Maternal and Child Health, conditions remain difficult: See Dopo (2012), Lengo (2011)\(^\text{21}\)

In the wider context these programs have been implemented amidst a backdrop of the global development agenda – the Millenium Development Goals (MDGs). Given the wider context, it becomes clear through the observations at the village level, that TTS is now experiencing a transitional phase. The government’s policies and programs have imposed a modernization of health practices over these villages. As a result, mothers who were giving birth in \textit{ume kbubu} 20-30 years ago are now giving birth in hospitals. Mothers following the strict dukun rules of panggang religiously 5-10 years ago now refer much less frequently to dukun and only use the \textit{ume kbubu} nominally as place to stay warm.

**Conclusion**

Through the investigation into environmental health conditions in Timor Tenggah Selatan, the \textit{ume kbubu} and maternal and neonatal health, a number of conclusions were drawn. There is a clear development gap between the villages more closely linked to the main roads and the core of TTS and those villages in much more rural and remote areas. Other villages which live by and protect their traditional customs also display vastly different use of health facilities and importantly, different behaviour. One of the key differences between these two different kinds of villages is the use of the \textit{ume kbubu} and the following of \textit{adat} customs. This was clearly seen though comparison of the core and peripheral villages.

\(^{21}\) In particular, Lengo’s study of the District of West Manggarai in Flores
Interestingly, no link was drawn between the use of the ume kbubu for panggang and community perceptions of causation with maternal and neonatal death or long-term negative health impacts. Instead, a number of other environmental health concerns and causes were linked to the category of ‘other’ causes of maternal and neonatal mortality. While this particular participatory research sample did not identify causal links between the processes of panggang and maternal and neonatal health risks, it is important to note other empirical studies might yield more definitive results. As a result, the authors recommend a number of future studies to be dedicated towards the grey area of ‘other’ causes of maternal and neonatal mortality in TTS and NTT more widely. This might involve a further more detailed investigation of environmental health conditions and the use of the ume kbubu in the more peripheral villages is also recommended. In particular, an in-depth empirical clinical study of panggang and both its short and long-term effects on newborn children, their mothers and long-term respiratory and neonatal development would be beneficial.

The authors recommend environmental health interventions and policy which are responsive to local feedback from communities who are able to identify their own local environmental health priorities. A policy response to the use of panggang processes must balance both health awareness information interventions from trained public health service providers alongside an awareness and appreciation of the cultural values and importance of the ume kbubu.

Reference


Budiyono, M. (2004). The correlation of physical factors of the traditional house of Dawan tribe and respiratory acute infection (ISPA) on babies at Oebesi and Noenbesi villages, North Mollo subdistrict, South Center Timor, East Nusa Tenggara province. Journal of Environmental Health in Indonesia, 3 (1), 37-39


Erlyana E, K. K., Glenn M (2011). "Expanding health insurance to increase health care utilization: will it have different effects in rural vs urban areas?" Health Policy 100(2-3): 273-281.


Appendices

Appendix 1.1

Dimensions of the ume kbubu

In terms of materials, the *Ume kbubu* commonly requires around 2.0819 cubic metres of prepared wood\(^{22}\) (*S. Agung Sri Raharjo, 2010*). A survey conducted by the Indonesian Ministry of Forestry in 2010 explored local community preferences for different kinds of trees/wood to be planted and harvested as timber (*S. Agung Sri Raharjo, 2010*). The results show that local communities mostly use teak wood. The most desired building material is mahogany, with teak wood as a second choice. This survey provides insights, not only of local communities’ preferences for building materials but also of their various structural preferences.

---

As the renderings illustrate, the width of the entrance face of an average *Ume kbubu* is around 4.8-5 metres with the doorway being around 0.7 metres and 1 metre in height. The

\(^{22}\) Prepared wood* kayu pertukangan* can be understood as timber or wood which has already been sawn, treated and ready to be used as a building material.
length of the average *Ume kbubu* is around 5.6-6 metres. The height of the *Ume kbubu* is around 3.8-4 metres.

**Appendix 1.2**

*An example of a royal ume kbubu*

Timor was traditionally made up of a number of kingdoms: Mella, Nope, Baunaek (Mr. Bees 2014 pers. Comm). The kingdom of Nope was supported by four fiefdoms or supportive kings: (Bell, Faot, Betty and Nubatonis). The *ume kbubu* below belongs to the descendants of the Bell fiefdom (Mr. Mella 2013 pers. Comm). It is substantially larger than the standard *ume kbubu*.

[Images of royal ume kbubu]

**Appendix 1.3**

*Standard ume kbubu:*

The researcher was fortunate enough to have the opportunity to spend a number of nights in the *ume kbubu* located in Supul Village south of Supul Lake. This experience allowed for the chance to experience the perceived environmental health hazards first hand.

[Images of standard ume kbubu]

Through limited experience living in the *ume kbubu*, it was found that levels of dust and ash varied depending on the use of the kitchen. The direction of the smoke always rose to the attic unless there was a pot on the fire. As a result, for those sleeping or receiving *panggang*, the smoke rising high above them would have a variable effect depending on whether a pot was put on the fire and the resultant direction of the smoke. However, it may be more difficult to judge the short and long term impacts of this smoke, dust and ash on the lungs of
a newborn and rapidly developing baby or a mother in the process of recovery after childbirth.

Appendix 2.1

Participatory matrices

For the purpose of this study, participatory matrices provide a tabulation of the environmental health factors alongside criteria such as perceived importance, urgency, and viability.

**Nusa village environmental health factors**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Nusa Focus Group</th>
<th>1</th>
<th>2</th>
<th>3</th>
<th>4</th>
<th>5</th>
<th>Average</th>
<th>Reasons</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Access to clean water</td>
<td></td>
<td>1</td>
<td>2</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>4.67</td>
<td>Water remains the most important factor since it is both important and urgent. It is also a viable option for a village project proposal.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Draining</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>3</td>
<td>Draining was ranked as the second most important environmental health factor by the community of Nusa. It was not overly urgent at this stage due to the fact that Nusa is located in the mountains and rarely experiences floods.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sanitation (toilets)</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>2</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>1.67</td>
<td>Toilets were recognized as an important factor. However, most houses already possessed toilets.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Rubbish management</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>2</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>2.33</td>
<td>Rubbish management was an important issue. There are currently no specially allocated rubbish disposal areas. Most rubbish is simply burned adjacent to one’s own household. Other rubbish is thrown aside impacting environmental health conditions.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Paving and access</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>1</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>1.67</td>
<td>Paving and other infrastructure was not categorized as very important nor very urgent. This may be related to Nusa village being located relatively close to the core of TTS.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Others: (identified by local community members)

| Unemployment and poverty       | A lack of working opportunities and poverty were identified as key problems. The low income of locals in Nusa Village would often prevent them from gaining access to health care and other costly services. |
Appendix 2.2

**Nusa village housing**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Nusa</th>
<th>Proportion</th>
<th>Kitchen</th>
<th>Child-birth / Panggang</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Semi-permanent and permanent housing</td>
<td>Almost all family units have a permanent or semi-permanent home</td>
<td>Some houses have internal kitchens</td>
<td>Over the past few decades, <em>panggang</em> has become increasingly rare in Nusa. <em>Panggang</em> is still well remembered but rarely continued.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ume kbubu</td>
<td>Around half of all houses still have an Ume kbubu</td>
<td><em>Ume kbubu</em> are still used as a kitchen.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Appendix 2.3

**Supul village environmental health factors**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Supul Focus Group</th>
<th>1</th>
<th>2</th>
<th>3</th>
<th>4</th>
<th>5</th>
<th>Average</th>
<th>Reasons</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Access to clean water</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>4</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>4.43</td>
<td>Water remains the most important factor since it is both important and urgent. It is also a viable option for a village project proposal.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Draining</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>2</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>3.29</td>
<td>Draining was ranked as the third most important environmental health factor by the community. The villagers said that even with access to clean water, if there is inadequate draining it will only be a matter of time before the water becomes contaminated. Supul village has already begun building separate water tap and sinks adjacent to each house with positive effect of reducing the risk and spread of contamination. However, this process of building taps and sinks has not yet been socialized to the furthest households.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sanitation (toilets)</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>2.71</td>
<td>Toilets and sanitation were recognized as an important and urgent issue. However, at this stage most of the houses in the village already had a permanent or semi-permanent toilet structure. Furthermore this was perceived as an individual rather than a communal issue.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Rubbish management</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>1</td>
<td></td>
<td>2.57</td>
<td>While most thought that rubbish management was important. The majority also believed that this was an issue which could wait, it was not the most urgent.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
However, one community member believed it was very important and this lead to an interesting debate within the focus group. In the end the group agreed that rubbish management was important but not the most urgent compared to the other factors. It was agreed that rubbish management should be brought up at the next village meeting.

Paving and access  1  1  4  1  4.14  Paving and other infrastructure was the second most important, and the most viable of options. It was second to access to water in terms of urgency.

Others: (identified by local community members)

Lake
The lake was identified as a water source for the village. This could have a number of spill-over benefits if managed well. The villagers wanted to maximize the benefits brought by the lake in terms of a source of income (fisheries and tourism).
However, the lake was also identified as a place with a higher risk of spreading mosquito borne diseases.

Magnesium Mine
The magnesium mine behind Supul village is gargantuan. The exports of magnesium are a large source of economic growth for the villages.
However, recent studies have also shown the negative impacts of the magnesium mining on the environment and the community. Some examples include contamination of water sources and the blood and respiratory systems of the surrounding communities. The villagers also spoke about the risks regarding unsustainable mining, mud-slides and the resulting environmental degradation.

Appendix 2.4

Supul village housing

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Proportion</th>
<th>Kitchen</th>
<th>Child-birth / Panggang</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Semi-permanent and permanent housing</td>
<td>Almost all family units have a permanent or semi-permanent home</td>
<td>Some houses have internal kitchens</td>
<td>Over the past few decades, panggang has become increasingly rare in Supul. It is now difficult to find villagers who continue this tradition.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ume kbubu</td>
<td>Almost all houses still have an Ume kbubu</td>
<td>Ume kbubu are still used as a kitchen.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Appendix 2.5

Boti village environmental health factors

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Boti Focus Group</th>
<th>1</th>
<th>2</th>
<th>3</th>
<th>4</th>
<th>5</th>
<th>Average</th>
<th>Reasons</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Access to clean water</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>4.2</td>
<td>Water was deemed to be the most important by the focus group drawn from the community of Boti.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Draining</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>2.8</td>
<td>Draining was deemed important. In order to prevent flooding the people of Boti use stone fence and damn structures.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Sanitation (toilets)</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>1.8</td>
<td>Toilets are usually dug adjacent to houses. This has been the tradition of the Dawan people in past times and these conditions have been sufficient. Issues only occur in times of floods when these toilets are washed away which may present an environmental health hazard.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Rubbish management</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>The people in Boti guard their environment and have little to no need for rubbish such as plastics or papers. As a result, this criteria was left blank.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Paving and access</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>1.6</td>
<td>The need to participate in markets, buy goods from the city was limited by the geographic location. The people of Boti are largely self-sufficient without the need for modern infrastructure and paving.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Appendix 2.6

Boti village housing

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Boti</th>
<th>Proportion</th>
<th>Kitchen</th>
<th>Child-birth / Panggang</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Semi-permanent and permanent housing</td>
<td>There are very few modern or permanent homes within the village of Boti</td>
<td>The small wooden houses sometimes have cooking pots.</td>
<td>Panggang remains common practice in Boti. The village remains one of the last to retain this particular traditional custom within this sample.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ume kbubu</td>
<td>Almost all houses still make use of the Ume kbubu</td>
<td><em>Ume kbubu</em> are still widely used as a kitchen and granary.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Appendix 2.7

Survey of mothers: *Ume kbubu and panggangi*

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Subject</th>
<th>Village</th>
<th>Age</th>
<th>Past panggang</th>
<th>Continued panggang</th>
<th>Observed negative impacts?</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Mother 1</td>
<td>Nusa</td>
<td>54</td>
<td>Y (strict)</td>
<td>N</td>
<td>N</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mother 2</td>
<td>Nusa</td>
<td>28</td>
<td>Y (not strict)</td>
<td>N</td>
<td>N</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mother 3</td>
<td>Supul</td>
<td>34</td>
<td>Y (not strict)</td>
<td>N</td>
<td>N</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mother 4</td>
<td>Supul</td>
<td>62</td>
<td>Y (strict)</td>
<td>N</td>
<td>N</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mother 5</td>
<td>Boti</td>
<td>32</td>
<td>Y (strict)</td>
<td>Y</td>
<td>N</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mother 6</td>
<td>Boti</td>
<td>36</td>
<td>Y (strict)</td>
<td>Y</td>
<td>N</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Appendix 3.1

Participatory Mapping

Participatory mapping provides a useful visualization of village conditions since it is based upon local knowledge. Perhaps even more important than the final product of participatory mapping is the process itself which has been shown to be a useful learning and reflection process (Holland, 2013). Participatory mapping also forms one of a number of methods within a wider movement towards participatory rural appraisal and participatory action research as championed by Chambers (1994) and Estrella, Gaventa et al. (1998).

Even more technocratic and technology dependent forms of mapping have begun to see the importance of community participation. Abbott (2000) highlights the importance of community participation in decision-making. Abbot believes that this also requires that technology adapt and become more accessible for communities. In particular, for GIS systems to be made capable of providing a degree of interactive planning with members of the community. The results of the participatory mapping can be seen in Fig 7, Fig 8 and Fig 9. Below.
Fig 7. Nusa Village: Nusa presented a case of a village quite close to the core of TTS (Soe). Most of the basic environmental health needs had been met and villagers did not need to travel far to reach the core of Soe if the need arose. Mapping highlighted that wide-scale development programs like PNPM had also assisted in building additional public toilets near the market place.

Fig 8. Supul Village: Supul presented a case of a village a moderate distance away from the core of TTS (Soe). The participatory matrices highlighted a number of the environmental health factors as important but urgency was found to be only within a mid-level category. The villagers identified the lake as both a positive and negative: a source of water but also as a potential source of mosquito borne diseases. According to community perspectives, the huge magnesium mining industry was identified as an environmental health threat since it had already been believed to contaminate water sources and impact the blood composition of locals.
Fig 9. Boti Village: Boti as a rural and remote case study presented some interesting environmental health results. There were a number of environmental health factors which were found to be no longer relevant to Boti village. Without any rubbish waste to become a source of environmental degradation, traditional draining and sanitation systems also substituted for the need for concrete box toilets and large man made piping systems. Due to geographic location and remoteness, the need for paving and roads was also found to no longer be necessary since these villages were more self-sufficient. These communities did not need to make frequent trips to the city.

Appendix 4.1

Policy

Fig 10. Policy changes over time

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Year</th>
<th>Name of Program</th>
<th>Purpose</th>
<th>Results (within the context of TTS)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1970s</td>
<td>Rumah Sehat “Healthy home”</td>
<td>To build permanent housing with adequate facilities to ensure standards of environmental health</td>
<td>Many village households are now of semi-permanent nature. There are still some traditional ‘dirt floor’ houses. However, they are steadily becoming more of a rarity. Now not as many people live in the traditional Ume kbubu.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1997-2007</td>
<td>PPK / KDP “Sub-distric development program”</td>
<td>Poverty alleviation – largely through conditional cash transfers with a focus towards infrastructure</td>
<td>Throughout the three waves of KDP, a large number of roads, bridges and other infrastructure was laid down throughout Indonesia. The KDP program perceived as a success was scaled up to 40,000 villages throughout Indonesia.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2004-2009</td>
<td>RPJMN “National Plan for mid-term”</td>
<td>Plan for building a middle class in Indonesia: to raise the quality of health</td>
<td>The promotion of environmental health education within this program was also emphasized.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Year</td>
<td>Program Name</td>
<td>Description</td>
<td>Notes</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>------</td>
<td>--------------</td>
<td>-------------</td>
<td>-------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2007-2015</td>
<td>PNPM “The National Program for Community Empowerment”</td>
<td>A continuation of KDP. Continued focus towards physical infrastructure, however, with a greater commitment towards gender equality and an emphasis on community participation. As a World Bank supported program, PNPM is closely oriented towards the MDGs.</td>
<td>PNPM – continues until today. The primary program, PNPM-Mandiri has continued to focus on infrastructure as can be seen in TTS. However, there has been an increasing focus towards gender equality, and wider participation. The program continues to struggle with issues such as elite capture in reaching pro-poor targeting. PNPM has diversified into a number of programs with various focuses including rural, urban, sectoral focuses such as health and education and even regional focuses. The most common program in TTS is PNPM-Mandiri Rural which is largely geared towards infrastructure.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2000-2010</td>
<td>Indonesia Sehat 2010 “Healthy Indonesia”</td>
<td>Indonesia Sehat or “Healthy Indonesia” was aimed towards increasing access to health service provision.</td>
<td>While some progress has been made in increasing access to basic health facilities and services in TTS. There are a number of areas were more work is needed.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2009-2011</td>
<td>Polindes “Birthing cottage”</td>
<td>Polindes was a policy used to prevent mothers from giving birth without going to a health facility. Those who did not follow this law would be fined.</td>
<td>The use of a threat (fine) was effective in reducing the number of mothers who would give birth outside of a health facility. Many families were afraid of having to pay the penalty for not following this law.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2012+</td>
<td>Fines and negative</td>
<td>The processes of Panggang and dukun are banned. Traditional</td>
<td>Has reduced the use of traditional medicine and practices throughout most villages. There remain a few rare villages</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
penalties | medicine is discouraged. | which continue to defy invasive modernization.

Sources:
(Pandie, 2009)
(Onishi, 2008)
(Stokes, 2009)
Living adat Law, Indigenous Peoples and the State Law: A Complex Map of Legal Pluralism in Indonesia

Mirza Satria Buana

Biodata: A lecturer at Lambung Mangkurat University, South Kalimantan, Indonesia and is currently pursuing a Ph.D in Law at T.C Beirne, School of Law, The University of Queensland, Australia. The author’s profile can be viewed at: http://www.law.uq.edu.au/rhd-student-profiles. Email: mirza.buana@uq.net.au

Abstract

This paper examines legal pluralism’s discourse in Indonesia which experiences challenges from within. The strong influence of civil law tradition may hinder the reconciliation processes between the Indonesian living law, namely adat law, and the State legal system which is characterised by the strong legal positivist (formalist). The State law fiercely embraces the spirit of unification, discretion-limiting in legal reasoning and strictly moral-ruler dichotomies. The first part of this paper aims to reveal the appropriate terminologies in legal pluralism discourse in the context of Indonesian legal system. The second part of this paper will trace the historical and dialectical development of Indonesian legal pluralism, by discussing the position taken by several scholars from diverse legal paradigms. This paper will demonstrate that philosophical reform by shifting from legalism and developmentalism to legal pluralism is pivotal to widen the space for justice for the people, particularly those considered to be indigenous peoples. This paper, however, only contains theoretical discourse which was part of pre-liminary research data. Further research should expand the study by incorporating an empirical aspect.

Keywords: legal pluralism; living adat law; legal formalist; legal centralism; Indonesian legal system

Introduction

Today, Indonesia still normatively recognises the existence of living adat law and Indonesian indigenous peoples as evidenced by the wording of the Indonesian 1945 Constitution Article 18B (2) that states:

The state recognises and respects integrated legal indigenous communities (kesatuan masyarakat hukum adat) along with their traditional customary rights as long as these remain in existence and are in accordance with the societal development and the principles of the Unitary State of the Republic of Indonesia, and shall be regulated by law.

Article 28i (3) on Human Rights Chapter also states a similar idea. However, Hooker (1975) said that this written recognition is insufficient to protect and sustain the existence of living adat law because the position of living adat law is ambiguously inferior to the State law.

Law No 5 of 1960 concerning Basic Agrarian Law recognises the land rights of indigenous communities with the following conditions:
1) As long as such communities still exist;
2) It may not conflict with the national interest and the State’s interest;
3) It shall not conflict the laws and regulations of higher level.

According to Bedner and Huis (2010), the recognition is unspecific and conditional: it is vague about what rights it refers to, whether a community that is no longer ‘traditional’ loses its specific rights, and whether these rights remain protected if they are out of tune with ‘altered times and culture’ and ‘national interest’ and ‘the State’s interest’. These norms can be concluded to be rubber norms which have diverse meanings and, consequently, the State can simply interpret them as it pleases to suit.

With regard to the judicial system, the common view is that the majority of judges and justices fiercely embrace a strong legal formalism paradigm (Putro, 2011, 27). As the former Chief Justice of the Supreme Court, Bagir Manan, said:

It is illogical thought to consider justice and other external values into legal reasoning processes. The judge must always consider the existing positive laws. (Manan, 2003, 34)

This paper will investigate the practices of legal pluralism in Indonesia particularly in philosophical, social and legal spheres. First, it is important to discuss and examine diverse legal terminologies utilised by the prominent scholars in regard to legal pluralism discourse in Indonesia. The choice of terminologies is crucial to the discussion because without determining a correct terminology the study may generate misunderstanding, lose its socio-legal characteristic and not focus on Indonesia’s context.

The development of legal thoughts in Indonesia will be elaborated on by discussing the position taken by several prominent legal scholars. It starts from the idea of inseparability between morality and law proposed by naturalists, to legalism, to sociological and to the apex of contemporary legal discourse propounded by postmodernists. This paper only consists of theoretical discourse which aims as a theoretical framework. Further research should look into empirical studies on this area.

**Debateable legal terminologies**

*Living adat law*

The literature has introduced a large number of definitions referring to the law that sociologically are being used within local communities. The definitions are diverse, and scholars who embrace common law traditions such as Jain (1995), Allot (1995) and Forsyth (2009) often use the concept of customary law to depict the phenomena. On the other hand, civil law scholars prefer to use living law or *adat* law, because, according to Vollenhoven whose work was mainly influenced by Savigny and Ehrlich, *adat*’s definition has a broader meaning than customary law (Benda-Beckmann F and K, 2009, 177). Vollenhoven considers *adat* as ‘folk law’, ‘people’s law’ or ‘living law’, which has dynamic and flexible characteristics (Bourchier, 2008, 54; Thorburn, 2008, 78; and Hertogh, 2009, 64).

The concept of living law is more appropriate than *adat* law, because the living *adat* law is a living, actual and contextual law that is being practiced and obeyed by the
community (Benda-Beckmann F and K, 2009, 177). The living law, because of its general characteristic, can be classified as a principal taxonomy (genus), and the customary law as a part of living law can be classified as a its species.

Living adat law is a real manifestation of the people’s legal culture. It is an unwritten and genuine law of Indonesia which has been influenced by religious laws. Even though it is considered to be indigenous or primitive law, adat as a living law has several general concepts, elements, and divisions that are consistently ordered. Thus, living adat law can legitimately be termed a legal system (Soepomo, 1980, 12).

Philosophically, living adat law is divided into two laws. First, adat yang berbuhul mati, which literally means adat that is tied to death, is a strict adat law. It is neither negotiable nor adaptable to changes or context, and is dogmatic and transcendental in nature. Second, adat yang bertali hidup or adat pusaka, which means a flexible and fluid adat, is a law that passes from one generation to the next and is subject to social change (Koesno, 1998, 45). This adat is sociological in nature; adat as a living law grows and thrives within the community.

Even though, both terminologies share many similarities and differences, this paper will use living law or adat law interchangeably as the primary terminology, because nothing can accurately reflect and explain original Indonesian values better than our ‘own’ language and words (Messier, 2008, 10).

Indigenous peoples of Indonesia

There are contested definitions of indigenous peoples, which both international and national organisations have provided. Internationally, the ILO Convention No 107 defined indigenous peoples through patronising language and talked about integration policies. This resulted in policies to integrate indigenous peoples into the majority class, rather than to appreciate their distinctiveness. In the 1980s, the ILO refined their previous convention into ILO Convention No 169, which is more culturally responsive in that it distinguishes between ‘tribal people’ and ‘indigenous peoples,’ but appreciates that there is some overlap as they are not mutually exclusive categories.

The UN issued the United Nations Declaration on the Rights of Indigenous Peoples (UNDRIP). However, this document is not legally binding. Both the ILO Conventions and UNDRIP are considered insufficient in comprehensively defining indigenous peoples. The definition of indigenous peoples itself warrants less focus than, first, how that definition is used to hinder or limit the sovereignty of indigenous peoples, and second, the issue of how the power of ‘defining’ is used to achieve a ‘hidden agenda’ from interest groups (Bahar, 2008, 25).

At the national level, according to Ter Haar (1948) and Soekamto (1998), the indigenous community is divided into two groups: a culturally based indigenous community, which is independent from the State structure, and a legally-based indigenous community (adatrechtgemeenschappen), which is politically-based and functions within the State structure. Only the second group can be recognised by the State as a legal subject and these are further divided into the subgroups of genealogic, territorial and a mixture of the two.
Abdurrahman said that there are no legally-based indigenous peoples in South Kalimantan. His argument was influenced primarily by Ter Haar, who stresses that in order to be recognised as a ‘legal entity’, indigenous peoples must be politically rather than culturally constructed. Ter Haar (1948) determines four requirements for legally-based indigenous peoples:

1. The community has well organised groups;
2. The community has its own territory;
3. The community has its own tribal institution (in particular a tribal court); and
4. The community has both material and non-material (spiritual) goods.

This paper disagrees with the classification for the following reasons: First, it may lead to a false dichotomy. Indigenous peoples, like any other community, must be constructed culturally; culture is the starting point for every social norm and law in the community. In fact, the living adat laws are a reflection of the culture. Therefore, a dichotomy between culturally-based indigenous peoples and legally-based indigenous peoples is a fallacy. Second, the concept of the legally-based indigenous peoples currently used by the Constitution and legislation may lead to discrimination. This may occur, because there will be indigenous peoples whose cultures and traditions are appreciated, but not recognised as legal entities by the State, and there will be indigenous peoples whose cultures and traditions are both appreciated and recognised as legal entities by the State. The concept of indigenous peoples must be holistically understood as a cultural, political and legal entity.

Traditional dispute resolution (TDR)

Many Indonesian scholars such as Abdurrahman (2002), Medan (2012) and a leading Indonesian NGO concerned with indigenous peoples and human rights such as AMAN (2003) utilise the concept of adat court (peradilan adat) to depict indigenous dispute resolution within indigenous communities.

Ter Haar (1948) focuses on what he called tribal adat courts as a fundamental prerequisite for legally-based indigenous peoples. Based on his argument, the concepts of indigenous peoples and TDR are inseparable. As a result, Abdurrahman states that there are no legally-based indigenous peoples in South Kalimantan, because there are no adat courts in South Kalimantan. It is true that there is no adat court in South Kalimantan, and maybe in other parts of Indonesia, because the form of dispute settlement used is not even close to a ‘court’. TDR is a communal forum aiming to settle disputes peacefully. The tribal chief is not a ‘judge’, rather, the tribal chief acts as a facilitator and communicator to stabilise the community.

Ter Haar’s perspective on Indonesian indigenous peoples was influenced by his civil law background, similar to Vollenhoven whose theory places adat sanctions as the cardinal requirement in deciding and grouping indigenous peoples. In rebutting Vollenhoven’s sanction theory, Malinowski refines substantially the notion of sanction on adat by converting sanction into the principle of reciprocity which is not derived from formal State

---

23 Interview with Abdurrahman, a Justice of the Supreme Court, Banjarmasin, 3 January 2014.
hierarchy. Sanctions in indigenous communities are used not as a form of payback but to restore the cosmic order by remediying a disorder in the balance of nature. Instead, it is a result of dynamic social relations (Jong, 1995, 111-115).

The essence of TDR lies in the reconciliation agreement between the victim and the perpetrator mediated by the tribal chief. Through this agreement, the perpetrator admits fault and promises not to repeat the crime, while the victim wholeheartedly forgives the crime (with some compensations). This form of agreement is the essence of living *adat* law, and corresponds with the indigenous proverb: ‘*agreement is older than adat law, law therefore is agreement.*’ Through this agreement, living *adat* law updates its validity within the community. Vollenhoven’s understanding of living *adat* law may stem from the fact that he could not free himself entirely from his western civil law background, leading him to think that sanctions are the only guarantee of order (Maddock, 2002, 87).

The typical western concept of a ‘court’ being imposed on indigenous communities and their TDR should be reviewed. TDR is under much pressure to become more formalised, a tendency that must be rejected, because the formalisation will abrogate the living *adat* law from TDR practice. It is true that some TDR performs a ‘court’ or adjudication function, but TDR has a broader purpose than just adjudicating. Instead, TDR is not only a process for the settlement of dispute but TDR can also be applied in many other non-conflict social relations including the conclusion of a marriage, childbirth, death and funeral events (Slaat & Portier, 1992, 34). The aims are to strengthen harmony and re-establish cosmic relations between disputing parties within its jurisdiction.

The living *adat* law and social morality become the main source of law (Pryles, 2002, 1-3). Hooker (1975, 294) states indigenous dispute resolution should be based on *adat* values such as: the value of togetherness, the value of totality, and the value of appropriateness. By contrast, the formal court is based on an objective pre-existing legal source which is a legal proposition stipulated by legislators and applied by judges.

Other researchers use concepts such as ADR (Black, 2001; Black, 2005), and informal, popular or non-state justice (Matthew, 1988; Abel, 1994; UNDP, 2006, World Bank, 2008). This paper rejects these terminologies by stating: indigenous dispute resolution is not necessarily an alternative to formal mechanisms, because it is often the first stage of dispute resolution (Astor and Chinkin, 2002, 5).

This paper proposes a concept of TDR because it is a more moderate and inclusive concept encompassing diverse social and legal dispute resolution mechanisms that are being practiced by indigenous peoples.

**Legal pluralism discourse**

The development of living law can be traced from Savigny’s famous maxim *Volksgeist* (a common consciousness of law), as opposed to *Juristenrecht* (lawyer’s law). It was originally elaborated from a fundamental principle of *opinion necessitatis* which is the individual’s perception of law (Watson, 1995, 154).

In response to the State law hegemony, Ehrlich opposes the formalist’s claim that the only valid law is a legal proposition produced by the legislature or State political power or by
recognition of ‘juristic law’ (Hertogh, 2009, 54). He proposes an alternative theory of ‘living law’ whose values mingle with everyday life even though these values have not been positioned as a legal proposition. Living law is not only directly associated with the State but to the internal orderings of various social groups, and it does not depend on formal recognition from the State. Rather, the people’s usage in everyday life determines living law’s validity (Cotterrell, 2009, 88). Ehrlich attempts to position living law into legal discourse, although he has no intention to replace jurisprudence as set out by Kelsen who responded to Ehrlich stating he blurs fact and norm (Klink, 2009, 130-133).

Ehrlich and Kelsen were highly critical of each other in defending their own opinions. The author is inclined to stand in a neutral position as both theories can be merged and integrated in order to construct a normative ‘humanistic’ legal system. The law still doesn’t lose its formal form but it is also filled by other external values such as justice and morality. The author rejects the idea of legal exclusivism that means law can only be understood through internal (judge and legislator) perspectives or a close logical system while disregarding other external values that may lessen legal certainty and objectivity. In the author’s view, law should be inclusive in order to strengthen the idea of justice and fully open access to justice. Judges and legislators have a significant role to balance those values by reflecting on the social context that the law applied.

The living law theory contributes to the emergence of the concept of legal pluralism. Griffith (1986) identifies the true nemesis of legal pluralism: legal centralism. He was the first to provide a distinction between the so called weak and strong legal pluralism. Weak pluralism, or state legal pluralism, can be seen as the paradox of legal pluralism when the living laws have been embraced and contaminated by the formality of state law; there is no a pureness of law, but a diversity of legal sources is still exist. On the other hand, strong legal pluralism is a situation in which not all of the law is state law, nor is all of it administrated by a single set of state legal institutions.

Santos (1987) utilises legal pluralism as a yardstick to enter post-modernism discourse. Formalism’s claim that law only operates on a single scale is opposed by legal pluralism that claims there is no single legality, but diverse legalities. Post-modernism rebuts the State metanarrative through its cardinal principles including hierarchical power, legal texts and objectivity (Stacy, 2001, 45).

In regard to postmodernist’s on the Indonesian legal system, there is a sceptical tone, saying that Indonesia is not in a right stage to embrace postmodernism thoughts, because as a developing country Indonesia is still struggling to be a modern country. In other words, any postmodernism discourse is irrelevant to Indonesia. However, the author opposes that statement by arguing both modernism and postmodernism are the product of the European Renaissance which is based on rationality and humanism.

The existence of postmodernism is necessary to fill the gap in the organic life of modernism that preserves the status quo, dichotomises the public and private sphere, and may discriminate against the ‘have nots’, which in turn nurtures ‘the social time bomb’ that may suddenly escalate into severe conflicts between groups. Therefore, disregarding
postmodernism can be seen as closing the book of knowledge, the fading away of dialectical inquiry and lead to the ignorance of unjust social relations.

**Indonesia’s experience**

This paper contextualised legal pluralism debate and discussion to Indonesia, beginning in the post-colonial or unification era, new order developmental era and continuing to the current reformation era.

**Post-colonial (unification) era**

Soepomo was an important person whose insights and knowledge framed the Indonesian legal paradigm. His *integralistic* theory was romantic in that it favoured the Indonesian *adat* values as the legal foundation for the Indonesian legal system, while lessening Western and individualistic values. Soepomo’s speech at the Preparation Meeting of Indonesia’s Independence highlighted his paradigm:

> The foundation of the nation must be based on its own legal experiences (rechtsgeschichte) and its social structure and institutions (sociale structuur). Other nation’s contexts are not guaranteed to be fitted to Indonesia’s context. (Kusuma, 2004, 125)

Soepomo (1980) considered *adat* law a living law, one that was continually and actually living within the community and that, reflected the legal conscience of the community.

Soekarno (1964) added to Soepomo’s argument by proposing a concept of Indonesian democracy, which was not Western democracy, but a synthesis of political and economic democracy aimed social welfare. Hatta then added to this further by rejecting the Western liberal political concepts, stating that Indonesia’s democracy must be rooted in the spirit of collectivism not liberalisation. Hatta referred to his democracy concept as, a social democracy influenced by three sources: Western socialism, Islamic teaching and indigenous collectivism (Manan, 2011, 8), which was rather an ambitious wish.

In the post-colonial era to the earliest years of developmental era, Koesno was the key defender of natural law and the *adat* law school. He actively advocated the notion of law as a value, which went against the mainstream perspective of legal formalism. Koesno was convinced that Indonesian law should be spirited by *adat* law, with its two cardinal principles: democracy and national fraternity (Koesno, 1995, 120).

Koesno’s stand point was meta-physical and categorical in nature. He rejected the principles of the separation of law into: objective law and subjective law. He considered that classification to be misleading, saying that subjective law is the true meaning or spirit of the law which becomes the essence of positive law. In other words, legal values are higher than positive law. In Indonesian law, the objective law is equivalent to state law, and subjective law is equivalent to ‘rights’. He also rebutted dogmatic inquiry and legal language, which primarily influenced by Dutch’s terminology, including the superiority of the rule of regulation.

In its earlier years, Indonesia was not prepared for a sophisticated legal structure. Thus to avoid a legal vacuum, the newly born republic simply transplanted the Dutch
colonial laws to the Indonesian legal system. The initial transplantation project was done by literally translating both the Dutch Civil Code (BW/KUHP) and the Criminal Code (WvS/KUHPid) into the Indonesian legal system (Koesno, 1994, 110). These Dutch legacies are still maintained today, and are dogmatic in nature. Because the positive laws were a literal translation from Dutch, the Dutch legal language was mandatory at the time. The judges had to know the meaning of the legal wording in both Dutch and Indonesian. Meanwhile, they were obligated to apply positive laws to concrete conditions and were trained to be technical jurists, which was typically for a civil law jurist.

However, the codification policy had its drawbacks. With respect to the legal language, even though the judges had a good understanding of Dutch, they lacked contextual insights into the legal text. For example, the law of adultery in the Criminal Code was from a European context whose propositions were totally different from living adat law and Islamic values. In the Criminal Code, the definition of adultery was narrow because an act could only be considered adultery if one of the perpetrators was married. On the other hand, living adat law and Islamic values shared the same position with regards to adultery, in that either perpetrator, married or single, was subject to punishment. In the Civil Code, the notion of private goods was divided into both static goods (onroerend) and moving goods (roerand). In contrast, this dichotomy was not accepted in living adat law. With regards to agrarian law, living adat law was radically different to modern law. The ownership of land and properties on the land are separated. For instance, the indigenous peoples own the land, but it can still be borrowed or used by others. However, there are no rights for the disposal of communal land, so the land can be transferred or used as debt collateral. In modern law, the ownership of land is holistic, and owning the land also means owning the properties and resources extracted from the land. The land also has both the right to use and the right to disposal (Koesno, 1991, 123).

To overcome the problem of legal language, the government stipulated Urgent Law No 1 of 1951 concerning Judiciary. Even though this Law abolished indigenous TDR within Indonesian archipelago, it had the positive effect, that although the government formally abolished the living law institutions, their essences were transmitted into the judge’s legal reasoning. Koesno (1995) encouraged judges to trace the internal morality of the law into legal reasoning processes.

The essence of judicial independence does not just rely on a constitutional provision for a formally separate and independent judicial branch of government, but also stresses the freedom of the judge to elaborate law and use judicial discretion. This is necessarily saying that a judge is more important than a legislator, thus the judge should be intellectually independent and free from dogmatic legislative pressure.

---

24 The legislation of the Dutch legacies was manifested in Transition Article II of Constitution (Before Amendments) and Government Regulation No 28 of 1945. These Laws were legally accepted, as long as did not contradict to the spirit of the Independence Declaration and Constitution. The spirit of the colonization must be replaced by the spirit of the law; this policy is called judicial tolerance.

25 The separation land ownership principle is recognized by the Agrarian Law No. 5 of 1960.

26 Urgent Law No 1 of 1951 concerning Unification of Judiciary, Article 5 (3) b.
Koesno was not only against legal formalism, he also rebutted the movement of legal pragmatic or sociological jurisprudence. Law as a tool changes the position of law from meta-physic, *a propri* (law as a value) to an *a posteriori* sociological-empirical stand point. It is not society that follows the values of the law, but the law itself that must adapt to its social surrounding. Koesno rejected this proposition; however, he strayed in understanding from Ehrlich’s theory, which he claimed as a free law tenet. In fact, Ehrlich’s theory was a living law theory, which was a sociology of law theory, thus making Koesno incorrect in positioning Ehrlich’s theory as sociological jurisprudence. With regards to Pound’s theory, he wrongly interpreted the word ‘law’ in ‘law as social engineering’ as ‘legislation’. As a matter of fact, ‘law’ in Pound’s context was a common law, meaning a court decision. In fact, idealistic jurisprudence supported by Koesno and sociological jurisprudence are not strongly contradictive, because both theories are meta-physic and structuralistic in nature, and the law is transmitted from above. The only difference is that sociological jurisprudence adds external interests to the law.

Koesno’s disagreement with sociological jurisprudence was caused by Indonesian legal experiences rather than the concept itself. In the Old Order regime, Soekarno used law as a tool of revolution, his political jargon, and in the New Order regime, Soeharto used law as a tool of ‘development’, favouring his cronies and evil businessmen. Koesno argued that in order to find the true spirit of Indonesian law, the legislators and judges must look closely at the Preamble of the Constitution, as well as its Articles and explanation. Meanwhile, imported Western legal perspectives should be lessened. Koesno (1994) was critical of codification, and of a hybrid legal system. He believed that a legal system that is the result of legal transplant from imported legal values will jeopardise the true and pure Indonesian legal system. Koesno’s *a priori* reasoning seems too naive and emotional, because, today, the Preamble of the Constitution has been erased and its essence transferred to the Constitution’s Articles.

**New Order developmental era**

The legal system in general, and legal education in particular, in Soeharto’s developmental era was misleading, because the law was considered a mere ‘legitimation’ of economic development. ‘Development’ soon became a much-used (and much misused) word at the time, with almost all governmental aspects being inserted with development jargon.27

Mochtar Kusumaatmadja28 had a significant role in establishing the ‘development’ notion. Kusumaatmadja was a strong protester against Soekarno’s guided democracy and the socialist economics paradigm. Kusumaatmadja was influenced by structuralist and functionalist theories, particularly from Pound, Northrop, Lasswell and McDougal, whose

---

27 These ‘development’ jargons included: cabinet of development, economic of development, national development, sustainable development, education of development. Notably, legal guidance of the government, the National Guidance (GBHN) 1973 and the National Development Five Years Plan (Repelita) II, stated that legal development had an important role in all governmental aspects.

28 He was a former Minister of Justice (1974-1978) and Minister of Foreign Affairs (1978-1988). Kusumaatmadja’s academic pinnacle was between the 1970s and 1995, coincidently the summit of Soeharto’s developmental era.

Kusumaatmadja was inclined to place the law as the core of social and political affairs. His theory of ‘law as a tool of developmental engineering’ was similar in many ways to Pound’s theory, but also had several differences. Kusumaatmadja clearly copied Pound’s sociological and pragmatism jurisprudence by favouring the state law as the main ‘tool’ to ‘domesticate’ people and ensure social order. He considered it is a patron-client relationship (Sidharta, 2012, 11).

There were several differences between Kusumaatmadja and Pound. Kusumaatmadja’s theory reduced the law to mere legislation and favour to public (state) interests by giving authority to the legislature and executive body (President) to legislate the law. Legislations were considered the most rational and effective way of making the law, compared to precedents and living adat law. He believed the legislative body, with the backing of a strong executive power, was sufficient to absorb the people’s aspirations and grass-root perspectives, which was a rather naive contention.

Kusumaatmadja’s structuralist paradigm was more radical than Pound’s and far more so than Northrop’s, because Pound, in particular, still considered social interests as significant ingredients in the law-making process. Kusumaatmadja, on the other hand, suggested that it was not the state that follows society’s aspirations, but the state law that must be positioned as a sole regulator and initiator, and society, like it or not, must obey the law of the state.

Furthermore, in the name of ‘development’, the judicial system must uphold the government policy. Kusumaatmadja situated the ideology of development above the supremacy of the law. In contrast, Pound’s context was a common law tradition in which judges have a significant role in elaborating the law and have the ability to simply re-new the law. The supreme source of law was not positive law (legislation), but rather, a legal principle that may be a custom or community value. This principle must be flexible and fluid depending on the social interests, and social interests must override state interests (Cotterrall, 1996, 23).

With regards to living adat law, Kusumaatmadja dichotomised adat law and living law by saying that adat law was an obsolete and colonial legacy law which is irrelevant for Indonesia’s development, thus the cult of adat law must cease (Rasjidi, 2012, 121). On the other hand, the living law, which was customary law, should be positioned as a guidance for state law. The living law, located outside the epicentre of government, must be modified and used for the sake of state development. Unification must be supported because it will guarantee legal certainty and support law and order, and pluralism from the Dutch legal dualism era must be forgotten because it was merely an anti-acculturation policy aimed at alienating Indonesians from modernisation (Kusumaatmadja, 1997, 185).

29 In the New Order era, the Supreme Court and its subordinate courts were under surveillance and structure from the Ministry of Justice. In that time, the court was totally under control of President Soeharto.
Indonesian legal development under developmentalism, must support national stability, and therefore, legislation must be regulated by insensitive issues only, while avoiding sensitive issues, such as human rights, the protection of labour and marginalised people. The character of the law soon changed to conservative. The first priorities of the state were to stimulate rapid economic development and promote state stability. The law became static as it was reduced into positive law, and legislation was considered self-sufficient. This led the judiciary to a singular reliance on legislature, an excessively formalist attitude. The jurists could not even imagine how to interpret the law creatively.

This was worsened by the idea that precedent was not binding, because Indonesia was a civil law country. Precedents only had a binding-power in the common law tradition, and thus, in Indonesia, judge should be less concerned with precedent. In fact, Kusumaatmadja’s argument was obsolete because there was no doubt that in all developed civil law systems, precedent was considered binding (Bedner, 2013, 263). This faulty allegation caused Indonesia’s legal development to suffer from a formalist paradigm.

Reformation Era

Despite law reforms since the fall of Soeharto, formalists and developmentalists still actively promote their ideas with the aim of putting Indonesia back on the ‘developmental track’. One followers of the late Kusumaatmadja is Erman Rajagukguk30, who fiercely upholds the notion of state developmental evolution. Rajagukguk’s ideas were influenced by Organski’s view that the modern nation has gone through three development stages: unification, industrialisation and social welfare state (Mendelson, 1969, 223).

He believes that Indonesia, like many other countries that have undergone these stages, such as Japan, England, and the United States of America, must have consecutive consistencies with these developmental stages. This view was derived from Rostow (1960) who strictly dichotomised the traditional and modern communities, and believed that the traditional community should be weakened and, if possible, eliminated in order to achieve modernisation.

Rajagukguk (2007) implicitly advised the current government to continue the developmental and industrialization policy, because, in fact, Indonesia is still in its industrialisation stage. Law and its practitioners must fully endorse economic development by creating legal certainty and stability in all aspects of business and foreign investment, and lastly educate lawyers as corporate lawyers who strongly uphold ‘the law of economic’. These strategies are the meeting point between formalists and developmentalists. Development and human rights are positioned as contradictive elements, and the state cannot address them both. Instead, the state must choose whether it wants to prioritise development while disregarding human rights, or vice versa.

This approach has its drawbacks, in that the capitalist laws must override human rights principles and disregard access to justice for marginalised groups because development is considered to be nothing more than economic growth. O’Manique (1992) suggested an alternative approach which contradicts to the Rostow’s view. He stated that

---

30 He is a legal professor in the Faculty of Law at the University of Indonesia.
development must be derived from human rights values, and the government must make laws or policies that respond to social needs (Donnelly, 1985, 29). In other words, the human rights position is higher than the law and state interests, and to achieve civilised development both human rights and development theory must be seen as fundamentally complementary and mutually reinforcing at all times.

A second person whose ideas and insight changed the performance of the Supreme Court in general, and judges and justices in particular, is Bagir Manan. Manan was being stamped as a conservative-legalistic jurist. However, he rejected the accusation by saying that the law is not merely wording, but also an understanding. This does not necessarily mean that he only considers formal written evidence in court proceedings; the judge’s tool in court is his reason, used through law-finding processes either to construct, sublimate, interpret or make the law. These processes are inherent in judicial discretion (Manan, 2011, 23). However, he still opposed the over-exposure of sociology to legal reasoning processes. Sociological facts are just one of the instruments used by judges to understand the subject matter of a case; they are needed to compile a satisfied judge’s decision. However, sociological facts must not negate legal consideration.

With regards to pluralism, Manan considered it a universal phenomenon because it was a logical consequence of living and sharing a world where everyone is different. Pluralism not only manifests in a cultural setting, but also occurs in social and economic settings. The state in general, and the judiciary in particular, respond to pluralism by exercising affirmative action policy, which is a responsive policy aimed at balancing the bargaining power between a marginalised and a superior group. Judges also have an obligation to exercise this policy, because normatively affirmative action is a manifestation of the social justice principle, explicitly stated in the Constitution. However, there is a difficulty in implementing this policy in the judiciary, because Indonesian judges are doctrinally educated by a strict dichotomy between public laws, including constitutional law, criminal law and private laws. Judges who specialise in either criminal or private laws can rarely connect legal issues with constitutional issue, which is why the court’s decisions are mostly poor in constitutional reasoning.

Manan did not wish to preserve the pristine living adat laws, but rather supported a gradual modernisation of indigenous peoples and their laws. With a significant modernisation, living adat law can gradually change, either horizontally by blending and mingling with other religions or perspectives, or vertically, through both legislations and court decisions. The judicial institution has a role to modify and contextualise the living adat law.

Despite his kind responses to living adat law, Manan still puts the state judicial institution and its judges at the centre of legal development and enforcement, a typical structuralist’s paradigm.

---

31 He is a former Chief Justice of Supreme Court. He was rather conservative compared to his colleague, Mahfud, who was a former Chief Justice of Constitutional Court, and ex-politician.
32 Interview with Bagir Manan, Jakarta, 20 March 2014.
33 Ibid.
34 Ibid.
Conclusion

In today’s world, jurisprudence has become more inclusive than exclusive. The dichotomies among legal paradigms tend to merge with each other, most notably in the case of natural law and legal formalism. However, there are still fundamental differences among them, due to a difference in point of view: external vis-à-vis internal. The wise policy would be to synthesise these legal paradigms, in order to correspond to a country’s legal, social and political context.

The state legalistic system must also be balanced by appreciating other non-legalist theories, including sociological jurisprudence, sociology of law in general and legal pluralism and living law theories in particular. An appreciation and reception of these theories is important to ease the rigidity of the state legal system and to create a legal equilibrium. Shifting the legal paradigm is necessary, but is not necessary in a radical way by ignoring state sovereignty. Thus, the idea of implementing strong legal pluralism is rather naive. Instead, state legal pluralism should be enforced.

From a modern law perspective, living adat law is a pre-modern communal lifestyle whose existence depends on communality. There is less freedom of will and intellectual independency, as intellectuality is limited by communal decisions. This communality may lead to a purification, which would eventually create exclusivism and a patron-client relationship. However, the negative effects of communality can be controlled by implementing state legal pluralism and affirmative action policy, which protect the community’s rights, limit the tendency toward segregation, while empowering the individuals within the community.

With regards to ‘development’ practice, the state in general, and judicial institutions in particular, must embrace the idea of human rights, thus development practice must be based on human rights principles, not the interests of corporations and elites.

Reference


Manan, B. (2011). Kekuasaan Kehakiman [Judiciary Power], General Lecture at Faculty of Law, Airlangga University on 1st December 2011.


**International Declaration and Conventions**

The United Nations Declaration on the Rights of Indigenous Peoples (UNDRIP).


International Labour Organisation (ILO) Convention No 169.

**Legislation**

The Indonesian 1945 Constitution (After Amendments).

Law No 5 of 1960 concerning Basic Agrarian Law.

Urgent Law No 1 of 1951 concerning Judiciary Law.
The Impact of Information Communication and Technology on Students' Academic Performance: Evidence from Indonesian EFL Classrooms

Arzal

Biodata: Arzal is one of the academics at the Department of English Education, Faculty of Letters and Humanities, State University of Gorontalo, Indonesia. He is currently undertaking his PhD at the University of Newcastle, Australia. He obtained his Master of Applied Linguistics from the University of Melbourne. Email: arzal_m@yahoo.com

Abstract

The present study examined the impact of Information Communication Technology [ICT] on a group of university students' academic performance in an Indonesian English as a Foreign Language (EFL) classroom. As the platform of the ICT usage in this current study, English learning websites was used as the independent variable. Academic performance (students' score on pre and post test) was used the dependent variable. The participants in the study were 60 students of the Department of Public Health at the State University of Gorontalo, Indonesia, i.e an experimental group of 30 students (n=30) and a control group of 30 students (n=30). They took English courses as one of the compulsory subjects in the university curriculum. This study used a mixed method of a quasi-experimental and a qualitative interview approaches. Based on the result of the quantitative method of data collection, t-tests of this study indicated that students in the experiment group performed significantly better than the students in the control group. Test results also showed that there was a significant difference between students' score on the pre- and post-test. The students' score in the post test and post test in the control group, however, were not significantly different. As interview results showed, participants expressed their positive learning experience with technologies, growing motivation in English learning, and positive feeling and confidence on their language performance.

Key words: ICT, English for Foreign Language, English learning websites

Introduction

The demand for teachers to be confident and competent users of ICT for their personal and professional lives is continually growing due to rapid changes in Information Communication technology (ICT). Teachers of English are facing a growing pressure to be more professional and highly capable of creating more engaging classrooms in order to respond to their students' needs in the digital era. ICT integration, therefore, should be an integral part of their teaching instructions (Hubbard, 2013). Over the past few decades, numerous studies have confirmed the benefits of ICT in language teaching and learning. The effective use of technology in teaching and learning increases the benefits of ICT to enable students to become active learners and to develop their problem solving, critical-thinking, and creativity skills (Hubbard, 2013; Jung, 2006; Kean, Embi, & Yunus, 2012; Klimova & Semradova, 2012). In addition, ICT offers students and teachers a more flexible and broader access to
information and learning resources. Therefore, improving students' literacy in ICT is fundamental to their personal and academic life. ICT can equip students with the necessary skills to be a lifelong learners and global citizens of the 21st century.

In higher education, a range of technologies appears to provide an exceptional opportunity to improve learning and teaching within the higher education system. At present, however, opinions are divided over the efficacy of such an approach and the extent to which technology should be embraced in teaching. In recent years, various teaching models have been developed -- including the blended learning mode -- which combines face-to-face approach and technology use. Some scholars believe that blended learning can improve teaching and learning, and support the curricular objectives (Hubbard, 2013; Peeraer & Van Petegem, 2011; Son, 2009).

Restructuring the classroom to address 21st century skills is important to meet the needs of students. Various studies have established that technology integration into classroom instruction is a slow and complex process influenced by many factors, including the amount of support the technology requires (Inan & Lowther, 2010). The U.S Congressional Office of Technology Assessment (OTA, 1995) recommended that effectively integrating technology into the teaching and learning process is one of the most important steps a nation can take to make the most of the past and continuing developments. Integrating newer technologies into education can play an important role in leveraging productivity and efficiency. The teachers who learn to integrate technology into existing curricula teach differently than teachers who did not have such training or support from the institution (Christensen, 2002). Although many educational systems have quickly embraced digital technologies, the effective inclusion of these technologies into teaching practice has encountered, and continues to encounter, practical and pedagogical barriers (Wood, Specht, Willoughby, & Mueller, 2008). However, evidence shows that barriers and challenges behind ICT integration in the classroom still exist, particularly to what extent ICT integration benefits students’ academic performance. The purpose of the present study was to examine the impact of ICT integration on students’ academic performance in one of Indonesia’s higher education institutions in Gorontalo Province by blending ICT into traditional face to face teaching instruction.

Literature review

The rapid advancement of Information Communication Technology (ICT) has dramatically increased technology use in language teaching and learning. With the Internet/World Wide Web creation and progression, for example, teachers now have more options to create effective and innovative instructional materials and teaching methods. Hubbard (2013) argues that teachers have a pivotal role in the adoption and implementation of ICT in their teaching and learning as they are the key to making learning happen. With the complexity and the richness of possible learning resources that the Internet offers, teachers face considerable challenges to create effective and efficient teaching approaches. The ultimate
goal of creating this learning environment is to boost learning outcomes. Education reforms require teachers to adopt new roles as more responsibilities for learning are given directly to the students. This change requires that teachers be proficient in advising and guiding students through more autonomous, self-directed learning processes, while at the same time monitoring curriculum standards achieved by students (Klimova, B. F., & Semradova, I. 2012; Hew, K. F., & Brush, T. 2007).

A number of recent studies have shown a positive relationship between the use of technology and academic achievement. Scholars and researchers found that students in technology-rich environments experienced positive effects on achievement in all major subject areas (Watson, 2006). Students showed increased achievement in preschool through higher education for both regular and special needs children (Kean et al., 2012). Students’ attitudes toward learning and their own self-concept improved consistently when computers were used for instruction (Walsh, 2010). Sun and Metros (2011) investigated issues of the digital divide and its impact on academic performance. The results of their study show that students’ academic performance is a function of many complex and interrelating factors (Sun & Metros, 2011). Although technology use is linked to socio-economic status and academic performance, Sun and Metros suggested that educators should try to identify whether the cause of low or high academic achievement directly results from technology use, and how technology usage interacts with and affects other factors. As a result of multi-factors, some scholars argued that achievement increased not only by incorporating technology, but by also addressing instructional design, software design, and technology capabilities.

McMahon (2009) in his study Western Australia high schools examined the relationship between students working in a technology-rich environment and their development of higher order thinking skills. He found that there are statistically significant correlations between studying within a technology-rich learning environment and the development of students’ critical thinking skills. Length of time spent in the environment has a positive, non-linear effect on the development of critical thinking skills. Students with better developed computing skills scored higher on critical thinking activities (McMahon, 2009).

Transforming teaching and learning by increasing access to and use of technology in classrooms has been at the center of most recent teaching reforms agenda (Cuban, 2001). Computers have also been introduced as breakthrough methods particularly in the language teaching and learning fields. In the middle 1980s, educational technology included more basic electronic and non-digital tools (e.g., chalkboards, overhead projectors, video cassette recorders). The assumption by school leaders was that these technologies required little additional training (Hofer, & Swan, 2011). However, as the second millennium begun, digital technology use increased around the world. In the education sector, technology integration started gathering momentum in 1994 and has continued. Educational technology can help
students get the best education possible and make a smoother transition to the work force. Technology can act as a bridge to help students move beyond theoretical understanding (Cuban, 2001)

The primary motivation for integrating ICTs into teaching and learning is the belief that it supports students in exploring and articulating thoughts, knowledge construction and theory building (Scardamalia & Bereiter, 1991), collaboration, negotiation of meanings, reflection on meaningful learning through accessing authentic information and immersing themselves in complex and contextualized learning situations (Jonassen et al. 1999). The belief that technology can have a positive impact on student learning has spawned a proliferation of studies in the past three decades, such as research studies on ICTs in education, demonstrating that the use of technology can help improve students’ self-concept and motivation and their performance in problem solving (Hew & Brush, 2007). A study conducted by Jung (2006) investigated 591 Chinese students and found that the economic and sociocultural context in which the students came from greatly influenced their language learning experience through technology.

Despite the efforts that have been made, ICT uses in classrooms have been reported repeatedly and relatively low (Ministry of Education & Culture, 2013; Machmud, 2012). Literature reveals that it is important to examine teachers’ understanding what it means to meaningfully integrate ICT into the classrooms. Some evidence from the previous studies on technology integration in English as a Foreign language classrooms in Indonesia shows that teachers are too much focused on what the technology can do, or the degree to which technologies are used in the classroom as tools, and not at how these technologies can be well-integrated into pedagogy. The fact shows that the way how ICTs are developed and marketed to Indonesian schools in way that try to alter pedagogy rather than be an effective teaching tool need to be evaluated. The ultimate goal of integrating ICT in Indonesian EFL classrooms as well as in a broader context of Asian schools should address how teaching and learning can be enhanced and how students’ learning outcome can be boosted. A study conducted by Machmud (2012) on a group of EFL teachers’ technology integration in the Indonesian province of Gorontalo, for example, revealed that teachers most frequently used technologies for non-instructional purposes. These findings support meaningful ICT integration as one of the main recommendations for teachers to improve their students’ academic performance in language learning.

The present study aimed at examining whether the use of technology in Indonesian EFL classrooms in at the university context directly contribute to the academic performance improvement by taking into account some key aspects of instructional design, technology capabilities, supportive learning environment and the cultural aspect of learning as suggested by the previous researchers.
Method

Participants

The participants of the study were 60 students of Department of Public Health, the State University of Gorontalo, Indonesia who took General English course. They took this course as one of the general and compulsory subjects they undertake at their first year of their undergraduate study. They were divided into two groups, i.e., an experiment class (n=30) and a control group (n=30).

Data Collection

A mixed method of a quasi-experimental and a qualitative interview approaches was used to collect and analyze data. Using a quasi-experiment with the pre-post test design with the control group, intervention was given to the treatment group. The control group, however, received the conventional face to face classroom instruction. A set of pre-test questions of the English proficiency which contains a four-major skills of English test was given to the group of participants both in control and experimental groups. This test was conducted to determine their existing language proficiency. The pre-test questions were the same as the ones that had been used for the post-test.

The treatment group undertook 8 meetings with the intervention of ICT usage of English learning websites and Facebook (FB) group discussion integrated into every single lesson of the meeting over a period of 8 weeks. Each participant in this treatment group joined the FB group where they would have received updated postings regarding the topic being discussed in the class. Every week, the link of the particular topic from the selected English learning website was supplied to the FB group so that they could learn and play and replay the materials. For the purpose of this study, Randal’s English learning website (http://www.esl-lab.com) was selected for several reasons, such as its content, practicality, variety of language learning activities, and the flexibility of language user leveling adjustment. With the selected English learning website, participants were assigned to integrated-language skills activities, i.e., listening, reading, writing and speaking. The topics varied in every session, and were designed to suit their interests as well as being relevant to their course. Some warm up activities were done as part of the instruction on the website to introduce and familiarize the topic. The main activity of the class combined online and conventional activities. For listening activities, for example, the participants were assigned to comprehend to the conversation from the learning website and answered the questions. The questions on these websites have a variety of forms such as a multiple choice, and matching test. Participants could check their answers and clicked the score they got at the same time. They could repeat this listening exercise as many times as they liked to get a higher score. For reading activities, participants read short paragraphs online, and answered the questions based on what they read. They could try again if they made a wrong answer. Writing and speaking activities were also integrated during the session. For example, they
practiced and drilled the conversation they had heard from the listening. Some speaking exercises and writing activities were also provided in the website.

After the completion of the 8-session treatment, the post-test, which contained the same set of questions in the pre-test, was given to the participants. Comparing results of the pre- and post-test of the participants in both groups was done to see if there were significant differences between these two groups.

**Interview**

To investigate more about the extent to which ICT integration enhances students’ learning experiences and their academic performance, a follow up qualitative interview was done to 12 students who consented to the interview. The following 3 main points guided the interview: 1) students’ confidence to use ICT in learning activities, 2) students’ experiences feelings and perspectives on how technologies benefited their learning experiences and language improvement. 3) students’ lessons learned and recommendations

**Results**

**Results from a Quasi Experiment Method**

This section presents the result of statistical analysis of the present study data. The sample of 60 students of Public Health Department, State University of Gorontalo Indonesia, i.e an experiment group of 30 students (n=30) and a control group of 30 students (n=30) was examined through their pre- and post test. Descriptive statistics for the academic achievement as dependent variables measured from the participants’ result of pre- and post test are shown in Table 1. The data obtained from the pre- test were statistically analyzed using SPSS software. The data presentation and analysis can be seen below:

**Table 1. Participants’ pre-test score in Experiment and Control Group**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Group</th>
<th>N</th>
<th>Mean</th>
<th>Std. Deviation</th>
<th>S.E Mean</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Pre Test Score</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Experiment Group</td>
<td>30</td>
<td>61.50</td>
<td>9.299</td>
<td>1.698</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Control Group</td>
<td>30</td>
<td>59.17</td>
<td>9.010</td>
<td>1.645</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Table 2. Independent t-test samples on pre-test

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Levene's Test for Equality of Variances</th>
<th>t-test for Equality of Means</th>
<th>95% Conf Interval of the Difference</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>F</td>
<td>Sig.</td>
<td>t</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Pre Test Score</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Equal variances</td>
<td></td>
<td>.066</td>
<td>.987</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>assumed</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Equal variances</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>not assumed</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The results showed that t-value of pre-test was 0.98, with the significant level greater than .05 (see Table 2). It indicates that the experiment group (M=61.50, SD=9.29) performed not significantly different to the control group (M=59.17, SD=9.01). Thus, the null hypothesis was accepted.

Table 3. Participants’ post-test score in Experiment and Control Group

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Group</th>
<th>N</th>
<th>Mean</th>
<th>Std. Deviation</th>
<th>Std. Error</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Post Test Score</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Experiment Group</td>
<td>30</td>
<td>79.00</td>
<td>7.812</td>
<td>1.426</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Control Group</td>
<td>30</td>
<td>61.83</td>
<td>10.042</td>
<td>1.833</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Table 4. Independent t-test samples on pre-test

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Levene’s Test for Equality of Variances</th>
<th>t-test for Equality of Means</th>
<th>95% Conf Interval of the Difference</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>F</td>
<td>Sig.</td>
<td>t</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Equal variances</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>7.39</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Assumed</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>7.39</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Equal variances</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>7.39</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Not assumed</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>7.39</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The results showed that t-value of post-test was 7.39, with the significant level less than .05. It indicated that the experiment group (M=79.00, SD=7.81) performed significantly higher than the control group (M=61.83, SD=10.04). Thus, the null hypothesis was rejected. Overall, the results of this study suggest positive and significant relationships between the use of ICT in the English classroom and the students’ academic performance.

**Interview Results**

This study revealed that students’ confidence to use ICT in their learning activities improved over time. At the first place, students were struggling to deal with online study and were slightly nervous in terms of their own ICT skills. However, they gradually overcame this situation as the program continued:

“the first time when I was assigned to study online with the learning website, I was a bit nervous and confused. I was not confident if I could do it. But then during the class, I was kind of adjusting myself, especially during the first meeting. I started to become comfortable on the second meeting or so.” [S3, L6 – 9]

Students found that working with other students really helped them to deal with their skills and confidence in using ICT.

“I looked at my other friends next to me who might be able to help. I was happy as I always had a chance to ask others. I was not that good with the computer and internet things, but thanks God, I have got friends who are happy to help me.” [S2, L12 – 14]
With the variety of activities provided by the learning websites, learning English challenges students in positive ways. Students found that there was a lot of excitement learning a language with computers and via the internet.

“To me, learning with technologies was a bit challenging. Learning English and in the same time learning new things with computer and internet are not always easy. However, I found it so much fun, especially when you hear people talking in English.” [S1, L 21 – 23]

Another point raised by the participants was that they had positive perspectives on how internet technologies benefit them to enrich their language learning experiences.

“I learnt much from the internet, especially pronunciation. It was a bit difficult how to pronounce some English words, as they are different from Indonesia. I learnt lots from what I heard on the conversations in the website. And sometimes I found what I was looking for, ahaha..that was what I am looking for, hehehe.” [S 5, L 12 – 14]

To sum up this section, interview results showed that participants expressed their positive learning experience with technologies, growing motivation in English learning, and positive feeling and confidence on their language performance.

Discussion and conclusion

Elements in the literature review recommend the importance of meaningful infusion of ICT into English classrooms to enhance teaching and learning (Hubbard, 2003). Studies have demonstrated that if ICT can be integrated into a meaningful way, it can significantly improve students’ academic performance, particularly students’ language skills (Alazam, Bakar, Hamzah, & Asmiran, 2012; Kean et al., 2012; Klimova & Semradova, 2012; McMahon, 2009; Nair et al., 2012). The results of the present study indicate that in the period of time, the integration of ICT in the traditional face to face English classrooms can significantly improve students’ language proficiency. However, further studies with broader samples, different context and treatments still need to be done to confirm these findings. In addition to this, this current study also found that ICT can facilitate a more positive, supportive and conducive learning environment which ultimately boost students’ motivation to learn more. This is in line with the previous study findings (e.g Sun and Metros, 2011; Jung, 2006; Kean, Embi, & Yunus, 2012).

This study findings suggest that the learning website / Internet provides the fundamental condition for the EFL learners to enable them expose themselves to the target language so the language acquisition process occurs in the same way. Empirical studies, as mentioned in the previous section, suggest that engaging EFL learners in authentic communication and putting them in the target language exposure as much as they could becomes an indispensable condition for successful foreign language learning. From the language theory point of view, language acquisition occurs when the learner is engaged in an active interaction with the target language resources and authentic materials. It is
believed that by having this condition, EFL learners will more likely acquire languages for real life in a more authentic situation so they can use it in a more meaningful way.

As to the main research questions of this study, it is possible to suggest that the careful use of ICT in English classrooms can impact on the outcomes of EFL learners’ achievement. Further, the use of ICT seems to increase with students’ positive feeling about the extent to which they benefit from ICT integration. The results showed that the more positive the students’ feeling, the more they engaged with the learning activities. This outcome then stimulates their learning motivations as the pre-condition for the improvement of their academic performance. Finally, teachers’ total ICT use was related positively to their stances toward technology in the classroom. This study, however, has limitations in aspects such as the size of participants, the procedure of data collection, and the frequency of the treatment. Therefore, this study calls for further investigations with more representative sizes and participants’ background.

The present study aimed at examining the impact of ICT integration on students’ academic performance in English subject. The context of the study was the State University of Gorontalo in the Indonesian province of Gorontalo. Overall, results reveal that the ICT integration into English classrooms can significantly improve students’ language proficiency. This study also suggests that infusing ICT into English classrooms in a meaningful way provides a supportive learning environment for the students.

Reference


Poetic Reaction to Political Excess: W.S. Rendra, Peacock and People’s Poet

Moira Neagle

Biodata: Moira Neagle is a Bachelor candidate at Faculty of Arts, Charles Darwin University, Northern Territory, Australia. Her research interests are in Bahasa Indonesian and the nature of this language. Her contact email: moira.neagle@bigpond.com

Abstract

W.S. Rendra (1936 – 2009) was an Indonesian dramatist and poet. During the years of the Suharto’s reign, W.S. Rendra was Indonesia’s major contemporary poet. He initially was a leader of avant-garde theatre through his writing and performing. However, he became a poet who dared to speak out against the ruling regime of Indonesia. He was imprisoned for nine months in 1979 and his poetry readings and theatrical performances were often banned. His poetry criticised the political landscape of his nation through a diverse range of poetic techniques and vibrant missives. This paper focuses on six long poems which are passionate observations of the political and day to day realities of Indonesia during the years when Suharto was the supreme President. His poetry attracted the populous as well as identifying him as a political activist.

Keywords: W.S. Rendra, Indonesia, Suharto, Poetry, Religion, Symbolism, Burung Merak, Political Activism, Class, Poverty, Colloquial, Corruption

Introduction:

The maxim, the pen is mightier than the sword, could be aptly applied to the works of W.S. Rendra. In the political context of 1960s and 1970s Indonesia, the focus era of this paper, oppression and corruption reigned. Rendra used his words to inform people and as a clarion call to oppose the New Order during this period. His poetry and his dramatic readings of it challenged the New Order and in so doing, he attracted large audiences and the ire of those in power.

This paper describes the man and the political landscape of his country, Indonesia, through the turbulent years of the 1960’s and 1970’s. It contains examination of a number of his poems with a view to identifying his literary style, diverse poetic techniques and vivid messages. The poems examined are Nyanyian Duniawi (A Wordly Song from Blues Untuk Bonnie 1974), Pemandangan Senjakala (Twilight View 1968), Nyanyian Angsa (Swan Song 1971), Bersatulah Pelacur-Pelacur Kota Jakarta (Prostitutes of Jakarta – Unite 1968), Khotbah (Sermon 1968) and Pesan Pencopet Kepada Pacarnya (A Pick-pocket’s Advice To His Mistress 1967). These poems were chosen for their vehement commentaries of the political context of his homeland. His poetry made him a political activist when it was dangerous to be such; however, his ideas had significant resonance and impact.

Rendra carefully crafted ideas and delivered them with engaging theatrics to large live audiences. He used the cadence of his language and his passion to charismatically
perform. He became renowned for his colour and boisterous delivery. Thus, this sage of his time took on the colour and showmanship of a burungmerak (peacock).

A profile of W.S. Rendra

Willibrordus Surendra Broto Rendra was born in 1937 into a Catholic family. As an adult, he converted to Islam and simplified his name to Rendra. He studied English literature and culture at Gajah Mada University in Yogyakarta. However, he did not complete these studies as he became preoccupied with staging plays. His first play was “Dead Voices,” staged in 1963 (Prijosusilo 2009).

He became enthralled with the craft of performance. As his popularity spread as a dramatist and poet, Rendra drew on his traditional religious ritual performances as well as emerging avant-garde styles to enhance his presentations. Rendra has been credited with introducing modern theatre techniques, particularly through his work with the Bengkel Teater which he founded in 1968 (Prijosusilo). It was through his artistic presentations and his own colourful manner that he became known as the “Burung Merak” (the Peacock) by the press. His popularity grew as a poet through the 1950s. He took delight in promoting himself as cosmopolitan, flamboyant maverick.

Throughout his life, he was highly influential as a poet across Indonesia and remained so until his death in 2009, aged 74 years. It is an accepted principle that a Javanese poet must be a guardian of the spirit of the nation (Bramantyo Prijosusilo 2009). This was a role he took seriously and with deliberate intent.

The times in which Rendra lived

Rendra lived through a tempestuous time in Indonesian history. Indonesia declared independence at the end of World War II. Initially, independent Indonesia was a parliamentary democracy. Nevertheless, there were many opposing forces contesting the politics of Indonesia.

In 1959, President Sukarno introduced ‘Guided Democracy.’ This period saw a reduction of parliamentary power and an increase in Sukarno’s personal power. The military was developing its own power base and wealth. These factors were problematic in terms of the health of the Indonesian democracy. An alleged Coup was attempted on 30 September 1965. This led to the subsequent and systematic elimination of Communists and left wing sympathisers all the way down to village level. Eventually, Suharto took power and established the New Order regime.

During the years of Guided Democracy (a poetically euphemistic term in itself), many freedoms were denied, even violently suppressed. However, amid such authoritarianism, new forms of prose, drama and poetry arose.

These were chaotic times and the artists speaking out, articulating the rage and frustration of the people attracted large audiences. Rendra was a significant voice amongst
these artists. During a poetry reading in 1978, Suharto’s military agents threw ammonia bombs on to the stage where he was presenting and arrested him. He was imprisoned for nine months without any charge and was not permitted to give public performances for another seven years. However, this experience prompted him to write more poetry. One poem, ‘Paman Doblang’ (Uncle Doblang,) inspired by his experience in jail, was set to music by the Indonesian rock band KantataTakwa (Prijosusilo, 2009).35

Rendra’s courage to express opposition to the politics of his era was extensively admired and he survived when the other political activists did not.

**Rendra’s poetry voices political truths**

In the mid-1960s, after four years study of acting in New York, Rendra returned with a new and far more direct style of writing. It was blunt, even considered blasphemous, as can be seen in his poem *Nyanyian Angsor Swan Song*. His sharp and candid words were flung against the politics of his homeland and struck like a slap.

By the 1970s, Rendra was prolific and explosive in his output of poetry and theatre. This creativity was integral to his political activism against the dictatorship and was voiced loudly until 1978, when he was imprisoned (Lane 2010).

Rendra’s poem, *Nyanyian Duniawi* (A Wordly Song from Blues Untuk Bonnie 1974) speaks of economic class differences, hunger, misery, passion and insurrection against the established norms (Rendra in Aveling p.42, 1974). He uses the metaphor of a ‘gadisitukucumbu di kebun manga’ (I make love to a maiden in the mango garden) to depict the sweet attraction of a better option. This maiden represents the desire of the people to oppose their degraded lives,

‘Her heart is wild and fiery’ (Aveling. 1974. p.43)

and passion to tackle that which is oppressing her people.

‘trampling hunger and thirst underfoot,’ (Ibid.)

This was deeply attractive to a populous hurting severely amid political catastrophe.

‘In our misery we reach out
In the dark and the shadows
(the passion of our rebellion roars).’ (ibid.)

The poet rejoices in her existence and commitment,

‘And her fierce laughter
Makes my heart glad.’ (ibid.)

---

35 For further reading on the Guided Democracy era see Max Lane. ‘Mass Mobilisation In Indonesian Politics, 1960 to 2001: towards a class analysis’ A doctoral thesis, University of Wollongong, 2009
What she suggests is the cover offered by darkness out of fear of repercussions, regardless of how alluring it appears.

‘In the shadows of the trees
her body shines
like a golden deer.’ (Ibid.)

What she offers is not complete, not totally defined but, nevertheless, deeply attractive.

‘Her unfinished breasts
are like half ripe fruit,’ (Ibid.)

Rendra sees himself as a part of this ‘maiden’s’ movement. He is at one with it

‘I embrace her
as I embrace life and death’ (Ibid.)

She is his motivator, his personal coach whose words will maintain his focus of intent.

‘And her fast breathing
whispers in my ears.’ (Ibid.)

The impact of what she can achieve is amazing and has its own inherent beauty:

‘How amazed she is
at the rainbow
beneath her hooded lids.’ (Ibid.)

The poet then suggests that even their forefathers are observing how this will play out,

‘Our ancient ancestors
appear from the centre of the dark
coming nearer
in their ragged clothing
and squat
watching us.’ (Ibid.)

They, too, it would appear, have a vested interest in this insurrection.

In the poem, ‘Pemandangan Senjakala,’ (Twilight View 1968), Rendra is far more direct in his use of language to rage against the actions which had killed Indonesians in the so-called communist coup of 1965.

‘Smell of munitions in the air. Smell of corpses. And horseshit.’ (Aveling, p.45)
The repetition of words is evident in this poem to accentuate the shameful reprisals upon the weak. He paints a dastardly scene of the devastation which is being wrought against the people.

‘A pack of wild dogs
eat hundreds and hundreds of human bodies
the dead and the half dead.
And among the scorched trees of the forest
puddles of blood form into a pool.’  (Ibid.)

The forces of evil are ‘Kelelawar-lelewarraksa,’ vampire bats, that rape and kill, wild dogs are eating corpses and the evidence is the stark red of blood.

The dead are viewed as if they are martyrs who are cleansed,

‘Twenty angels come down from heaven
to purify those in their death throes’  (Ibid.)

Nevertheless, the horror persists against the innocent,

‘ambushed by the giant vampires and raped’  (Ibid.)

Even when there is a ‘vital breeze which travels gently on’ (Ibid.), it is just a lull in the devastation. Such a bloody breeze will only serve to inflame the passion of the opposing forces, the ‘angels and bats.’ In the last two lines of this poem, Rendra seemingly turns to speak directly to the two sides of the Indonesian political discontent and charges them both with these crimes and the inherent havoc,

‘for you have worked so intently to create it.’  (Ibid.)

After writing in a ballad-like form in his early years, Rendra's poetry developed into a predominantly narrative style. He frequently adopts the colloquial to describe and condense the people to their exact lives and lifestyles. The poem, Nyanyian Angsa(Swan Song) is an example of his use of the retelling of a story intermingled with symbolism. This long poem, on one level, tells the story of an aging and no longer so pretty whore who is thrown out of a brothel. She is seriously ill; she has no money and owes money to many, including her doctor. He is no longer prepared to give her any more than token medication, a vitamin C injection, because she cannot pay.

Within this narrative, the subject of the poem speaks in the first person,

‘I tremble with fear’  (Aveling, p.48)

The whore calls herself by name, ‘Maria Zaitun is my name’ (Ibid. p.47) and this is repeated at pertinent points through the poem. Her name sounds distinctly Christian and appears to
make reference to the Christian religious significance of (Ave) Maria, as in the Mother of Christ.

Again, in this poem, Rendra uses repetition of words and in short sentences:

‘Takadaangin. Taka da mega.
(No wind. No clouds’ (Ibid. p.47)
‘No suitcase
No possessions’ (Ibid.)
‘Her eyes red
Her lips dry
Her gums bleeding’ (Ibid.)

These short simple statements, each beginning with the same word, emphasize the scene he is creating.

Maria is the whole of the opposing parts of the Indonesian people. She is ailing as they are. She is penniless, as they are. She is corrupted by disease which perpetrates the offensive symptoms of ulcers, bleeding gums and her stench. But Maria Zaitun is oblivious to their judgements,

‘I can feel nothing. Think nothing
Maria Zaitun is my name
An unfortunate and frightened whore’ (Ibid. p.51)

Receiving little assistance from the doctor, Maria walks shoeless on the hot asphalt of the road to the church. But its doors are locked. Maria is denied help again and again from the institutions which are meant to assist, to be empathetic, to be supportive. She waits outside the presbytery for the pastor who is still eating his lunch.

‘She waits dazed by the sun’ (Ibid.)

It is as though even nature confounds her.

The pastor eventually comes outside to her,

‘having picked the remains of the meal from his teeth
he lights a cigar’ (Ibid.)

The distinction between these two characters is starkly drawn. The pastor reeks of wealth and privilege.

‘sllmell of wine from his mouth
Slippers of crocodile skin’ (Ibid.)
Direct speech is used by the characters Maria encounters throughout the poem. Maria states to the priest,

“I want to confess my sins”  (Ibid.)

Her sin is shocking to the priest. It goes to the core of evil by his Christian standards.

“Yes, I have VD”

Hearing this the pastor takes two steps back

His face contracts’  (Ibid. p.53)

Such a sickness speaks of sin. The pastor is aghast at the depths of her immorality and the poet stresses this through the simple and highly effective underscoring of the passing of time as he processes this horrifying information:

‘Three soundless seconds
Matahariterusmenyala
(The sun continues to burn)’  (Ibid.)

He cannot conceive that she chose to sin thus,

“You were led into sin”  (Ibid.) and

“You were deceived by the devil”  (Ibid.)

But, no, it was neither of these causes. Instead, it was the scourge of poverty. Maria knows that her life ‘has been a failure’ and through this simple truth, Rendra is drilling to the heart of what ails his people - poverty. Maria is the poor of Rendra’s country who have been offered salvation from a Christian Church which will not help those who are reduced to immoral acts in order to feed themselves. She represents all for whom political opposition rebels against the status quo. It is her swan song after all, her last song.

Maria knows that her life is diminishing and she seeks the comfort of the dying that there will be compassion and forgiveness. However, there is none from this harsh pastor:

“you are some sort of wild tigress
Maybe you are mad”  (Ibid.)

The pastor states that she is in need of psychiatric help, not religious help.

The loving god is not offering her help but accusation:

‘The angel who guards heaven
whose face is arrogant and malicious
and whose sword burns
points accusingly at me’  (Ibid. p.55)
There is nought she can do to save herself or to gain any degree of comfort.

‘I am tired, powerless
Cannot cry. Cannot speak’ (Ibid.)

And, again she reiterates:

‘Maria Zaitun is my name
A hungry and thirsty prostitute’ (Ibid.)

The reader cannot imagine that her plight could worsen but

‘Suddenly while crossing the street
she slips on dogshit’ (Ibid.)

She longs for this life of suffering to end but the ‘angel who guards paradise’ is sadistic and revengeful and perpetrates rape.

‘Loathingly
he thrusts his virile sword
into my crotch’ (Ibid. p.57)

The suffering is not to end but to be endured, as it is for the Indonesian people. Even at twilight,

‘The angel who guards paradise
resolutely drives her away’ (Ibid.p.59)

Night offers her some relief initially.

‘Maria Zaitun is no longer afraid’ (Ibid.)

This time of the day affords her some rest from the heat of the ‘stinker’ sun and allows her to remember better times bathing in the river with her mother.

‘She is no longer lonely
And her fear has gone
She feels as if she is with an old friend’ (Ibid.)

But, too soon, the pain that has dominated her life is reasserted. She confesses to the night with a heavy heart, and again Rendra uses the metaphor of ‘Malaikatpenjagafirdaus,’

‘The angel who guards paradise
whose face is cold and malicious
Refuses to hear’ (Ibid.p.61)

There is no salvation to be found from him.
At this point in the poem, the poet states the scene in straightforward nouns to sum up the dilemma Maria faces:

‘Time
Moon
Trees
River
Syphilis
Ulcers
Woman
Like glass
River reflecting the bright light’ (Ibid.)

At her lowest point, a man reaches out to her from the other side of the river. He is handsome and his loving touch gives her peace and calm that she has never dared to hope. Maria kisses his body and discovers

‘In his left side
In both hands
In both feet’ (Ibid.63)

From these scars, she recognizes who he is and

‘He nods his head. “Indeed. Yes”’ (Ibid.p.65)

He is Jesus Christ and with him, Maria is no longer afraid

‘Loneliness and misery are destroyed’ (Ibid.)

Her nemesis, ‘the angel who guards paradise’ is thwarted and

‘Dancing I enter the gates of paradise
and eat as many apples as I want’ (Ibid.)

Through this ending, Rendra offers hope to the impoverished, the sick, the homeless; he allows the dream of salvation to persist as Maria Zaitun enters the Garden of Eden where she can eat as many apples as she so desires.

‘Maria Zaitun is my name
whore and bride both’ (Ibid.)

The two factions can exist side by side.
Rendra uses the metaphor of ‘pelacur,’ a slut or prostitute, again in the poem, ‘Bersatulah pelacur-pelacur kota Jakarta’ or “Prostitutes of Jakarta – Unite!” written in 1968 to refer to the people of Indonesia. The writer is the speaker in this poem, as in many of Rendra’s poems.

By the 1970s, Rendra was the vanguard of left-wing political analysis and he highlighted the class polarisation and associated exploitation of the proletariat in this poem (Lane 2009). He supports the Jakarta prostitutes and urges them to rise up against the leaders of the revolution who act as they want and in so doing, makes them suffer. The speaker reminds the prostitutes of the misery they experience which is due to their inappropriate actions. These leaders use the prostitutes and they are also the ones who would seek to crush them because they foolishly believe they are the source of Indonesia’s cancerous society. The speaker invokes

‘You are a part of the proletariat
they have created’        (Ibid.p.31)

The title of this poem is a play on the Marxist slogan of, ‘Workers of the world unite.’ The people have been used and abused, as prostitutes are and then are left scared, shamed and weakened. The lack of employment is the main reason these women have become prostitutes. He states that the reason why the prostitutes of Jakarta service the politicians and senior-civil-servants is due to the very real threat of hunger, the yoke of poverty, the long futile search for work. He adds, too, that there is no point in getting an education, as this will not raise you out of poverty. Thus, Rendra invokes dialectical materialism as Marx defined because of the class divisions in Indonesian society and what this means for the poor.

Initially, Rendra opposed Communist sympathisers. However, as the tyranny of the Suharto years compounded, his poetry and plays became more and more left wing in tone and the ideas expressed.

Prostitutes are those on the lowest rung of the class structure and it is they who must carry the revolution to its rightful outcome for they are the ones blamed by the leaders for the desperate state of the Indonesian nation. However, it is difficult to denigrate such people beyond their current despair,

‘It is harder to put you down
than a political party’        (Ibid. p.31)

The poet allows for regret but despair is not to be permitted.

‘Regret as you may
But don’t despair
Or allow yourselves to be sacrificed.’   (ibid. p.27)
This incantation is repeated again later in the poem.

He urges them to brush or, in this case, ‘comb’ off their sorrows and to rise up to shield themselves and to oppose and, on no condition,

‘allow yourselves to be sacrificed.’ (Ibid.)

Rendra is disgusted with a government which speaks of ‘national struggle’ and then assaults its citizens. The pelacur-pelacur are denounced but simultaneously referred to as

‘the inspiration of the revolution’ (ibid.)

Rendra speaks to individual pelacur-pelacur – Sarinah and Dasima. The name, Sarinah means spiritually intense with the ability to sting or charm, and Dasima means companion or mistress. The revolutionary leaders bolstered the peoples’ hopes with words beckoning prosperity but they did this whilst abusing them. Rendra uses explicitly sexual language to stress this exploitation.

‘Their bolts too rapidly shot.’ (Ibid. p. 29)

The rampant corruption of the country is simply another chain around the necks of the people:

‘could only open the door of opportunity
if you would open your legs.’ (Ibid.)

In ‘BersatulahPelacur-pelacurkota Jakarta,”’ Rendragoes on to declare ‘Merekaharus…’ repeatedly to emphasize what must occur, what concessions must be provided, what blame must be accepted;

‘They must give you work
They must return your standing
They too must bear the weight of their mistakes.’ (Ibid.)

He urges the prostitutes to take up the only arms they possess to oppose their tormentors;

‘Take up sticks
Wave your bras on the ends of them
...waving them like flags they have disgraced.’ (Ibid.)

They have the ultimate power because of the service they provide:

‘Strike for a month
soon they will be committing adultery
with their brothers’ wives.’ (Ibid. p.33)
Such chaos will bring the nation to its knees as the powerful men will not allow the desecration of the women they own.

His Catholic upbringing is evident in a number of his poems, including *Khotbah Sermon, 1968*. This, too, is an extended narrative style poem. Despite the heat of the day, a young priest is described in beatific terms but his words perplex the parishioners

“’Now let us disperse.  
There is no sermon today.’” (Ibid.p.3)

The parishioners remained in their seats,

‘Their mouths hung open  
they stopped praying  
but they all wanted to hear.’ (Ibid.)

It is as though the populous wanted to be reassured by the old institutions in which they had had staunch faith but, suddenly, nothing was forthcoming. The silence does not last:

‘Then all at once they complained  
and together with the strange voice from their mouths  
came a foul stench  
which had to be quickly stifled.’ (Ibid.)

Rendra is again using a religious metaphor to speak of the division within his country. Most lines are short sentences and he frequently begins a set of sentences with the same pronoun:

‘their faces looked sad.  
Their eyes questioned.  
Their mouths gaped’ (Ibid.p.5)

Direct speech is used by the priest and the parishioners are silent. Only their demeanour expresses the will of the people.

The priest is the people’s leader. The parishioners want so much more from their leader but he seemingly has nothing constructive to offer. He is young with still so much to offer and he needs time to

‘meditate on the glory of God.’ (Ibid.p.3)

The reader can sense the increasing fear and desperation of the priest:

‘Father. Father. Why hast Thou forsaken me?’ (Ibid.p.5)
This line is an echo of a line from the Bible when Jesus is on the cross at Golgotha, he calls out to his Lord:

"My God, my God, why have you forsaken me?" (The Bible, Matthew 27:46)

At this point in Rendra’s poem, he casts a denigrating image of the Indonesian people sitting fixed and non-reactive:

‘Like a flock of hungry lazy jackals
they hang their mouths.’ (Ibid.p,5)

The parishioners remain seated waiting for their leader to deliver the message they are desperate to hear.

‘...because it was so hot
And of the misery they bore.
The stench was extraordinarily foul
And their questions too stank foully.’ (Ibid.)

All the priest can offer is platitudes:

‘Life is very difficult
Dark and difficult
There are many torments’ (Ibid.)

The people and the poet stop listening as the priest drones on

‘........ra-ra-ra-
Ra-ra-ra, hum-pa-pa, ra-ra-ra.’ (Ibid.)

The priest’s words descend into nonsense and still he buzzes on.

Eventually, the parishioners find their collective voice and echo his platitudes with the same banality:

‘All spoke together:
Ra-ra-ra.Hum-pa-pa.’ (Ibid.p.7)

This prompts a redirection in the priest’s non-sermon:

‘"To the men who like guns
Who fix the flags of truth to their bayonets-points”’ (Ibid.)

And again his speech returns to nonsense. However, amid the ‘li-li-li’s there are lines of ironic clarity:
‘Lift your noses high
so you don’t see those you walk on.’ (Ibid)

And

‘Cleanse the blood from your hands
so as not to frighten me
then we can sit and drink tea
and talk of the sufferings of society
and the nature of life and death.’ (Ibid.)

The parishioners then respond:

‘Joyfully the people answered with:
La-la-la, li-li-li, la-li-lo-lo
They stood. They stamped their feet on the floor
Stamping in one rhythm and together
Uniting their voices in
La-la-la, li-li-li, la-li-lo-lo.’ (Ibid.)

Unwittingly, the priest has united his parishioners and their voices in unison to mock him. This unity gives them strength and they begin to shout together:

‘precisely and rhythmically’ (Ibid.p.9)

At this stage of the poem, the priest and parishioners are gaining energy from each other until the whole becomes a noisy and calamitous scene. The rhythms of the priest’s words are taken up by the parishioners with an energy which is borne of extended deprivation; the one is echoed by the other.

‘The people explode with the passion of their lives.’

They stood on the pews.
Banged with their feet.
Bells, gongs, door-pailings, window-panes
If it made noise they pounded on it.
With the one rhythm
In accompaniment to their joyous shouts of:
This is all escalating to a cacophony. The words on the page are not making sense, the protagonists in the poem are not making any sense; emotions are raging.

‘Let us pulverize ourselves.’ (Ibid.)

The scene becomes like a tribal dance:

‘They rubbed their bodies against each other
Men against women. Men against men.
Women with women. Everyone rubbed.’ (Ibid. p.11)

Simultaneously, Rendra is using a metaphor full of irony, for the dance is also the friction between people that this throbbing dance, the political opposition prevalent in his country at that time, in which the people are engaged. The expression, ‘Everyone rubbed.’ is a double entendre, referring to the rubbing of the dance and the rubbing of opposing views against each other. This metaphor is extended to include the people ‘rubbing’ against the core institutions of their country, including the religious institutions.

‘And some rubbed their bodies against the walls of the church.’ (Ibid.)

Rendra extends the religious metaphor by, again, using part quotes from the Bible by paraphrasing The Ten Commandments:

‘thou must not steal.
Junior civil servants stop stealing carbon.
Serving-girls stop stealing fried chicken bones.’ (Ibid.)

Simultaneously, Rendra is mocking the biblical intent of statements carved in stone by referring to such pedestrian examples.

His poetic wielding flame is then turned upon the Communists:

‘everything belongs to everyone.
Everything is for everyone.
We must be one. Us for us.
Cha-cha-cha, cha-cha-cha.’ (Ibid.)

At this point, the scene descends into chaos. The people ‘roared like animals’ (Ibid. p.13) and acted as a mob. They began to steal whatever they could take from the church: candelabra, curtains, carpets and ‘statues covered with jewels’ (Ibid.). This scene is reminiscent of Matthew 21:12 in which Jesus entered the temple and drove out all those who were buying and selling in the temple, and overturned the tables of the money changers and the seats of those who were selling. He said to them, 'It is written, 'My House shall be a house of prayer'; but you are making it a robbers’ den.'
The shrill voice of an old woman yells above the mayhem,

“’I am hungry. Hungry.Hu-u-unggrrryyyy.’” (Ibid.)

This is enough to remind the impassioned crowd of their own hunger and ‘Their eyes burned.’ (Ibid.)

The priest has lost control of the horde. He directs them to stop and to go home but they do not.

‘They press forward.
The church was smashed. And their eyes flashed.’ (Ibid.)

The priest patronizingly tries to remind them

“’Hunger must be overcome by wisdom.”’ (Ibid. p.15)

The horde becomes a pack and they attack the priest, humiliating him, raping him ‘in a noisy throng’ and then they chop him to pieces. This is a scene full of terror, barbarism and hatred.

People are no longer individuals, they are a murderous pack.

‘They feasted in the strength of their unity.’
They drank his blood.
They sucked the marrow from his bones.
Until they had eaten everything
And there was nothing left.’ (Ibid.)

After all of this mayhem, nothing is left. With the build-up of this scene, it is as if there were drums in the background growing louder and louder until this final act of cannibalism and the crescendo of the scene is reached.

The denouement is immediate and Rendra changes the mood completely with his parting, and imbued with deep irony, last word,

‘Fantastic.’ (Ibid.)

Thus the poem ends.

Rendra chooses characters to represent the divisive political factions operating in Indonesia at that time. In ‘Pesan Pencopet Kepada Pacarnya’ (A Pick-pocket’s Advice To His Mistress 1967), the mistress tantalises with her ‘elegant body’

An animal metaphor features in this poem too, and this time it is bats.

‘The bats fly chasing each other
a sign afternoon is drawing on’ (Ibid. p.35)
These two lines are repeated a number of times through the poem, inferring that different forms of evil chasing each other repeatedly.

The line,

‘Marrying me would only spoil your chances’ (Ibid.)

is made as though commitment would be a step too far, for his livelihood is unpredictable,

‘as a pickpocket my fate is chancy’ (Ibid.)

Both characters, a pickpocket and a mistress, live on the edge. Their lives are fraught with the vicissitudes of fate, they have so little control over their lives. His imagery becomes disturbingly visual, as in the line,

‘The sun vomits painfully into the sea’ (Ibid.)

Realities of life cannot be ignored and ‘love is only of secondary importance (Ibid.p.37). The nation must think of its future, its children. All must be done to ensure their lives are better than those of the current generation opposing tyranny. Rendra faces the reality of the depth of corruption in his country.

‘Start cheating your man right away
Siphon off what he owns
To make your own life easier’(Ibid. p. 37)

And, again in the lines,

‘He enjoys being bribed and corrupting others
Cheat him in exchange
That’s how it’s done
Thieves cheat thieves, that’s usual’ (Ibid.)

Trust and honour are easily smeared away:

‘Among thieves honour is like lipstick’ (Ibid.)

He instructs that ‘cunning above all,’ ‘courage,’ ‘perseverance’ and ‘resoluteness’ (Ibid.) are the virtues which must be adopted so that

‘The little people can’t stay beaten for ever’ (Ibid.)

Rendra’s cynicism of the ruling elite is most evident in this vituperate poem.

‘Strive to meet a minister
and to be his mistress…….’ (Ibid.)

‘as long as you are vigorous and your breasts firm
This always attracts them
your idle chatter will be of no account
as long as you are spirited, assured and quite confident
The very model of a minister in fact. (ibid.p.39)

The poet’s hope for the unborn child is that he be taught to fight. Future generations will have to be vigilant for

‘an enemy is evil always
And must be hit until he’s crushed
This is the essence of the art of self-survival’ (Ibid.)

His scathing assessments include denigration of the police as well as the military:

‘If he can, let him be a policeman or a soldier
So that he doesn’t have to buy rice
But gets it from the state
with a nice uniform’ (ibid.p.41)

He ends this poem by reiterating how everything remains the same, day after day.

Rendra’s literary style

The poetic styles Rendra used to voice his social criticism were dominated by a narrative approach in free verse; some of his poems are ballad-like in structure. Within this structure, he uses the rhythm and beat of words and the repetition of words to create mood and to accentuate the nature of human responses to passionate action. Sometimes his use of sounds in this way is similar to those he may well have used in creating dialogue and atmosphere in his plays. This is apparent in the poem, ‘Khotbah’ (‘Sermon’) in which words form beats that are played out and repeated in rhythms to accentuate the message.

His poetry incorporated the use of numerous poetic techniques including metaphors, similes, double entendres, repetitions, paradoxes, ironic twists, rhetorical questions, ironies, and satire. He would vehemently castigate the masses as well as their oppressors with his cutting use of these devices.

The nature of the Indonesian language promotes the use of repetition as plural nouns are repeated. Rendra uses this to his poetic advantage. The hard/soft/hard/soft cadence of Indonesian speech produces a regular beat. Repetition and rhythm is evident in the following from Sajak Burung-Burung Kondor (Birds Condor 1973):

Beribu-ribuburungkondor,
berjuta-jutaburungkondor,
bergerakmenujukegunungtinggi,
Thousands of condors, 
millions of condors, 
move toward the high mountains, 
and there get entertainment from deserted. 
Because only lonely 
able to suck revenge and hurt.

The repetition of these numbers in Indonesian and the allied alliteration pronounces a musical beat like that of the heart. Thus, the rhythmic oral delivery sounds similar to a drumbeat urging audiences to internalize the meanings and to follow the drummer boy.

He frequently used loathsome animals as metaphors. In his poem, ‘Khotbah’ (‘Sermon’), he describes the Indonesian people ‘Sebagaiseklompokserigala yang malasdanlapar’ (‘Like a flock of hungry lazy jackals’) (Avelling p.4); in ‘Pemandangansenjakala 1968,’ (‘Twilight View’)‘Sekolompokanjing liar’ (‘A pack of wild dogs’) (Ibid. p.44) and ‘Kelelawar-kelelawar raksasa’ (‘vampire bats’) (Ibid.). These are all mean and dastardly animals not deserving of empathy and his subjects are justified by such ugly comparisons.

His words could also be heartfelt and deeply moving:

‘The wind’s heart ached
as it watched the sad strides of peasant labourers,
working on fertile land,
which did not give them prosperity’ (Rendra cited in Lane, 2009)

This translated stanza may not have the same soft, simple musical tones of the Indonesian language version; however, it still captures the sorrow and exhaustion of the people. His observations of the poor stated their downtrodden existence and also imbued them with the spirit of regal birds such as eagles and condors, even when they were overwhelmed by anguish and pain.

In his early poetry, Rendra writes of human suffering in a sympathetic voice and his style is influenced by the traditional song form of the tembang, a style of classical vocal music which is sung in free verse poetry (Literatuan 1976).

There is evidence also of the music of Negro Spirituals in the poem, Khotbah (Sermon), integrated with the chant of the Balinese Kecak monkey dance. Such an approach
is indicative of his sense of drama in writing and performance (Literatuan 1976). The repetition and sing-song aspects are hypnotizing as are many such American religious events. It imbues religious-style verve to the cant of such political promises.

With the translation process, not all poetic nuances can be transcribed. The cultural context with regard to the way the writer feels at that time and place cannot be wholly translated. The link between language and what has been described as ‘an outside reality’ hinders any form of equivalence when translating. The shades of language which include the colloquial language, its structure and musicality cannot always be retained in the process of translation. It is as if a new poem is created in the best possible conversion from the original (Heald 2001).

The impact of his poetry

Once the ban on performing was lifted, Rendra resumed performing and reading, starring in his own eight-hour long play, Panembahan Reso, a work centred on the succession of power in Indonesia. In his later years, Rendra received numerous literary awards, including the Art of the Indonesia Government award in 1970, the Prize of the Academy Jakarta, and the Main Book Prize of the Ministry of Education and Culture in 1976 (www.pippoetry.blogspot.com.au/2010/11/w-s-rendra.).

Rendra lived through a momentous time during the 1960s and 1970s, both politically and culturally, for the Indonesian people. He was seen as one of the writers who had been credited with modernizing Indonesian poetry and giving it life in what was a new adopted national language (Hatleey 2009). He gave voice to the anger of the young adult generation who had enthusiastically supported the rise to power of the New Order, only to end up feeling betrayed by its corruption, authoritarianism and its lack of concern for any social equity. (Hatleey 2009)

Rendra contributed to social change by creating public spaces for political opposition to the government. His theatre and poetry reading performances gave voice to the thoughts and feelings of his audiences and these were unprecedented in the time of the New Order. His ability to attract large numbers of people generated political rallies in a sense. He popularized poetry in ways which had not been previously used in Indonesia (Febriansyah p.15). However, whilst his poetry often spoke of the struggles of the poorer classes, it was difficult for such people to actually attend his readings.

Rendra was the principal voice against the dictatorship and injustice in the 1970s, and yet, he remained very wary of attempts to create institutionalized protest. He believed that, as a poet, he must be a “voice from the wind,” beyond the reach of any organized political force (Lane 2009).

Whilst Rendra was committed to writing about the daily struggles of the poorer classes, it was not from personal experience. In his poem, Orang-orang Miskin (Poor People
1978), he is urging attention to their plight but he refers to them as ‘they,’ placing himself outside of their experience (Febriansyah p.30).

‘They have lost their battles
They are tantalized by their dreams’ (Aveling 2001:151)

His poems were symbolically critical of oppression and he subjectively interpreted such experiences. He used artistic perception rather than a social viewpoint. His poor people are stereotyped by such phrases as ‘living in the gutters,’ and ‘the clattering melee.’ They are mere ‘Grass and moss beside the highway’ (Ibid.).

**Conclusion**

Rendra lived through a politically turbulent era of Indonesian history. The authoritarian New Order did not hesitate to silence those who bravely expressed artistic opposition. Such repression gave voice to the poet and dramatist, Rendra, who articulated the populous’ social criticisms of the times. His words spoke of disparities: wealth and poverty, privileged and the downtrodden, the law and reality, cruelty and compassion.

During the period 1973 to 1978, Rendra was influential in opposing Suharto’s dictatorship. He did this through the performance of his plays and his energetic and dramatic public poetry readings. Imprisonment for his opposition did not deter him; instead it added experience and fire to his writing. Following Rendra’s death, commentators reflected upon the impact of his words during those years of political upheaval.

Rendra had been outspoken and prolific, which had made him a powerful opponent to the government. He went to the streets and screamed his disagreement. (Barley 2009)

The influence Rendra had was still a notable quality 30 years later: ‘In 1978, Rendra was in the vanguard of protest against social injustice and military dictatorship (Lane, 2009)’. The impact of his words led to his clashes with the New Order and eventually him being muzzled by the regime for 7 years. He was highly critical and outspoken, but also very lyrical in his language, passionate, persuasive, bold and unflinching in the power of his convictions.

With the political censorship of the times and the distortion of history in schools, Rendra’s poetry written in the 1970s was doomed not to be a nationwide phenomenon. However, it will be interesting to analyse the enduring power of his poetry as Indonesia broadens its democratic development into the 21st century. Whilst he is best remembered for his flamboyant dissidence, his dramatic poetry readings and his arrests (Lane 2010), it will be his words which hopefully will stand as a benchmark of democracy.

Rendra lived to see a far more democratic Indonesia emerge. Whilst there were still injustices to address, corruption and poverty; the political context had become far more open. Whilst his writing was dramatic, it was also a lyrical and narrative in style. His work
was marked by one inherent question which went to the core of his political protestations with regard to the rich and the poor, the powerful and the powerless, good and evil, right and wrong.

Yes! there are the triumphant, there are the humiliated
There are those with guns, there are those with wounds.
There are those who sit, there are those who are sat upon.
There are those with abundance, those with nothing left.
And on whose side do you stand? (Lane, 2009)

As an Indonesian and as a writer, Rendra fought for freedom of expression under both the regimes of Sukarno and Suharto. His legacy is his words.

Reference

Avelling, Harry. Ballads and Blues, Oxford University Press, 1974


Jakarta Globe. ‘God, I Love You’: WS Rendra’s Last Poem

By webadmin on 11:35 am Aug 07, 2009


Lane, Max. ‘Rendra knew on whose side he stood’ www.insideindonesia.org/rendra-knew-on-whose-side-he-stood Accessed March 15th, 2015
Lane, Max ‘Tribute to Rendra at Ubud – reflections’ Max Lane Online, November, 2009


Miles, Douglas. ‘Even Mutters Can Matter: Tempting Students With The Taste Of Bahasa Indonesia’

Ni Ketut Sudewa, I Nyoman Darma Putra, I Nyoman Kutha Ratna. Social Criticism in the Poems and Dramas created by W.S. Rendra from the 1970s to the 1990s

Piper, Susan. ‘Remembering Rendra’ Inside Indonesia 101: Jul-Sep 2010

Pisani, Elizabeth. Indonesia, Etc.: Exploring the Improbable Nation, 2014

Bramantyo Prijosusilo. ‘Obituary: Farewell WS Rendra, Poet, Playwright and Father of Indonesian Theater’ Aug 07, 2009 Jakarta Globe

Raffel, Burton. The Development of Modern Indonesian Poetry, State University of New York Press, 1967


Reeve, David. ‘Rendra in Australia,’ Inside Indonesia: 101: Jul-Sep 2010


Vickers, Adrian. A History of Modern Indonesia October 29, 2014

Wild and Wooley. State Of Emergency 1980


Literatuan: Volume 1, p. 102 Netherlands, 1976

The Bible, Matthew 27:46
The Socio-Political Factors of the Emergence of Teaching English in Postcolonial Indonesia
Dewi Candraningrum

Biodata: Universitas Muhammadiyah Surakarta & Jurnal Perempuan. dewicandraningrum@jurnalperempuan.com

Introduction

This essay addresses the question of how English entered Indonesia in relation to European Colonialism in the early Sixteenth century. In order to identify more closely the place occupied by English in postcolonial Indonesia, the rest of the paper will be devoted to sketching the position of the “surrounding” colonial languages — Portuguese and Dutch in the interplay with the position of Bahasa Indonesia, the Indonesian national language in the mid-twentieth century. This sketch will be framed from the perspective of the entry of foreign languages into pre and post-colonial Indonesia. Bahasa Indonesia as one of the Austronesian or Malayo-Polynesian languages had been used as the lingua franca in the Indonesian archipelago before the seventh century. It is a modern dialect of the Malay language which borrowed heavily from many foreign languages: the notable ones are Sanskrit, Arabic, Portuguese, Dutch, Japanese and English. This paper will also “untangle” the sedimentation of foreign languages into the history of foreign language teaching in Indonesia, beginning with the arrival of Sanskrit along with the Hinduism and Buddhism; the arrival of Arabic accompanying the introduction of Islam; the arrival of Portuguese, Spanish, English, and Dutch with Christians and Catholics missions, and, finally, the introduction of Japanese following the brief colonial occupation by Japan in the 1940s.

In exploring further the impact of the English language on Indonesia, I will provide a general account of Dutch colonization. In discussing this, I will supply information of the language policy of the colonizer wherever necessary to provide a better picture of the existence of English: how its significance and impact was different from and similar with other European foreign languages in the course of Dutch colonization. I will use a critical perspective in cultivating the history of the arrival of English language during the Dutch era as well as uncovering the socio-political factors that imbued the establishment of English departments in Indonesian universities through the policies developed by the Indonesian government. I argue that the existence of English language, besides normal, neutral and beneficial as viewed publicly, was also embedded by other significant factors such as social, political, economic, and religious elements. These dimensions played significant roles in the emergence of English language teaching in Indonesia during the pre and post-colonial periods of Indonesian history.
Bahasa Indonesia as the contesting melting pot: the interplay of Sanskrit with Hinduism and Arabic with Islam

Indonesia\textsuperscript{36} as a name of a state came into existence after World War II. The Republik Indonesia as a state was established on Independence Day, 17 August 1945, after Dutch and Japan colonization was ended. At that time, other regions in Africa and Asia also gained their independence from European colonization. The physical boundaries of Indonesia had been established by the Netherlands when they took over the many islands and made them into a single colony: the Netherlands East Indies.\textsuperscript{37} Indonesia now is a home to nearly 300 million people and thus the most populous Muslim-majority in the world and the fourth most populous country in the world. The present Indonesia was formerly named by the Dutch as “East Indies”. Why East Indies? As the popular colony of British was India, Indonesia was named after India. East Indies is a term referring to thirteen thousands islands located east of India. It is located in the South East Asian Archipelago. Sumatra, Java, Kalimantan, Sulawesi, Papua are among the five largest islands. Within these islands, there are more than 300 ethnic groups and 200 local languages (Vickers, 2005). The total number of languages and ethnic groups are more than 742. East Indies was a complex entity before the arrival of foreign influences. The term Indonesia or East Indies which means “the islands of India” was given to the archipelago by a German ethnologist and has been used since 1884 (Vlekke, 1959).

The first major foreign influence on latter-day Indonesia emanated from the ‘owner’ of its name: India. This influence was divided into two phases and characterised by the role of Hinduism. However, compared to India in which around 78\% of the total population\textsuperscript{38} adopted the Hindu way of life, the present day Indonesia is home to the religion of Islam. Around 82\% of the total current population in Indonesia are of the Muslim faith.

Indonesian Hinduism, which apparently originated in India, however, was deeply rooted in the formation of the many former dynasties of present-day Indonesia, before the arrival of European colonialism. For nearly seven centuries, Hindu and Buddhist empires had challenged each other for supremacy in the archipelago (present day Indonesia) east of India. This unauthenticity and the foreign influences on the “pagan” archipelago then formed the basis of the identity for the present-Indonesia. The Hindu Mataram was located in Java and the Buddhist Srivijaya was centred in Sumatra. The most famous Hindu Majapahit was established in Java in the thirteenth century. These three kingdoms moulded the sediment of the basis of a longstanding social and cultural legacy for most people in the Indonesian archipelago.

The so-called “Pagan-Indonesia”, with its indigenous Malay language, learned its first foreign language, Sanskrit, in the 7\textsuperscript{th} century. Sanskrit was introduced to the islands of

\textsuperscript{36} Indonesia originated from Greek: IndU.S = India and nesos = islands.
\textsuperscript{37} Vickers in the Introduction, A History of Modern Indonesia, 2.
\textsuperscript{38} Dheram, “English Language Teaching in India” in Braine, Teaching English to the World, 59.
Sumatra and Java from between the 7th to 14th century under the influences of Hinduism and Buddhism with its local kingdoms. The coastal areas of India contributed to the eastward expansion of its culture; southern India having greater influences than other areas.\textsuperscript{39} It is estimated that there around 750 loans words from Sanskrit still be found in modern Bahasa Indonesia. Whether directly or indirectly, a far greater number of Sanskrit terms found their way into Old Javanese languages (the dialect spoken by people in the Java island).

Almost half of the Old-Javanese language was composed of loans words from Sanskrit. Sanskrit was taught among the high-ranking nobility. The middle class spoke low-Malay language. The spread of the Sanskrit was used to spread Hinduism as well as Buddhism, the language being was circulated via ritual exercises. The form of the religious school was termed \textit{Padepokan}, a three-in-one system of teaching-learning-working.\textsuperscript{40} A small number of students studied under the supervision of religious teachers. The school dealt with the study of Shivaism, Buddhism, literature, language, exact science, astronomy, arts, and architecture,\textsuperscript{41} an assessment supported by the evidence found in many Hindu-Buddha temples in different parts of Java and South Sumatera. Hinduism and Buddhism were challenged by the arrival of Islam in Indonesia brought by Gujarat South Indian traders as early as the thirteenth century.

The Majapahit of Java slowly lost its ground and moved east to East Java finally residing on the island of Bali where most of its present population adhere to Hinduism. Islam began to spread widely to the East Indies in the fifteenth century with the rise of the Sultanate of Malacca in the straits between Sumatra and the continent. The oldest Islamic Kingdom was established in Perlak, Aceh in 1292. The merchants from Gujarat who came to Indonesia formerly did not come with the intention of propagating Islam rather in search for spice trade. This importance of the spice trade challenges the assumptions of some historian as to the significance of religious-based missions in the arrival of foreign influences from India whether Hinduism, Buddhism, and later Islam. Their first footholds were set up in East Indies as a result of commercial ambitions and relations, especially connected to the spice trade. Before the arrival of the Portuguese, Indian merchants became the sole main connections between the Asian spice trade and the European continents with other competitors, such as Persian and Chinese merchants.

Along the former dynasties’ commercial business structures, Islamic dynasties then transformed most of the Hindu-Buddha kingdoms except Bali. The most notable Hindu-dynasty that transformed to Islam was Mataram located in Yogyakarta. The second new foreign language, Arabic, was then introduced to the natives. This language, however, only


\textsuperscript{40} Sadtono, “ELT Development in Indonesia: a Smorgasbord in Sadtono (ed.), \textit{The Development of TEFL in Indonesia}, 2.

\textsuperscript{41} Mestoko, Soemarsono, \textit{Pendidikan di Indonesia dari Jaman ke Jaman}, 25-29.
disseminated among the noble-ranks and those who converted and studied Islam. Arabic was assimilated and it transformed the Malay language. 21,000 Arabic, Persian and Hebrew words were loaned into Bahasa Indonesia and a greater number into the Malay language (with its variant Malaysian languages). The teaching of Arabic transformed the previous Padepokan system. Islamic teaching has its own tradition which remains today. The Pesantren system separated the school for the boys and for the girls. The different marker between those two educational systems was that access to the previous school was only for the noble rank; access to the Pesantren was not only for the noble rank but particularly available to the natives who had converted to Islam. This intention, however, in the first phase of its application, only addressed the noble rank. Until the arrival of the European merchants, only the middle rank had been able to access classes in the traditional Pesantren system. The teaching of Sanskrit and Arabic among the natives was not an alien system as it used the Malay language as the instruction language in both traditional systems. The interstices between Malay language and its foreign influences such as Sanskrit and Arabic moulded the assimilation among those three languages. The choice of the transliteration of Bahasa Indonesia, however, was not as in the present Latin form (the influence of Latin teaching by Portuguese), but in an Arabic transliteration called Jawi, meaning Arabic transliteration read by Malayans.

The previous sketch of the history of foreign languages prior to the era of European colonialism offers a perspective of hybridity in the formulation of East Indies’ identity. The first economic quest for spice trade among the Indian traders had led them to introduce and then conquer the archipelago with Hinduism, Buddhism and Islam which produced a syncretized and hybridized identity of the previous three religions and the languages they brought into Bahasa Indonesia. Despite the three religions, the most notable and primary melting pot was the formation of the Malay language before the arrival of European colonialists. Several historians on Indonesia opted to write that the pre-European colonization was a peaceful one as the apparent arrival of Indian traders had not been accompanied by fleets of soldiers. The establishment of previous kingdoms under Hindu, Buddha, and Islam influences, however, could become an alternative critical approach to the colonization reality within the frame of religious-based missions to be spread to the so-called “pagan” East Indies Archipelago. Indonesia had become a contested field of values where many foreign influences gained footholds. Despite its peaceful approach, the spice trade, in its broader sense, facilitating the economic trade of foreign influences, had consecutively colonized Indonesia. The different and varied approaches used by those foreign influences had been written into the history of Indonesia. Most of the historians’ approaches signalled the sole colonizer’s stamp on the European economic pursuits. I argue that the former foreign influences of Hinduism, Buddhism, and Islam reinforced the same economic pursuits together with religious and cultural influences.
Such influences moulded the present Low-Malay language which then was popularly known as Bahasa Indonesia. The High-Malay language was spoken among the high-rank elite at the Courts and used in matters pertaining to the Mohammedan religion. The Low Malay or Pasar was the Market Malay spoken as the everyday language in the community. Before the arrival of the Portuguese, Low-Malay language had become the _lingua franca_ that united people in South East Asia in the processes of economic transactions in the spice trade. In the next discussion, the struggle among the three former foreign influences was further contested by the arrival of the European colonialists represented by the economic pursuits of the Portuguese and Dutch, in which the British interfered for only five years, from 1811-1816.

**European foreign languages (1602-1942): Dutch disengagement with education for the Indigenous Indonesia**

The sixteenth century marked the arrival of the Portuguese, the first Europeans in Indonesia, along with their economic pursuits to search for the source of the spice commodity which previously had been distributed and traded by the Indians, Persians and Chinese to the European mainland. Portuguese was the third foreign language which influenced Bahasa Indonesia significantly in the total amount of the loan words. Besides Low-Malay language, Low Portuguese language was the second _lingua franca_ for the transactional trade in South-East Asia in the sixteenth century. High Portuguese language was considered as the language of Christianity and European literature. The view toward High Portuguese language was similar to the view of the European toward Latin. This was considered as the gateway to European culture. High-Portuguese was taught within seminaries which were built by this first European colonizer. This program encountered great difficulty in areas densely populated by Muslims. In the areas which were not affected by Islam’s spread, the Christian missions established strong footholds and remain until today. The Muslim areas were usually spread throughout coastal areas of Sumatra, Java, Borneo and the Celebes islands. The arrival of the Portuguese with its missionary activities remained in certain regions which were then consecutively maintained by the Dutch colonizers such as the Highlands of Batak in Sumatra, the Highland of Toraja and Manado in Celebes, Papua and areas of Flores and the Timor islands. The multiethnic East Indies were exploited by the new colonizer’s imperial policy, _divide et impera_ (divide and conquer). The multiethnic character of the East Indies was used for political ends in conquering the whole archipelago and the archipelago’s eventual submission to the Dutch.

The seventeenth century marked the arrival of Dutch in the East India. The Dutch quest was a quest to win over the spice trade in the East Indies which was formerly under Portuguese control. Dutch was introduced as the official language of the colonial government and Portuguese; as well, the Malay language remained the _lingua franca_. In 1602, VOC (Dutch East Indies Company) had taken over control from the Portuguese except

---

42 Valentijn 1724, II: 244 cited by Groeneboer, _Gateway to the West_, 25.
the east islands spice producers which then finally fell into the VOC’s hands later on. VOC was a chartered private enterprise constituting a state in all but name, complete with its own fleet and army, which gradually expanded its influence and grip on political matters. The VOC was formerly established by seven chambers which represented each state in the Netherlands. Like the British East Indies Company in India, VOC relied and depended mainly on “indirect rule” through the “feudal” characteristics of the former Indonesian kingdoms which had spread throughout the East Indies. VOC used traditional native elites — Kings and their personnel — as vassals while imposing their will and extracting major income under the supervision of Dutch colonial officials. In 1799, VOC was dissolved and awarded to the United Kingdom of the Netherlands. The political effect being played by the Napoleonic War in Europe had a great impact on the people in East Indies. The Dutch officials in the East Indies were supposed to have practicable and sufficient knowledge of the French language. A small private school for the French language was also opened in 1811.

A few months later, the East Indies archipelago was brought completely under English rule with the assignment of T.S. Raffles as the first English colonial Lieutenant-Governor. English was introduced as the official language of the government. In order to promote Malay to the English officials and English to the indigenous officials, the first English grammar manual as well as dictionary (Malay-English and English-Malay) was compiled and written in 1812 with the effort of W. Marsden. During the short British interregnum 1811-1816, education was left entirely to private initiatives. In 1813, a missionary opened a small school with English and Latin as part of the curriculum, and there may well have been more private schools of this sort during these years.43 The only educational institution subsidized by the British colonial government was a small school founded by A.D.F. Pahud, a Swiss from Lausanne, father of the later Governor-General C.F. Pahud (1856-61); its aim was to teach “in the first instance Dutch and afterwards English and French grammar”. This school, which numbered 30 pupils by the end of 1815, proved so unprofitable that Pahud migrated to the Netherlands in 1818.44 Raffles definitely had a low regard towards Malay being spoken in the East Indies and in a speech given to the Batavian Society of Arts and Sciences in April 1813, he remarked:

Essential to notice with regard to our future proceedings is the necessity of encouraging and attaining a more general knowledge of the Javanese language. Hitherto the communication with inhabitants of the country has been chiefly through illiterate Interpreters, or when direct, through the medium of a barbarous dialect of Malays, confounded and confused by the introduction of Portuguese and

Dutch. Without a thorough knowledge of this language, it is impossible to form any accurate idea of the modes of thinking or acting among the people of this country.\(^{45}\)

With the intervention of the British occupation (1811-1816) and the occupation of the Netherlands by Napoleon, the East Indies was then under direct control of the Netherlands and became a part of the Netherlands' official and formal empire. The direct takeover only caused much suffering to the East Indies peasants. The natives’ education was totally neglected. The nineteenth century was marked by the slave trade and export in the Cultivation System, large plantations and forced cultivations system to enhance Dutch income through the international trade system. Besides spices, two significant indigenous products were exploited by the Dutch. The first was petroleum deposits which then brought about the necessity to build the *Royal Dutch Company for Exploitation of Petroleum Sources* in Netherlands Indies in 1883 which was simply known as ‘de Koninklijke’ and which then merged with British capital becoming Shell Transport and Trading Company in 1907 or simply called as Royal Dutch Shell.\(^{46}\) In 1920, Shell was producing about 85% of the total oil production in Indonesia. The second product was rubber. By 1930, Indonesia was producing nearly half the world’s rubber supply which was the result of the Cultivation System previously imposed by the Dutch colonizer.

During the *Cultuurstelsel*, Dutch imperialism reached its height in collecting income for the Netherlands’ crown. On the contrary, the quality of life in East Indies significantly decreased as famine was widespread. This misery was debated among the conservatives and liberals in the centre of the Empire, as liberals urged for a better quality of life for the people of the East Indies. During the Cultivation System, the colonial government introduce a new form of trade system which was imported from the European ‘laissez-faire’ principle. The introduction of the tax had made the government regulate the system of land administration. The East Indies officers distributed the land to the landowners and the peasants were supposed to rent the lands in the hope that the peasants would produce much more crops and could pay the necessarily imposed tax. The effect was that most of the landowners were those who were feudally connected with the local kingdoms and the Chinese settlers who had a powerful hold on the local trade and economy. The system of liberal economics in the East Indies lead to the expulsion of the poor peasants from their land and finally made them paupers. They had become wholly the subjects of the arbitrariness of foreign capitalism. Such views were shared by Governor-general Van de Capellen who said:

> Measures, that if seen at three thousand miles distance apparently are liberal, here prove to be highly illiberal in their effect. I must assume that in the Netherlands

\(^{45}\) T.S. Raffles, 1814, “A discourse delivered at a meeting of the Society of Arts and Sciences in Batavia, on the twenty-fourth day of April 1813, being the anniversary of the Institution”, *Verhandelingen van het Bataviaasch Genootschap van Kunsten en Wetenschappen* 7, pp. 13-14, in Groeneboer, Op. Cit., p. 70.

Liberalism is understood to be the protection of European landowners at the expense of the native population, and that the interests of the latter are completely disregarded to give a few speculators and adventures their chance to succeed in their schemes, then I must declare myself to be an ultra anti-Liberal.\footnote{Vlekke, \textit{Op. Cit.}, 275.}

Van de Capellen was one governor-general who understood the principle of the need for a better education system for Indonesians. He saw that Dutch colonial policy did its utmost to improve the material supply from the Indonesians in international trade, but continued to underestimate the people’s educational and political needs. The urge to educate the empire was at its height. For this purpose, they founded a new department of government, that of “Agriculture, Arts and Education”. Unfortunately, this plan was executed only to address the elite in the East Indies and to fulfil the betterment of the agricultural system so it could be exploited further by its colonial ruler. With the arrival of a western education system, there appeared a discrepancy with the existing local education, those which were in the hands of the Moslem religious teachers and Hindu-Buddha religious teachers. The two later education systems were mostly confined to religious contents and heavily imposed the teaching of Arabic and Sanskrit. Before the execution of the Ethical Policy, a western-style education for the indigenous population of the East Indies was primarily left to the Christian missions (at first mainly in the Moluccas and Timor, and from 1830s also in Minahasa, North Sulawesi); the non-Christian populations were completely ignored.

Foreign languages introduced in the Dutch colonial education system and private missionary initiatives were Dutch and other European languages such as German, French and English. The four European languages, however, became a contested struggle within the Dutch umbrella of education; what happened in Europe influenced the way the Dutch imposed its foreign language policy. As the previous three main religions taught their language through the \textit{padepokan} and \textit{pesantren}, the Dutch language policy was applied through its church services and colonial government schools. Dutch and the other European languages were only introduced to the elite of the noble ranks (\textit{raja} and \textit{bangsawan}), the Chinese people and indigenous people who had converted to Christianity.\footnote{Groeneboer, \textit{Op. Cit.}, 27.} Western education was formally introduced to the indigenous Indonesia at the beginning of the twentieth century with the introduction of the Dutch Ethical Policy which was urged by many Dutch liberal movements. Although the Ethical Policy had its root in a humanitarian concern, this rationale was superseded by its economic advantage. During the liberal period (1870-1900) Dutch industry began to see Indonesia as a potential market. This potential market needed to raise its life standard as there was an urgent need for cheap Indonesian labour in the modern market. The former slaves’ position in eighteenth century Europe was simply re-stamped as another word, “labours”, a concept which was alien to the indigenous.
To create obedient labourers, the colonial government needed to elevate their education, especially to support their economic exploitation.

In 1899, C. Th. Van Deventer published an article in the Dutch journal *de Gids*, “Een eereschuld” (*A Debt of Honor*), in which he urged the Netherlands government to pay the debt of all the wealth they had exploited from Indonesia by promoting education for the indigenous. Only after his death in 1915, with this impetus, the Netherlands set the Ethical Policy in three schemas: education, irrigation and emigration under Queen Wilhelmina’s reign (1890-1948). There were two opposing approaches as to how to execute the education system in Indonesia. The first approach was “elitist” which was supported by the well-known Snouck Hurgronje and J.H. Abendanon. This view departed from the assumption of providing a more European-style education in the Dutch language for westernised Indonesian elites which then would facilitate most of the officials’ duties in the East Indies. He further expanded the view that “our rule will have to justify itself on the basis of lifting the natives up to higher level of civilization in line with their innate capacity”.49 The second approach favoured more basic and practical education in vernacular languages for the indigenous lower level. Snouck Hurgronje then advocated a bold policy of education that “The Indonesian is imploring U.S to give them instruction; by granting their wish, we shall secure their loyalty for an unlimited time”.50 One of its policies was imposing the learning of Dutch on the natives as the gateway to the West and learning other European languages as regular subjects, i.e. German, French and English, which were to be introduced in the junior high school.

The language of the Europeans which first introduced in the elite education was MULO-Meer Uitgebreid Lager Onderwijs (Advanced Elementary Education/Junior High School) in 1914. This was designed for the noble ranked Indonesian, Chinese and Europeans who had finished their respective primary schools (HIS & ELS). In 1937, MULO, which served as a follow-up to the Native School Second Class, introduced foreign languages to the Indigenous East Indies. Local language was used as the medium of instruction, and Dutch was taught as regular subject in addition to English and Malay. According to Koeswandono (78 years old, a MULO graduate) and Dwitjahjo (80 years old, a MULO graduate), a MULO student had to learn Dutch every day, English—a compulsory subject—three to four times a week, and they still had to choose either German or French, and either Javanese or Malay.51 In the independent Chinese school in Indonesia, English was the favoured foreign language to be taught due to its usefulness in business transactions shortly before the Second World War broke out. The MULO graduates could speak, read and write good English.52 French was then abolished from the subjects of ELS-Europesche Lagereschool (European Primary School) when Napoleon conquered the Dutch in Europe and was

51 Sadtono, *ELT Development in Indonesia*, 4-5.
52 Mistar, “Teaching English as a Foreign Language (TEFL) in Indonesia”, 73.
replaced with English. This signalled the strong hold of Dutch, English and the German languages. The German language was then also banned shortly after Germany’s occupation of the Netherlands. The teaching of Dutch and English became prominent by the end of World War II. The teaching of Dutch had, however, been banished by two prominent factors, namely the occupation of Japan in Indonesia and the rejection by Indonesian independence fighters, nationalists, of the colonizers’ language. 1945 signalled the victory of English as the only foreign language accepted in the indigenous schools. At that time the teaching of English was considered successful due to the small number of the students, as it apparently only addressed the noble ranks and those indigenous people who converted to Christianity.

The introduction of the four European languages to the indigenous of Indonesia actually gained much large scale support whether in the Netherlands or its Empire. This policy, however, was not accompanied by active steps from the colonial government. In the 1930 census, the literacy rate for adult Indonesians throughout the archipelago was only 7.4 percent. This makes for a poor comparison with the most ambitious public education programme in a colonised country, that of the United States in the Philippines, where, by 1939, over a quarter of the population could speak English. In the former Southeast Asian British colonies of Malaysia and Singapore, no less than one-third of the total population of 23 million now speak English. Although the previous data only showed the literacy rate and language policy, they also reflect how much emphasis was placed on education in general in the colonial empire. The British India in the Malaysia and Singapore, the U.S in the Philippines, and the French in Indochina had spent two to three times more than the Dutch in Indonesia on Education. In spite of its material gain exploited from Indonesia, the Dutch never had a serious commitment to the welfare of the Indigenous East Indies as the public education policies in the East Indies merely addressed the indigenous elite. The result was that UNESCO found in 1947 an illiteracy rate of 88 percent in British India, 40 percent in the Philippines, 80 percent in Vietnam, and a startling 95 percent in the Dutch East Indies (Indonesia). The possible reason was that the Dutch colonisers’ pragmatic language policy was always dictated by practical, economic and financial considerations. This colonial attitude demonstrated vividly that, in practice, welfare was subordinated to a balanced budget.

The dawn of English Language Teaching (ELT) & the role of America in the new Indonesia (1942-1965)

With the turmoil of World War II, the Japanese with the support from its Central Axis (Germany, Italy, Turkey, and Japan) ousted the Dutch in 1942. The Governor-general of the East Indies sought help from its Allies. During the Second World War, many criticisms were directed to the Dutch language policy by Indonesia’s Allies — England, Australia, and

54 Crystal, English as a Global Language, 57-60.
America. They saw that Dutch policy hindered instead of promoted the spread of Dutch and other European languages. The reality that they had to accept -- that less than two percent of the population could communicate in Dutch at the end of colonial period -- had awakened a further policy which was idealised by the Dutch Minister of Colonies, H.J. van Mook to the East Indies Department of Education while he was in exile in Brisbane:56

A common language is the surest measure for spreading culture and loyalty. The British always encourage the speaking of English in their dominion and colonies. We have not done this in the Netherlands East Indies. Let us do it after the war.

The dream was a ‘pipe dream’ as the teaching of Dutch, English, Germany, and French was banned in the entire archipelago by the new colonizer. The new colonizer, Japan, preferred to be called the “Old Brother” in South East Asia. Within this guise, they conquered the Indonesians. Books and other materials written in Dutch and other European languages were burned. Bahasa Indonesia was then inaugurated as the language of instruction in the schools. From 1942 until 1945 during the Japanese occupation, there were no formal schools teaching any European language although this was still carried out clandestinely. Bahasa Indonesia gained a powerful stronghold to unite the former colonial Indonesia. On 17 August 1945, Soekarno proclaimed the Indonesian Independence of the Republic of Indonesia and the 1945 Constitution proclaimed Bahasa Indonesia as the language of the state in Chapter XV, article 36. This ousted the dream of the Dutch to reclaim the Indonesia by its new language policy after World War II.

The birth of a nation, independent Indonesia, at the end of World War II was followed by further contest from the outside world to re-claim Indonesia whether through political, educational, cultural or economic colonization. The multiethnic religious state continued struggling from within and from outside. Many compromises had to be carried out by the new nation facing the arrival of the global era. One of the hurdles faced by the new nation was the burden of the debt imposed by the former Dutch colonialists on Indonesia. When the United States brokered the final settlement of the Revolution, it sacrificed the new nation’s interests for its own purposes. The U.S insisted that the Indonesians accept a deal in which the new nation had to take over Dutch debts of U.S$ 1,723 million plus interest. The U.S wanted to protect the economic rebuilding of Europe established in the Marshall Plan and to create the North Atlantic Treaty Organization as the basis of their campaign against communism.57 Instead of the Dutch compensating the Indonesians for almost 350 years of colonial rule, the Indonesian had to compensate the Dutch, based on the fiction that the Indies had been an autonomous entity, not part of the Netherlands.58 It was scandalously arranged as the trade-off in liberating Indonesia from the

58 Kahin, Nationalism and Revolution in Indonesia, 443.
total re-invasion of the Dutch military and its ally between 1945 until 1950. Indonesia was faced with great misery during its struggle either from the financial exploitation of the debts and the re-invasion from the Dutch until 1949 when the Dutch finally accepted officially the state of Indonesia. The economic colonization in the young Indonesia nation has been succinctly summed up by an Australian historian, Ricklefs, as follows:

In the economy generally non-Indonesian interests remained important. Shell and the American companies Stanvac and Caltex were strong in the oil industry, and most inter-island shipping was in the hands of the Dutch KPM line. Banking was dominated by Dutch, British and Chinese interests, and Chinese also controlled much of the rural credit. It was clear to informed observers that Indonesians were not independent economically, a fact which was to contribute to the radicalism of the late 1950s. 59

Alongside the contested field in the economic sector, Indonesia’s education sector also suffered the same struggle whereby foreign forces strove to establish their foothold within the curriculum formation of the new Indonesian education system. The new government led by Sukarno regime gave priority to fostering the education sector. The number of elementary school entrants had increased from 1.7 million to 2.5 million between 1953 and 1960 although 60 percent dropped out before completing the school. By 1961 the adult literacy rate had been 56.7 percent for those over the age of ten compared to the poor rate of the Dutch Ethical Policy on Education reform in 1930 which had been a mere 7.4%. Many schools were set up and teachers were enforced in in-training service to meet the demands of the school entrants. The onset of the Dutch Ethical Policy in 1930 had heralded the nationalist schools which were called ‘wild schools’ by the Dutch. In these classes, nationalist teachers rejected teaching the History of the Netherlands and promoted the History of the People of Indonesia as an effective way to counter the colonial ruler. Curricular reform had provided a different perspective in cultivating an indigenous-modern school system. The notable influence of western-modern teaching was the work of Karl Marx which was introduced by a German teacher and then absorbed by the first Indonesian President Sukarno when he attended Surabaya schools. Marxist influences among Indonesian independent insurgents were strong. One of emerging political leaders Sutan Sahrir even married a Dutch Marxist, Maria Duchateau who compounded Sutan’s defiance of Dutch authority. He denounced the inferiority complex that threatened the Indonesian people under Dutch colonization. Many of their movements were joined by other young insurgents from the Islamic front. One notable figure was Haji Ahmad Dahlan who then established Muhammadiyah. Muhammadiyah, as the leading national ‘modernist’ social Islamic organization, formed branches throughout the country and approximately 30 million followers today. Founded in 1912, Muhammadiyah runs mosques, prayer houses, clinics, orphanages, poorhouses, schools, public libraries, and universities. Muhammadiyah was set

up to meet the educational gap in the Islamic-indigenous Indonesia in Dutch colonial era. Muhammadiyah envied the way the Dutch provided schools only to the Christian-Indonesians. He then adopted western modern schools which provided its pupils additional Islamic teaching. From 1913 until 1918, Dahlan promulgated five elementary schools, Hooge School Muhammadiyah for the junior high school in 1919. He then altered the name, Kweek School Muhammadiyah and in 1930 he separated schools for boys as Mu'allimin and for girls Mu'allimat. Focus on Muhammadiyah modern Islamic schools will be explored next.

Although these modern Islamic schools were obviously in an ambivalent position in projecting Dutch as the source of knowledge as well as oppression, they were able to raise the indigenous sense of independence as shown in their willingness to become teachers of those ‘wild schools’ and were willing to do it voluntarily. Such schools were so widespread that in spite of the Dutch’s suspicion, the colonial administrators were not able to suppress their influences among the indigenous. The schools, however, could not abandon the teaching of European foreign languages within the paradox of the educational system. From the onset of the Ethical Policy, Muhammadijah’s modern Islamic education, that combined western and Islamic teachings, is prevalent until today. The former Dutch universities in Indonesia were transformed into state-owned universities and many of the Islamic universities are now mostly run by Muhammadiyah. Almost all of the schools and universities in Indonesia then adopted the teaching of English as the sole significant foreign language.

Four years after Indonesia’s independence, English Departments also started to be founded at the university level. Table 2 shows that the first English Department was established in the private nationalist-initiative university in Jakarta called Universitas Nasional Jakarta in 1949. Table 1 show that the state-owned University of North Sumatera then followed a similar step in 1952. On the first of October 1954, the famous English Department of IKIP Malang (now Universitas Negeri Malang) was established, followed by Politeknik Negeri Manado in the same year. Other state-owned universities such as Universitas Syiah Kuala Banda Aceh established English Department in 1961, Universitas Sriwijaya Palembang and IKIP Jogjakarta (now Universitas Negeri Yogyakarta) in 1964 and Universitas Diponegoro Central Java in 1965. During three-and-half-year Japan interregnum (1942-1945) and Sukarno era (1945-1965) there were approximately seven state-owned universities which established English Departments. Despite promotion by the government, the propagation of establishing English Departments was mostly led by Christian and Catholics missionaries who then established Universities in several Christian-Catholics social enclaves in Indonesia, such as Universitas Katolik Indonesia Atmajaya Jakarta in 1961, Universitas Kristen Satya Wacana Salatiga in 1962, Universitas Kristen Petra Surabaya in 1963, Universitas Kristen Tomohon Sulawesi in 1964, as well as Universitas Katolik Sanata Darma Jogjakarta and Universitas Klabat Manado North Sulawesi in 1965. The only modern Islamic institution which established an English Department was Muhammadijah, i.e.
Universitas Muhammadiyah Dr Hamka (formerly IKIP Muhammadiyah Jakarta) Jakarta in 1958. More focus on the English Departments in Muhammadiyah Universities will be explored in the next section.

English Departments were established mainly by the government (Table 1) and private initiatives in which Christian, Catholic and Muhammadiyah religious institutions (Table 2) played central roles in the propagation. There were four Christian Universities that established their forerunner English Departments. The first Christian university was Universitas Kristen Satyawacana (UKSW) that was located in the Highland of Salatiga Central Java and established on November 30, 1957 by 10 Church Synods from Java, Sumatera, Kalimantan, Sulawesi, Maluku, Irian Jaya (now Papua), Bali, Nusa Tenggara Barat and Nusa Tenggara Timur. Satya Wacana was drawn from Sanskrit, means “faithful to the Word of God”. The English Department was established four years after the university was founded on May 17th, 1962. Secondly, Universitas Kristen Petra (UKP) Surabaya East Java was established by PPPK Petra (Petra Christian Education and Teaching Association) which is a Christian union established on April 12th, 1951 with the purpose to provide education from the level of kindergarten to senior high schools. On September 21st, 1960, the committee of University Establishment Planning Preparation was formed with the duty to establish universities which were consisted of mainly Christian-converted Chinese Indonesians; drg Tan Tjiaw Yong, Gouw Loe Liong, drg Tan Giye Djien, Tjoa Siok Tjoen, Lie Ping Lioe and Kwee Djien Kian. The first department founded was the Faculty of Letters and the English Department was initiated on May 21st, 1963. The third was Universitas Kristen Tomohon. Tomohon was one of the towns in Minahasa, North Sulawesi. Tomohon was renowned as a Christian town since the Dutch reign. Many Dutch missionaries lived there and opened schools and clinics. The earlier clinic, now called Rumah Sakit Umum Gunung Maria which is now the biggest hospital in North Sulawesi, was established on February 11th, 1930, by Marianheuvel Ziekenhuis. One of the most famous universities established was Universitas Kristen Indonesia Tomohon (UNKIT) by GMIM (Gereja Masehi Injili di Minahasa). The English Department was established at 19th of October 1964. The fourth Christian university was Universitas Kristen Klabat (UNKLAB). It was established on October 7th, 1965, by Gereja Masehi Advent Hari Ketujuh Uni Kawasan Timur Indonesia through Yayasan Universitas Klabat. The English Department was established at 7th October 1965, exactly the same year of the establishment of the university which offered two years program of Theology and English Education.

The second initiatives were taken by Catholics missionaries who built two prominent Catholics universities, i.e. Atmajaya and Sanata Dharma. The first was Universitas Katolik Indonesia Atmajaya in Jakarta which was established on June 1st, 1960, by Yayasan Atma Jaya in which Cardinals in Java and young Catholics intellectuals met to establish the foundation in June 1950. Most of them were Catholic-converted Chinese Indonesians; Ir JP Cho, Ir Lo Siang Hien-Ginting, Drs Goei Tjong Tik, UJ Kasimo, JB Legiman SH, Drs FX Seda, Pang
Lay Kim, Tan Bian Seng, Anton M Moeljono, St Munadjat Danusaputro, JE Tan, Ben Mang-Reng Say. Atma Jaya stemmed from a Sanskrit word, which means ‘the glory of soul’. The English Department was established in the Faculty of Education on June 1st, 1961. The second university was Universitas Katolik Sanata Darma in Yogyakarta. In 1955, Catholic Priests of the Order of the Society of Jesus Central Java and other Catholic intellectuals decided to establish a teacher training college. With the support from the Congretio de Propaganda Fide, Father Kester, the Superior Jesuit Missionaries, united the diploma courses in Education under de Britto Foundation in Yogyakarta and in English under the Loyola Foundation in Semarang into a higher learning institution called PTPG Sanata Dharma on October 20, 1955. English departments were established among other three departments of Education, History and Natural Science. Sanata Dharma is a Sanskrit phrase, means “the true dedication” or “the real service”, the dedication and the service have been devoted to the nation and the church (Pro Patria et Ecclessia).

Besides English being propagated by Christian-Catholics missionaries, the indigenous nationalists and modern Islamists also played significant roles in the promotion of English Departments. The first English Department in Indonesia was established on October 15th, 1949, in the second oldest university in Indonesia, Universitas Nasional (UNAS) Jakarta by prominent western-educated indigenous nationalists: R Teguh Suhardjo Sastrosuwignyo, Sutan Takdir Alisjahbana, Soedjono Hardjosuwo, Prof Sarwono Prawirahardjo, Prajitno Soewondo, Hazil, Kwari Katjubrata, Dr Djoehana, RM Soebagjo, Adam Bachtar, Ny Noegroho, Drs Adam Bachtar, Dr Bahder Djohan, Dr Leimena, Ir Abd Karm, Prof Dr Soetomo Tjokronegoro, Ali Budiharjo Poerwodarminto, Soetikno, Ir Th A Resink, Dr Soemitro Djojohadikusumo, Noegroho, Soejatmiko, HB Jassin, Mochtar Avin, L Damais, A Djoehana, Nona Boediardjo and Nona Roekmini Singgih. The establishment of the university was aimed to cater for graduates from senior high schools (Dutch MULO) who did not want to enter into Dutch colonial Universiteit van Indonezie/Universiteit van Nederlands-Indie, established in 1946, and which was then transformed by the government into the state-owned university called Universitas Indonesia (UI) in February 2nd, 1950, when the Dutch handed the university to the new Indonesian government. The first Faculty of Letters was actually established by the Dutch in 1920 in which several Dutch intellectuals and western-educated indigenous nationalists worked together to initiate Faculteit der Letteren en Wijsbegeerte in the House of Rechts Hogeschool which could only be realized twenty years later on December 4th, 1940. Instead of Dutch and other European languages, Bahasa Indonesia was opted for as the first language department in the university to cultivate the nationalist spirit in achieving independence. Bahasa Indonesia was also the language of instruction in three other departments, namely Social Sciences, History, and Science on Nations. In 1942, the Japan colonizer came and established their own education institutions in the university, and surprisingly did not ban the Faculty of Letters while banning the teaching of Dutch and other European languages. In 1954, Dutch and Chinese Language Departments were established. The English Department was established later on.
The second English Department established by private initiatives was initiated by modern Islamic organization, Persyarikatan Muhammadijah, which founded Universitas Muhammadiyah Prof Dr Hamka (UHAMKA) on 25 Rabiul Awal 1377 H/18 November 1957 in Jakarta. UHAMKA was formerly known as IKIP Muhammadiyah Jakarta with initial name PTPG (Perguruan Tinggi Pendidikan Guru). The founders were Arso Sastroamidjo and HS Projokusumo. Similar to the Christian and Catholic universities which were based on the teaching of the Bible as well as Pancasila and UUD 1945, UHAMKA as a modern Islamic university, was based on Islamic teaching (Al Quran and As-Sunnah) as well as Pancasila and UUD 1945 (the founding law of Indonesia). A year after, the English Department was established in 1958 in the Education Faculty.

Table 1: English Departments established by State-Owned Universities (1942-1965)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Year of Establishment</th>
<th>State-Owned Universities</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1952</td>
<td>Universitas Sumatera Utara</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1954</td>
<td>IKIP Malang, now Universitas Negeri Malang, East Java&lt;sup&gt;61&lt;/sup&gt;</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1954</td>
<td>Politeknik Negeri Manado</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1961</td>
<td>Universitas Syiah Kuala Banda Aceh</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1964</td>
<td>IKIP Yogyakarta, now Universitas Negeri Yogyakarta&lt;sup&gt;62&lt;/sup&gt;</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1965</td>
<td>Universitas Sriwijaya, Palembang</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td>7 English Departments in State-Owned Universities</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 2: English Departments established by Private-Initiatives Universities (1942-1965)<sup>63</sup>

<sup>61</sup> KeputU.San Presiden Republik Indonesia Nomor 93 Tahun 1999 tentang Perubahan Institut Keguruan dan Ilmu Pendidikan (IKIP) menjadi Universitas (Edict of President RI No 93, 1999 about the change of IKIP [Institute for Teacher Training and Education] into University), Pp: 1-2.  
<sup>62</sup> Ibid.  
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Year of Establishment</th>
<th>Private-Initiatives Universities</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1949</td>
<td>Universitas Nasional Jakarta</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1958</td>
<td>Universitas Muhammadiyah Dr Hamka, Jakarta</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1961</td>
<td>Universitas Katolik Indonesian Atmajaya, Jakarta</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1962</td>
<td>Universitas Kristen Satya Wacana, Salatiga, Central Java</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1963</td>
<td>Universitas Kristen Petra, Surabaya, East Java</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1964</td>
<td>Universitas Kristen Indonesia Tomohon, North Sulawesi</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1965</td>
<td>Universitas Katolik Sanata Darma, Yogyakarta</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Universitas Kristen Klabat, Manado</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Total</strong></td>
<td><strong>8 English Departments in Private-Initiatives Universities</strong></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The success of establishing the English Departments in Indonesian universities instead of other departments of European languages was also partly due to the program initiated by America through the Ford Foundation. Sukarno and Indonesia was in position of being an ‘in-between’ nation in the Cold War between the capitalist pole and the communist pole. 1950 witnessed the emergence of the Indonesian Communist Party (PKI) as well. Sukarno strove to unlearn western imperialism and stoked anti-western sentiment in the nation. From 1950 until 1965, the Indonesians became the terrain of these two opposing foreign influences with the internal tools of the nationalist sources. Sukarno’s regime was regarded by the U.S as tending to the left wing, especially Sukarno’s ultra-nationalist vision for education. Sadtono and Mistar reported that the teaching of English language had to be terminated due to pressure from the communists.\(^{64}\) Thomas\(\textit{et al}\) reported that “for political protection, Mr. Soenardjo Haditjaroko, director of the Foreign Language Institute had to state publicly that teachers should not compel their students to study English outside classroom, though privately he fully supported such activity”.\(^ {65}\) The result of this anti-western policy was that English language programs declined in priority in the nation’s educational policy.

Ford launched its effort to make Indonesia a modernizing country in 1954 with field projects from MIT and Cornell countering the communist influences. The U.S power through the Ford foundation had launched the establishment of English as the most important foreign language to be taught in Indonesia’s universities and schools. Alongside the ‘spontaneous’ rise in influence of English after World War II, English teaching programs in Indonesia were also supported explicitly by the U.S. After the Americans took control of the


\(^{65}\) Thomas\(\textit{et al}\), \textit{Strategies for Curriculum Change}, 316.
Philippines in 1900, the American language policy saw the total rejection of the Indigenous Languages and English was immediately introduced as the language of instruction in all schools. The choice of English was therefore clearly motivated by the cultural negotiation of the U.S, but also by the tempo in which the imperialistic aspirations had to be realized in education. The campaign of English language teaching in Indonesia occupied a central place in the policy developed by the U.S to counteract the influences of communism during the Cold War.

FKIP Universitas Airlangga Malang (altered presently as IKIP Malang, and then UNM—Universitas Negeri Malang) developed a project in August 1960, The English Language Teacher Training Project (ELTTP). The Ford Foundation backed the project by sending American professors to teach there as well as financial and technical assistance. The program was to promulgate the core of English language teachers who would serve as the basis of ELT in Indonesia. They were sent to America to study and obtain an overseas degree:

No wonder that those who went to the U.S could get their master and doctoral degrees without too much difficulty. A number of ELTTP graduates now hold high positions in different parts of Indonesia, four are currently Rectors (Dr Muhammad Diah, UNRI Rector, Drs Agus Kafiar MA, UNCEN Rector, Dr Moh Ansyar, IKIP Padang Rector, Dr Nuril Huda, IKIP Malang Rector).

These graduates were becoming prominent people in the education system in Indonesia. It was reported that the two prominent U.S professors in charge of the program were pure linguists who had never been to Indonesia, so their program was arcane, unrelated to the needs of TEFL (Teaching English as Foreign Language) in Indonesia. The Ford institute sent a new American professor who had sufficient knowledge of TEFL to improve the situation. Ford assisted further the development of English syllabi, instructional materials, and manuals for secondary schools which were then published in 1956. The dawn of a more widespread English language teaching movement in Indonesia was thus developed largely under the auspices of the U.S. Despite the alien factor, English language has played a major role after the World War II in Indonesia’s foreign language sector, especially with the arrival of the mass communication era. Indonesia could not deny or escape these powerful influences in the international arena. This has led to Indonesia’s decision to maintain the teaching of English in formal schools which had been stamped by the Dutch junior high school system. Until the 1980s, German and French were still taught in the senior high schools as optional subjects. The world-wide-web internet wave since the 1990s has further strengthened the emergence of English as the International language.

---

67 Ibid.
Suharto Regime: English Language Teaching (ELT) gaining its stronghold (1965-1998)

The onset of the 1965 revolution raised the spectre of the so-called PKI members and many other innocent citizens into a brutal massacre which cost around one million lives. Curriculum developments in schools succumbed to the negative image of the so-called PKI and communism. School textbooks were designed under the aegis from the perspective of the one sidedness of the Suharto regime as much a product of the Cold War as of its own trajectory since the Revolution. Education was strictly monitored by the Government which was installed at all levels of the education system. During Suharto’s reign, High Javanese language gained more political weight compared to other languages. After several years of decline during Sukarno’s presidency, the English foothold was gaining power in Indonesia.

The former Ford program was continued in the era of Suharto who advocated “openness” to his “New Order” of Indonesia to replace the Marxian insurgency. Despite exercising constant and close supervision of the Leftist movements, the Suharto regime also suppressed the political insurgency from the Islamic groups which were called Right wing. Islam in Indonesia will never be a single narrative. Suharto’s frame of political action was how to maintain and play those two poles in a beneficial position into his mastery. The two poles were always being contested opposite to western capitalist values. In the era of Sukarno, the teaching of Dutch was terminated. And, in the 1990s, facing the end of Suharto reign and the arrival of the internet, German and French were no longer taught in Indonesian senior high schools. Suharto’s regime advocated the literacy of foreign languages as its main prerequisite. English then played the most dominant role among other western languages such as German and French. In the last phase of Suharto’s reign, Indonesia issued Law No 2 Year 1989 about National Education System which enforced English language as one of the obligatory subjects in the Elementary Education in Chapter IX, Kurikulum, Verse 39, Point 3, Article m:

The content of elementary educational curriculum should contain (minimally) the following subjects:

a. Pendidikan Pancasila (Pancasila Education);

b. Pendidikan Agama (Religious Study);

c. Pendidikan Kewarganegaraan (Civic Education);

d. Bahasa Indonesia;

e. Membaca dan Menulis (Reading and Writing);

f. Matematika (termasuk berhitung);

g. Pengantar Sains dan Teknologi (Introduction on Science and Technology);

---

The previous attitude toward English as the only foreign language that should be taught at the elementary level was changed in 2003 during the Megawati presidency who was the well-known daughter of the former first President Sukarno. Sukarno was popular due to his strong proposal for national identity as an important discourse in education. During his daughter’s presidency, the attitude toward English was neutral compared to Suharto. Indonesia issued a similar law on the education system, Law No 20 Year 2003 about the National Education System which did not mention any foreign language. Even English as a compulsory subject was not also issued for elementary education. In this law, the use of the instruction language, that is Bahasa Indonesia, was clearly stated, and any foreign language (Bahasa Asing) subject was also supported by not mentioning “Bahasa Inggris” in the Law of Republic of Indonesia No 20 Year 2003 about the National Education System, Chapter VII, Bahasa Pengantar (Language Instruction), Verse 33, Point 1-3, Article (3): 

Bahasa Pengantar (Language of Instruction)

Pasal 33

(1). Bahasa Indonesia sebagai Bahasa Negara menjadi bahasa pengantar dalam pendidikan nasional (Bahasa Indonesia as state language is the language of instruction in the national education).

(2). Bahasa daerah dapat digunakan sebagai bahasa pengantar dalam tahap awal pendidikan apabila diperlukan dalam penyampaian pengetahuan dan/atau ketrampilan tertentu (Local dialects could be used as medium of instruction in the introductory level if necessary).

(3). Bahasa asing dapat digunakan sebagai bahasa pengantar pada satuan pendidikan tertentu untuk mendukung kemampuan berbahasa asing peserta didik (Foreign language could be used as medium of instruction in particular subjects to support learners’ competency).

Law 20, 2003 also stated that the curriculum contained in the elementary and high education level only mention Bahasa Asing/Foreign Language as one of the obligatory subjects instead of “English language” as stated in the previous Law 2, 1989 during Suharto’s

The apparent attitude toward English during Suharto’s presidency culminated in the statement issued by the Government Regulation No 55 Year 1998 about Basic/Elementary Education about the Change of Government Regulation No 28 Year 1990 about Basic/Elementary Education. It stated in Chapter 14 a, as follows:

(1). Bahasa pengantar dalam pendidikan dasar adalah Bahasa Indonesia (Language of Instruction in the basic education is Bahasa Indonesia).

(2). Bahasa Daerah dapat digunakan sebagai bahasa pengantar dalam tahap awal pendidikan dan sejauh diperlukan dalam penyampaian pengetahuan dan/atau keterampilan tertentu (Local Dialects could be used as medium of instruction in the introductory level when it is necessary to deliver particular sciences and/or skills.).

(3). Bahasa Inggris dapat digunakan sebagai bahasa pengantar sejauh diperlukan dalam penyampaian pengetahuan dan/atau keterampilan tertentu (English language could be used as medium of instruction when it is necessary to deliver particular sciences and/or skills).

The Suharto regime’s support for English language was different at the senior high school level and the higher education level. It issued regulations which mentioned “Foreign Languages” instead of “English language”. At the practical level, however, English language was becoming an obligatory subject. The former edicts show the clear support Suharto had toward English language teaching. During the formation of the New Order, Bahasa Indonesia was challenged by the advocacy of teaching English throughout Indonesia, to adapt to the liberal free market principles to which the Suharto regime adhered. The teaching of English as a foreign language, however, posed insurmountable obstacles due to high illiteracy rates, lack of English teachers and suitable teaching materials. The boom in capitalism during the Suharto era, however, supported infrastructural support to the schools and universities. The ‘hard-factors’, however, were not accompanied by beneficial ‘soft-factors’ such as curriculum development. Curriculum in Indonesia displayed a strong tendency to copy directly from the U.S. When the communicative approach was introduced in the U.S, the curriculum in Indonesia advocated it as well. The development of the English curriculum in Indonesia was never in an independent position. Its position was strongly influenced by what happened outside Indonesia. In other words, the legacy of teaching English in Indonesia was always not in Indonesian hands. The curriculum makers anyhow supported such a perspective insasmuch to support their own legacy of the teaching of English and the

---

72 Ibid.
74 Peraturan Pemerintah Republik Indonesia Nomor 56 Tahun 1998 tentang Perubahan atas Peraturan Pemerintah Nomor 29 Tahun 1990 Tentang Pendidikan Menengah; Peraturan Pemerintah Republik Indonesia Nomor 57 Tahun 1998 tentang Perubahan atas Peraturan Pemerintah Nomor 30 Tahun 1990 Tentang Pendidikan Tinggi; and Peraturan Pemerintah Republik Indonesia Nomor 60 Tahun 1999 tentang Pendidikan Tinggi.
development of the curriculum being applied in universities and schools. Such a legacy was then taken over by the Ministry of Education who played the main role of establishing the legacy of teaching English to Indonesia.

In 1968, an English Language Project was set up by the Ministry of Education which consisted of two sub-projects: the English Teachers Upgrading Project (ETUP) to upgrade the junior high school teachers and the English Materials Development Project (EMDP) to prepare materials for the senior high school. This core project then developed further the dissemination of a number of projects on in-service training and materials development. In 1985, as a follow-up to the former project being supported by many of the U.S universities in the scholarship schema, the PKG Approach (Pemantapan Kerja Guru—strengthening teachers works) in ELT at the secondary school was launched which was funded by loans from the World Bank and UNDP. Further assistance was developed under the schema provided by the Ford Foundation and Ministry of Education to build the Standard Training Course (STC) in Jogjakarta Central Java and Bukittinggi West Sumatera. STC was a successful project in which many qualified English teachers were produced. After the decline of teaching English in the Sukarno era under the threat of the Communist Party, English teaching in the Suharto era was strongly supported by the U.S government schema through its Ford Foundation. The popularity of TOEFL compared to IELTS in Indonesia was also a strong indicator of the American English influence in the development of ELT in Indonesia.

Table 3: English Departments established by State-Owned Universities (1965-1998)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Year of Establishment</th>
<th>State-Owned Universities</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1966</td>
<td>Universitas Gajah Mada, Yogyakarta, Java</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1969</td>
<td>Universitas Tanjung Pura, Pontianak, Kalimantan</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1976</td>
<td>Universitas Sebelas Maret, Surakarta, Central Java</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>IKIP Malang, now Universitas Negeri Malang, East Java</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1978</td>
<td>Universitas Mulawarman, Kalimantan</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1981</td>
<td>Universitas Tadulako, Palu</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1982</td>
<td>Universitas Bengkulu, Sumatera</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1983</td>
<td>Universitas Jember, East Java</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

75 Djojosoekarto, A Study of Several Delopment Factors in the Revision and Updating of the National English Language Program in Indonesia, 17-27.
Universitas Andalas, Padang

1984
Universitas NU.Sa Cendana, Kupang
Universitas Sam Ratulangi, Manado
Universitas Negeri Medan
Universitas Palangka Raya
Universitas Riau, Pekanbaru

1990
Universitas Terbuka, Jakarta

1993
Universitas Jambi

1996
Universitas Pattimura, Ambon
Universitas Padjadjaran, Bandung
Universitas Lambung Mangkurat, Banjarmasin
Universitas Negeri Gorontalo, Gorontalo
Universitas Indonesia, Jakarta
Universitas Cendrawasih, Jayapura
Universitas Haluoleo, Kendari
Universitas Negeri Makasar
Universitas Mataram
Universitas Pendidikan Ganesha, Singaraja
Universitas Negeri Padang
Universitas Negeri Semarang
Sekolah Tinggi Seni Surakarta-STS, Central Java

Total
29 English Departments in State-Owned Universities
Table 4: English Departments established by Private-Initiatives Universities (1965-1998)\textsuperscript{77}

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Year of Establishment</th>
<th>Private-Initiatives Universities</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1967</td>
<td>Universitas Sarjana Wiyata Taman Siswa, Yogyakarta</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1970</td>
<td>Universitas Simalungun, Medan</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1971</td>
<td>\textit{Universitas Muhammadiyah Palu}</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1976</td>
<td>\textit{Universitas Muhammadiyah Sumatera Utara}</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1979</td>
<td>Universitas Tidar Magelang, Central Java</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1980</td>
<td>Universitas Islam As-Syafiyyah, Jakarta</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1981</td>
<td>Universitas Wijaya KU.Sum, Surabaya</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Universitas Balikpapan</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1982</td>
<td>Universitas Jabal Ghafur, Medan</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Universitas Pakuan, Bogor, West Java</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Universitas Advent Indonesia</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Universitas Muria KudU.S, Central Java</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Universitas Mahasaraswati, Denpasar, Bali</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Universitas Islam Riau, Pekanbaru</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Universitas Indraprasta PGRI, Jakarta</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1983</td>
<td>\textit{Universitas Muhammadiyah Tapanuli Selatan}</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1984</td>
<td>Universitas Abulyatama Aceh</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>\textit{Universitas Muhammadiyah Surakarta, Central Java}</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>\textit{Universitas Muhammadiyah Ahmad Dahlan, Yogyakarta}</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>\textit{Universitas Muhammadiyah Surabaya, East Java}</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Universitas Dr Soetomo</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Universitas Warmadewa, Bali</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Universitas Katolik Widya Mandira, Kupang</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Universitas Lancang Kuning, Padang</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

\textsuperscript{77} Ibid.
Universitas Mahaputra Muhammad Yamin, Solok
Universitas Siliwangi, Tasikmalaya

1985
Universitas Serambi Mekkah
Universitas Wiralodra, Bandung, West Java

1986
Universitas PGRI Palembang
Universitas Universitas Darma Persada
Universitas Kristen Cipta Wacana, Surabaya, East Java
Universitas 17.08.1945 Surabaya, East Java
Universitas Ibn Khaldun, Bogor

1987
Universitas Gajayana, Malang, East Java
Universitas Sisingamangaraja XII, Medan
Universitas Nadlatul Wathan
Universitas MU.Slim Makasar
Universitas Satria Makasar
Universitas Sawerigading, Makasar

*Universitas Muhammadiyah Palu*

*Universitas Muhammadiyah Malang*

1988
Universitas Sintuwu Maroso, Sulawesi Tenggara

1989
Universitas Batanghari, Jambi

*Universitas Muhammadiyah Jakarta*

*Universitas Muhammadiyah Jember*

1990
Universitas Islam Jember, East Java
Universitas Darma Agung, Medan
Universitas Sisingamangaraja XII, Tapanuli Utara

1991
Universitas Samudra Langsa

*Universitas Muhammadiyah Bengkulu*

1992
Universitas Dayanu Ikhsanuddin, Makasar
Universitas Kristen Indonesia Toraja

*Universitas Muhammadiyah Mataram*

1993
Universitas Islam NU.Santara, Bandung
15 English Departments were established during the Sukarno era (Table 1 & 2). Table 3 and 4 show the Suharto regime – remarkably -- established seven times more with around 106 English Departments throughout Indonesia of which 29 English Departments belonged to: 

**Universitas Kristen Maranatha, Bandung**

**Universitas Panca Sakti, Tegal, Central Java**

**Universitas Islam Kadiri, East Java**

**Universitas Muhammadiyah Ponorogo, East Java**

**Universitas Muhammadiyah Pontianak**

**Universitas Muhammadiyah Makasar**

**Universitas Muhammadiyah Palu**

**Universitas Muhammadiyah Palembang**

**Universitas 45 Makasar**

**Universitas Muhammadiyah Purwokerto**

**Universitas Muhammadiyah MU.Slim NU.Santara, Medan**

**Universitas PGRI Kupang**

**Universitas NU.Santara Manado**

**Universitas Islam Darul Ulum, Surabaya**

**Universitas Muhammadiyah Ahmad Dahlan, Yogyakarta**

**Universitas Widyatama, Bandung**

**Universitas Gunadarma, Jakarta**

**Universitas Kanjuruhan, Malang, East Java**

**Universitas PGRI Adi Buana, Surabaya**

**Universitas Muhammadiyah Bengkulu**

**Universitas Graha NU.Santara, Padangsidempuan**

**Universitas Pasundan, Bandung**

**Universitas Galuh, Ciamis, West Java**

**Universitas Katolik Widya Mandala, Surabaya**

**Universitas Wijaya Putra, Surabaya**

Total 77 English Departments in Private-Initiatives Universities
state-owned universities and 77 English Departments were private initiatives, especially those established by Christian-Catholics missionaries and modern Islamic institutions, most notably by Persyarikatan Muhammadiyah. Muhammadiyah has established one fifth of all private initiatives: 14 Muhammadiyah universities; Christian-Catholics initiatives have established around one tenth of all Indonesian private universities. The remaining seventy percent were initiated by other traditional Islamic institutions such as NU, Hindu-Buddha religious institutions, and other indigenous nationalist and local institutions. During the Suharto regime, more than fifty percent of the English Departments that were established by the government and private initiatives played a seminal role in disseminating the emergence of teaching English into Indonesian universities.

During the Suharto era and after his fall, the number of private universities has grown rapidly and it has been necessary to coordinate each university under one Koordinasi Perguruan Tinggi Swasta/Kopertis (Private High Education Coordinator). The total number of the English Departments in Indonesia up until 2006 was 121, and the English Departments in each Kopertis are as follows: Kopertis Wilayah I (Medan, North Sumatera) has around 12 English Departments; Kopertis Wilayah II (Palembang, Sumatera) has 4; Kopertis III (Jakarta) has 8; Kopertis Wilayah IV (Bandung, West Java) has 18; Kopertis Wilayah V (Yogyakarta) has 14; Kopertis Wilayah VI (Semarang, Central Java) has 11; Kopertis Wilayah VII (Surabaya, East Java) has 22; Kopertis Wilayah VIII (Denpasar, Bali) has 7; Kopertis Wilayah IX (Makasar, South Sulawesi) has 15; Kopertis Wilayah X (Padang, West Sumatera) has 4; Kopertis Wilayah XI (Banjarmasin, Kalimantan) has 3; and, finally, Kopertis Wilayah XII (Ambon, Maluku) has 3. From the previous distribution of the English departments in each province in Indonesia, it is clear that the development of teaching English in Java is fostered more than in the outer Islands. Of 121 English Departments in private universities, more than half of the numbers are located in Java and less than half of the numbers are in the outer Islands of Java. The discrepancy of the distribution of the English Departments has hindered the development of English language especially in the eastern part of Indonesia as it apparently only has one twelfth of the number of all English Departments. The policy of stressing the development in Java during the Dutch reign was continually adopted during Suharto regime, although he had started the program of decentralization in 1992, the progress of the outer Islands still faces many obstacles. From 1992 onward also marked around half number of the entire English Departments establishment in universities. The growing number of the English departments was also supported by the government’s attitude toward English language education in the post-Suharto era. During Abdurrachman Wahid’s (GU.S Dur) presidency in 2000, he advocated for the Minister of Education, Yahya A. Muhaimin, being also a Muhammadiyah elite leader, to issue edicts on the regulation of core curriculum in the Indonesian universities. The edict stated that English language teaching could become the part of institutional curriculum of particular faculties outside of the English Department:
In the MPK group, institutionally, could be Bahasa Indonesia, Bahasa Inggris, Ilmu Budaya Dasar, Ilmu Sosial Dasar, Ilmu Alamiah Dasar, Filsafat Ilmu, Olah Raga dan sebagainya.


Contrary to the Sukarno era, the result of Suharto’s pro-western policy and favourable political situation to a free market economy made the English language program more important in the national educational policy. The Post-Suharto era witnessed the apparent support from the government toward English language teaching. Even outside of the government policy, formal education schema, informal language courses grew rapidly from the 1980s onward. Informal English language courses are innumerable in Indonesia nowadays. During the Suharto era, English language teaching whether in formal or informal education was gaining its stronghold.

Brief sketch of the development of National English Syllabus

As early as 1950, when a foreign language was to be chosen for the school curriculum nationwide (either Dutch or English), policy makers in Indonesia were well aware that English could serve a very important role as a tool in the development of the country, both for international relations and scientific-technological advancement. English was chosen over Dutch despite the fact that the Dutch had colonized Indonesia for three and a half centuries. As is very well recorded in the Indonesian history, the official status of English in the country has been “the first foreign language” and the political stance of Indonesia’s government is quite firm: “English is not and will never be a social language nor the second official language in Indonesia” (Sadtono, 1997:7).

With English being given this status, the objective of English language teaching (ELT) in Indonesia is to equip students with a working knowledge of the language. While this instructional objective may appear self-explanatory, in the context of formal schooling, the notion of “working knowledge in English” has been approached in different ways throughout the history of ELT in Indonesia. For instance, in the 1975 English syllabus, while the final goal of teaching was said to be the development of communicative competence in English, the actual English teaching focused almost exclusively on the mastery of linguistic patterns without giving proper attention to their use in communicative situations.

Quite predictably, the mismatch between the goal of ELT and the means being used to achieve it led to disappointment in both ELT theorists and practitioners. In the 1984 syllabus, which served to correct the 1975 syllabus, the notion of “working knowledge in English” was then approached by restoring the true goal of English teaching, that is, “meaningfulness and communicative functions” (Ministry of Education and Culture 1986).
and 1987 cited in Huda, 1999). In actual classroom practice, however, the notion of “communicative competence” was misinterpreted and taught by most teachers as “oral skills”. This misunderstanding, in turn, caused controversy among English teachers and experts.

Building on the lessons learned from these two failed attempts, current ELT in Indonesia adopts communicative language principles under the 1994 English syllabus, which brings to the forefront the notion of “meaningfulness approach”. Huda (1999) has interpreted this approach in two ways: 1) meaning-based instruction, and 2) meaningful instruction. Meaning-based instruction starts from the notion of language as a means to express and understand meaning. As meaning is determined by language scope and is also defined by social contexts. ELT should be targeted to develop students’ ability to understand and express meaning in the context of language used for communicative purposes. Language learning is meaningful if students learn expressions at the discourse level as opposed to isolated words. To this end, the presentation of learning materials must be in the context of specific situations because meaning changes in different contexts.

The second interpretation of the “meaningfulness approach” is that instruction should be meaningful to learners. Language instruction is meaningful if it is relevant to a learner’s needs and demands. The relevance of English instruction to the needs of learners as a group is ensured when what is being taught to — and engaged by — learners is somehow related to what they think is important and useful. To this end, the selection and presentation of learning materials should be made with reference to what is generally of interest to learners (horizontal relevance) and/or what is likely to be needed by learners in the near future (vertical relevance). To make the whole learning activity authentic, all language components and linguistic macro skills should be integrated, and treatment of any linguistic aspect or skill is to be made in the context of the whole discourse.

While, at the theoretical level, the goals seem reasonably clear, remaining at issue here is how classroom teachers as front-line players can translate the ideas as originally conceived by the syllabus designers. The issue of teachers’ ability to translate principles into classroom practice becomes important because it is the classroom teachers who will determine what happens — and does not happen — in the classroom. Another issue of concern is the kind and focus of the tests administered to assess the relative success of the instruction. The issue of test format and emphasis is important because we have learned from research and experience that grade is important to both teachers and students. That is to say, tests, as research has established, will drive instruction. The biggest challenge then is to empower classroom teachers so that they are productively involved in the design of course syllabi and assessment instruments.
Conclusion

The previous brief sketch of the arrival of European languages to Indonesia raised the spectre of the dominant roles of Dutch colonization in introducing English language into the Indonesian education system as early as the twentieth century before World War II broke out. The dominant role being played by Bahasa Indonesia was gained through two main movements, the anti-Dutch movement which led to the Sovereignty of Indonesia as a state and through the banning of Dutch and other European teaching by the Japanese colonizer, subsequently followed in the era of the Sukarno presidency. The power of Bahasa Indonesia, which formerly was only spoken by seven percent of Indonesian people in Riau Sumatera, was supported by its position as a constant ‘melting pot’ during its formative period in which Sanskrit, Arabic, Portuguese, Dutch, and English become main sources of vocabularies via their loan words. The Latin transliteration system being introduced by the Portuguese was then adopted into the formation of Low-Malaya language into Bahasa Indonesia. Such objective support from the many interfaces other languages rejoice in laid the basic unity of Indonesia as a multi-ethnic nation. Javanese which was spoken by the majority of Indonesian was not adopted. Bahasa Indonesia increasingly played a significant role in the formation of symbolic nationalism and the discourse of identity in Indonesia. To most of Indonesian people, their first language will be their respective dialects, and the second language will be Bahasa Indonesia, and their foreign language will most likely be English.

The development of English language teaching in Indonesia has always experienced its ‘ups and downs’. First it was introduced by the private initiative of the short English interregnum (1811-1816) and then by the colonial Dutch government with the onset of the Ethical Policy in 1930s. The education policy, however, was elitist in which the schools only accepted noble ranks, Chinese people and those who had converted to Christianity. The teaching of four European languages, Dutch, German, French, and English could only be accessed by the upper class. The popular education was then advocated by two main other institutions, the nationalists and the modern Islamists as proposed by Ahmad Dahlan in Muhammadiyah. The two types of institutions were considered “wild schools” (by the Dutch) and barely copied Dutch (Western) education system with additional Islamic teaching for Muhammadiyah. Almost all of the education system which now prevails in Indonesia was formerly adopted from the Dutch system. Muhammadiyah schools and universities also adopted the teaching of English into their curriculum. Although English language teaching declined during the Japanese colonial era and Sukarno era, it then gained a stronghold during the Suharto era when he adopted a free market system into the Indonesian economy through its apparent policy toward the adoption of English as the only foreign language to be taught in schools and universities.

The major support of the teaching of English in Indonesia was mainly initiated by three major factors: (1) Government’s positive attitude toward English language due to the adoption of a capitalistic economy; (2) private initiatives promoted by (a) western-educated
nationalist indigenous actors; (b) Christian as well as Catholics missionaries; and (c) modern Islamic institutions, i.e. Persyarikatan Muhammadiyah played significant roles in propagating the education to the neglected-indigenous population; (3) finally support from the U.S via the Ford Foundation which promulgated the soft core of the English department curriculum and in-service training for teachers of English. Although Dutch colonial government support to the education during the Ethical Policy was considered little, the impact of creating western-educated indigenous nationalists and a modern Islamist elite was influential in creating their own ideological education institutions which then spread over Indonesia and touched a more popular ground at the level of mass education. The private initiatives from nationalists and religious missions’ movements were then continued after Indonesia reached its Independence. During the Japan and Sukarno reigns, English teaching was not so enhanced due to the anti-western policy set by both political actors. During Sukarno’s reign, however, the U.S had helped in designing the syllabus of English teaching via the Ford Foundation in the hope that in the course of the Cold War, the more left-leaning Indonesian president would not adopt communism into the new state. The first seed disseminated through in-service training for English teachers and materials development were imported within the paradigm of American English. Almost all of Indonesian universities advocated the entrant for universities’ teachers as the TOEFL test rather than IELTS. American English paints the color of Indonesian English nowadays since the policy adopted by Suharto was in accordance with the U.S in the post Cold-War era. Being not colonized by the British, Indonesia adopted American English rather than British English which had been adopted in Malaysia. The stronghold of English language in Malaysia was dated formerly before World War II when the British colonizer spent much of its financial effort to educate the Empire. Compared to Indonesia, the Dutch spent the least on education among the European colonizers in South East Asia. This resulted in double jeopardy in the formative era of education in Indonesia where most of the people were not literate. The fostering of education was strongly emphasized during Suharto’s reign when he adopted a capitalistic policy in developing the country’s economy. English became the sole choice of foreign languages to challenge the global power from the 1980s onward. From the onset of the 1980s, the teaching of English as a Foreign Language (TEFL) expanded overnight and spread over to Indonesia. The quality of TEFL in Indonesia is, however, still a work in progress.
Reference

1. Main Sources:

a. Republic of Indonesia Laws, Government Regulations, Education Ministerial Edicts & Persyarikatan Muhammadiyah Edicts:

*Undang-Undang Republik Indonesia Nomor 2 Tahun 1989 tentang Sistem Pendidikan Nasional.*

*Undang-Undang Republik Indonesia Nomor 20 Tahun 2003 tentang Sistem Pendidikan Nasional.*


*Peraturan Pemerintah Republik Indonesia Nomor 57 Tahun 1998 tentang Perubahan atas Peraturan Pemerintah Nomor 30 Tahun 1990 Tentang Pendidikan Tinggi.*

*Peraturan Pemerintah Republik Indonesia Nomor 60 Tahun 1999 tentang Pendidikan Tinggi.*

*Keputusan Menteri Pendidikan Nasional Republik Indonesia Nomor 045/U/2002 tentang Kurikulum Inti Pendidikan Tinggi.*


*Keputusan Presiden Republik Indonesia Nomor 93 Tahun 1999 tentang Perubahan Institut Keguruan dan Ilmu Pendidikan (IKIP) menjadi Universitas.*

*Rancangan Keputusan Pimpinan Pusat Muhammadiyah tentang Qaidah Perguruan Tinggi Muhammadiyah.*

*Direktorat Jenderal Pendidikan Tinggi, 2005, *Rekapitulasi Perguruan Tinggi dan Program Studi,* Jakarta: Dirjen Dikti*

b. The History of private Indonesian universities on the respective universities websites [accessed per October 15th, 2006]:

Sejarah Universitas Nasional, Jakarta, http://www.unas.ac.id/
Sejarah Universitas Indonesia, Jakarta, http://www.ui.edu/
Sejarah Universitas Muhammadiyah Dr Hamka, Jakarta, http://www.uhamka.ac.id/
Sejarah Universitas Katolik Atmajaya, Jakarta, http://www.atmajaya.ac.id/
Sejarah Universitas Kristen Satya Wacana, Salatiga, http://www.uksw.edu/
Sejarah Universitas Kristen Petra, Surabaya, http://www.petra.ac.id/

2. Secondary Sources:


The FIQH Paradigm and the Moderate Theory of Secularization: Abdurrahman Wahid on Islam, Democracy and the Republic of Indonesia

Saefur Rochmat

Biodata: Saefur Rochmat is a lecturer at the History Department of the Faculty of Social Sciences, Yogyakarta State University (UNY). His research interests are Islamic groups and parties, religious studies, and Indonesian politics. His contact email is rochmat@yahoo.com.

Abstract

This paper examines Abdurrahman Wahid’s thought on the interface of Islam and the Republic of Indonesia, culminating in his affirmation of the liberal democracy. It was to resolve antagonism between the followers of the secular and Islamic aspirations by persuading them to accept liberal democracy as the common issue to deal with. By so doing, he developed a political approach, concerned more with the democratic relationship between the ruler and the people, rather than with an Islamic state. Indeed, he has departed from a legal formal approach advocated by the followers of Islamic ideological paradigm and argues that democracy is a kind of quasi-norm which should be respected by both the regime and the people, namely Muslims. In this regard, he has developed the Fiqh paradigm adopted by NahdlatulUlama (NU) which has justified the existence of the Republic of Indonesia. By doing so, he was able to provide a counter discourse to the monolithic interpretation of Pancasila by the autocratic Soeharto regime which had tried to marginalize the role of NU.

Key words: Abdurrahman Wahid, Islam, liberal democracy, quasi-norm, and Indonesia.

Introduction

Abdurrahman Wahid developed his religious political thought in the context of an autocratic Soeharto regime with the obsession of supporting the establishment of a democratic state in Indonesia, considered as the implementation of the principles of syuro (deliberation). As a traditionalist Muslim, he understood that the earlier traditionalist Muslim leaders such as from NU, Perti, and Jama’atul Wasyilah, had supported the establishment of the Republic of Indonesia as the political reality, and he evaluated that they had failed to halt the rise of autocratic regimes, namely the old and new order regimes, because they were not able to develop cooperation with the secular nationalists who tended to support the regimes because of ideological preference. It was not surprising that the traditionalist Muslims and the secular nationalists came from different knowledge systems. In this regard, Wahid, by means of the Fiqh paradigm, tried to incorporate a modern knowledge system in order to provide the traditionalist Muslims with the philosophical foundation of a modern political system. By so doing, the traditionalist Muslims would be able to develop cooperation with the secular nationalists for the purpose of controlling the regime in order to run the state democratically. In other words, Wahid’s thought of liberal democracy was designed as a
common ground which would resolve the ideological conflict between the secular nationalists and the traditionalist Muslims.

Wahid also introduced his thought of democracy to those who advocated the Islamic ideological paradigm, aspiring to the idea of an Islamic state. He tried to challenge their legal formal approach to the relationship between Islam and the state which considers the state is to implement the Shari’a (Islamic law) or, at least, to interpret the national ideology of Pancasila by the Shari’a. In line with the Fiqh paradigm, Wahid also considered the important role of the state for managing the public order, constituting the pre-requisite for religious order. However, the followers of the Fiqh paradigm do not consider the form of the state important, but only the function of the state. In line with this, the Muslim traditionalists justified the existence of the Netherland East Indies (NEI) and the Japanese Military Administration (Gunseikan) for the purpose of maintaining public order (Kamil & Bamualim, 2007, p. 97). Both governments also respected the rights of Muslims to practise Islam as the sine qua non for the acceptance of Muslims of the state. Moreover, both governments recognized the existing institutions for managing the internal affairs of the Muslims. They believed that it is not a religious duty to establish an Islamic state. In this regard, Wahid considers that secularization happens if the state is stronger than Islam (Abdurrahman Wahid, 1999a, p. 77). Accordingly, he is critical of the idea of an Islamic state such as advocated by the followers of the Islamic ideological paradigm as it tends to be manipulated by the ruler to protect his/her interest for power, not protect Islam. Accordingly, he was critical of the Soeharto regime’s marriage of the convenience with the modernist Muslims (Abdurrahman Wahid, 1999b, p. 12), who, then, associated with ICMI (Indonesian Association of Muslim Intellectuals).

He argued that the idea of an Islamic state advocated by the followers of the Islamic ideological paradigm was a kind of a counter discourse to the modern ideologies introduced by the colonialists (Abdurahman Wahid, 2006, p. 74), and he considered that this approach was no longer valid in the context of the Republic of Indonesia. He also believed that this ideological approach was not genuine in Islam, but rather adopting a foreign ideology to Islam. On contrary, he believed that foreign ideologies should be incorporated into Islam by means of the Fiqh paradigm which differentiates Islam from the political systems. By so doing, the followers of the Fiqh paradigm were aware of social forces playing in the social system and they did not try to change it by revolutionary method to suit the normative Islamic doctrines and teachings. This was due to the risk of the outbreak of anarchy, which would prevent the establishment of religious order (Abdurrahman Wahid, 1999b, pp. 165-171).

The Fiqh paradigm and the mutual legitimacy between Islam and the state

Wahid believed in the Fiqh paradigm, based on his evaluation of the history of Islamic civilization. According to him, Islam came to the Indonesian archipelago by a means of peace, not military occupation, and the Muslim traditionalists justified the existing political orders,
namely some non-Islamic kingdoms (Abdurrahman Wahid, 1999b, p. 167). This was due to their beliefs in the Fiqh paradigm. They persisted with the Fiqh paradigm when they were able to establish some Islamic kingdoms so that Islam and state were different identities, but both developed mutual legitimacy (Abdurrahman Wahid, 1999a, p. 54). These Islamic kingdoms facilitated the creation of some institutions to implement Shari’ah (Islamic law), and Sultans ruled the countries with the help of the clerics. However, this did not mean that the rulers were immune from any criticism as their responsibilities were worldly affairs, not religious affairs. Indeed, the clerics tended to support the status quo because they were afraid of the outbreak of anarchy which would cause the problem of establishing religious order. Moreover, the Muslims respected the judicature system by non-Muslim rulers of the Netherland East Indies and Gunseikan, as this judicature system is not an integral part of religious practices (ibadah), implying a secular affair, so that they did not insist on implementing the legacy of Islamic kingdoms.

The Muslims’ quality support to the existing political system was dynamic, depending on the government’s policies toward the Muslims. The Muslim traditionalists’ support for the Netherland East Indies was weaker than for the Gunseikan and, furthermore later, the Republic of Indonesia. This was because the NEI’s policies were less conducive to the development of Islam in Indonesia. These Muslim traditionalists did not challenge the existing political system directly and accepted the predominantly secular nature of political systems. Conversely, they tried to develop themselves in order to increase their bargaining power with the government.

In the early 20th century, Muslims were divided into three different paradigms that were the secular, the Islamic ideological, and the Fiqh paradigms. In this regard, the Gunseikan had an important role in developing communication and cooperation amongst leaders of different paradigms, in the governmental or semi-governmental institutions. By having a series of discussions at BPUPKI (Badan Penyelidik Usaha Persiapan Kemerdekaan Indonesia), the leaders of different paradigms were able to reach a compromise and accepted the national ideology of Pancasila. This agreement was called the Jakarta Charter and signed on 22nd June, 1945. Traditional Muslim leaders supported the Jakarta Charter when it was signed. By so doing, they agreed to proclaim a state that was not secular and not Islamic. This nature of state was maintained when Indonesia proclaimed its independence, but the Constitution of the state was modified in 18 August 1945 by PPKI (Panitia Persiapan Kemerdekaan Indonesia) to appease the demand of the Christians in eastern Indonesia, Kalimantan, and the Batak land as well as those “abangan” Muslims who did not want to comply with Shari’ah (Islamic law) and dominated PPKI. These constitutional changes were about the task of the state in supporting the Muslims to implement Shari’ah. Apart from the removal of the Jakarta Charter, the Muslim traditionalists, namely NU, Perti, and Jami’atul Wasyilah, based on the principles of the Fiqh paradigm, namely the main goal of establishing an independent state would not be nullified by the subsidiary goal for
struggling an Islamic state, had justified the birth of the Republic of Indonesia so that they participated actively in the national political system. On the other hand, the modernist Muslims accepted this idea of a secular state because their representatives were in the minority both in BPUPKI and PPKI. Accordingly, they persisted in their efforts of establishing the idea of an Islamic state by supporting the political party of Masyumi until 1960. In this regard, Wahid was convinced that the root of the NU exodus from Masyumi was due to this different paradigm.

The modernist Muslims struggled to establish an Islamic state constitutionally following the general election in 1955 which was intended to arrange a permanent Constitution for Indonesia, given that the Indonesian Constitution of 1945 was a temporary one. They did not attract enough supporters to support an Islamic state so that they reduced their standpoint by supporting the NU proposal of reinstalment of the Jakarta Charter to the Constitution of 1945. The followers of the secular paradigm challenged this NU proposal so that the Constituent Assembly failed to fulfil its task of formulating the permanent Constitution of Indonesia. Accordingly, President Soekarno dissolved this Constituent Assembly and the parliament and, then, issued a decree to reinstall the Constitution of 1945 with the national ideology of Pancasila without the Jakarta Charter. The traditionalist Muslims did not persist with their proposal and were willing to put aside their ideas on the worldly affairs because they considered the concepts of not holding absolute truths, although the concepts were related to Islam. In this regard, NU did not pursue a clear-cut black and white attitude toward the social phenomena as Islamic or non-Islamic concepts (Haidar, 1998, p. 6). They had supported Soekarno’s decree to reinstall the Constitution of 1945 without the Jakarta Charter because they found justification from the principle of the Fiqh paradigm that a decision for public affairs should be supported by the majority voice of the people (Abdurrahman Wahid, 2007b, p. 300), not from the texts of al-Qur’an and hadiths. However, they supported the autocratic Soekarno regime with the intention of countering the influence of PKI both in the government and Parliament. Conversely, the modernist Muslims did not want to join with the Soekarno regime as well as the appointed members of Parliament. They considered that the dissolution of the Parliament by Soekarno was contradiction to Islamic law as Parliament is the manifestation of the people’s voice, so that Soekarno had robbed the voice of the people

Wahid argues that NU’s proposal and its support for Masyumi’s proposal of an Islamic state was likely fulfilling a compulsory task (jalb al-masalih) in worldly affairs, but NU carried out these tasks based on its capabilities in regard to some constraining factors. And NU discarded its concepts if they caused negative impacts which harmed NU itself or Indonesians in general: to cause political instability generally which would hinder the establishment of the religious order. From the above discussion, we understand that the traditionalist and modernist Muslims developed different approaches to the issue of Islam and the state, although both supported the Jakarta Charter in 1945 and 1959. The
modernist Muslims advocated an Islamic ideological paradigm aspiring to an Islamic state. On the other hand, the traditionalist Muslims, namely NU, tried to reinstall the Jakarta Charter based on the idea of the supremacy of Shari’a, not the state, such as advocated by Ibn Taymiyah following the collapse of the caliphate. Indeed, the modernist Muslims claimed that the idea of an Islamic state was the advanced development of the idea of Ibn Taymiyah which would implement Shari’a into the state. They advocated the monolithic understanding of Shari’a for the purposes of unifying the Muslims against the followers of modern ideologies. By so doing, they ignored the Islamic tradition which acknowledges the plural manifestations of Shari’a in the form of the Fiqh. It was not surprising that they were more obsessed with the modern idea of ideology for their own purposes of establishing an national Islamic state. In this regard, Wahid criticizes them in his article titled “Jangan Paksakan Ideologi Asing pada Islam” (Abdurrahman Wahid, 1999b, pp. 165-171) and argues that Muslims should understand worldly life based on Islamic cosmology, namely the Fiqh paradigm, which is neutral to any political system. In line with this Wahid supported the Republic of Indonesia based on the national ideology of Pancasila, but he was critical of Soeharto regime which did not rule based on the principles of liberal democracy.

Wahid and the sub-ordination of Shari’a into the national law

Wahid has departed from the classical Fiqh paradigm and embarks on the Fiqh-plus paradigm as he incorporates the developments of modern science into the Islamic tradition. He interprets Islamic tradition in the light of modern knowledge and argues that Islam supports liberal democracy. It is due to his political approach to the relationship between Islam and the state which requires the government to rule democratically. He no longer adopts a legal formal approach that the state is to implement Shari’a, rather, considers democracy as one of the substances of Shari’a. His thought on democracy is a kind of subordination of Shari’a into the national law and it is also a kind of quasi-norm which should be respected by government (Abdurrahman Wahid, 2007b, p. 303). This implies that he supports the Republic of Indonesia with its national ideology of Pancasila in the light of liberal democracy. In this regard, Wahid challenged the Soeharto regime which advocated theory of integralistic state to maintain his power (Pranarka, 1985, pp. 42-43).

Plurality of Shari’a

Muslims agree that they should live by the religious regulations, namely Shari’a (Islamic laws), however they differ in what they mean by Shari’a. Wahid challenged monolithic Shari’a advocated by the followers of Islamic ideological paradigm as the formulation of Shari’a is bound to the existing social system. It is due to the Qur’an, as the source of Shari’a, not regulating the details of human life so that the product of Shari’a, namely Fiqh, is contingent upon the prevailing social system. Accordingly, Shari’a is the reformulation of Islamic teachings from its sources, the Qur’an and hadiths, by the clerics. Most clerics agree upon the matters of ritual teachings (ibadah) that have been regulated completely by the Qur’an and hadiths, but they have different views concerning the role of Islam in social life,
namely culture, including in matters of Islam and state. In this regard, there are three paradigms on the relationship of Islam and the state. Firstly, the secular paradigm believes in the separation of religion, namely Islam, from the state as better for both because it is to avoid the politicization of religion and the sacralisation of politics. Secondly, the Islamic ideological paradigm argues that Islam is superior to worldly systems, including the state, so that it does not agree with the secular nature of the state. That is why its supporters try to make use of the state to implement Shari’a (Islamic law). Thirdly, the Fiqh paradigm believes that Islam and culture, including the state, are different identities, but both should develop mutual legitimacy (Abdurrahman Wahid, 1999a, p. 54).

Wahid advocated the third paradigm, the Fiqh paradigm: Islam makes use of the existing culture, including the state, as a means of implementing Islamic teachings. This paradigm acknowledges the different manifestations of Islam based on the different cultures with their various social systems so that its supporters believe in the plurality of Shari’a (Abdurrahman Wahid, 2007a, p. 20). In the case of Indonesia, Islam does not function as the foundation of the state, but just as social ethics to the run of the state. In line with this, he was critical of the secular regimes, especially the Soeharto regime, which tried to incorporate culture, including Islam, to the state. This was due to his belief that culture and Islam should function as critical forces to the state which naturally tends to be misused by the ruler.

The Fiqh paradigm considers the importance of the state based on its function not on its form as Islamic or not. This is in contradiction to the Islamic ideological paradigm which believes in the monolithic Shari’a which would unify the Muslims against other ideologies in the pursuit of an Islamic state. Wahid believes that the Fiqh paradigm expresses the true religious law as it defines what is lawful and unlawful in every aspect of human beings in the view of Islam. In other words, Fiqh is a kind of effort of adjusting culture to Islam through a mechanism of legitimacy: filtering and, then, supporting the culture. Accordingly, he believes that the manifestation of Islam in Indonesia is different from other countries or regions as they have different cultures. In line with this, Wahid did not agree with the legal formal Shari’a and argued for the substantial Shari’a as the Republic of Indonesia is based on the national ideology of Pancasila.

The followers of the Fiqh paradigm are likely to speak in terms of Fiqh rather than in those of Shari’a because of their denial of the monolithic Shari’a. For them, Shari’a should be contextual. Accordingly, Fiqh relativise the religious law in relation to the social system. In this regard, NU differentiates which is a religious practice (the rituals of Islam) and which is a non-religious practice (culture). In the view of the principles of Fiqh, in the matter of rituals, Islam follows the principle of “al-aslu fil ibadah tahrimuha, illa idza al-dalilu ‘ala tajwizih” (The origin of regulation for rituals of Islam is everything is unlawful, except there is specific regulation for the matter); meanwhile, in the matter of non-rituals, Islam follows the principle of “al-aslu fil mu’amalah tajwiziha, illa idza dalla addalilu ‘ala tahrimiha” (The
origin of regulation for non-religious practice is everything is lawful, except if there is specific regulation which bans the case). For NU, the religious guidance is not always from Qur’an and hadiths, but possible through other methods such as ijma (consensus), qiyas (analogy), and urf (local tradition). Regarding Islamic texts not mentioning a specific form of a state, NU did not consider establishing an Islamic state as a religious obligation so that it was willing to negotiate the form of state with other socio-political forces (Abdurrahman Wahid, 2007b, p. 300).

Wahid understands that the NU’s support for the contemporary political system or regimes was different from one time to another. He argues that the NU’s support for the Netherland East Indies was in terms of country, not in terms of the state, because it did not participate in the management of the state. In this regard, NU justified the existence of the NEI because the latter facilitated an institution for managing internal Muslim affairs in a way acceptable to the NU. Meanwhile, in 1945 NU justified the Republic of Indonesia in terms of its acceptance of the form of the state with its national ideology. By doing so, NU leaders have participated in the governance of the state since 1945, both as officials and politicians. At last, in 1984 NU accepted the supremacy of the national ideology as it adopted Pancasila as the basis of its organization which implies the goals of Indonesian government is similar to those of NU (Abdurrahman Wahid, 1989, pp. 11-12). When the Soeharto regime tried systematically to marginalize the role of NU in national political life, some NU leaders responded creatively to assure the existence of NU without losing its critical stand towards the regime. NU was the first mass organization to accept Pancasila as the only basis for political party and mass organization. This flexibility is rooted in NU’s Fiqh paradigm approach to the relationship between Islam and the state, recognizing Islam and the state as different entities, besides NU’s understanding of the plurality of Shari’a. It was not easy for the followers of the Islamic ideological paradigm to accept Pancasila as the basis for their organizations because they believe in the monolithic Shari’a.

Apart from the modernist Muslims’ adoption of Islamic ideological paradigm, the Soeharto regime developed more accommodation to them than to the traditionalist Muslims, especially NU, as the regime tried to make use of them to reduce the political role of the traditionalist Muslims. Consequently, in 1984 NU corrected its political preference to PPP (the United Development Party) and declared its neutrality to any political parties. As a result, the Soeharto regime became more favourable to the followers of NU, but it was not easy for him to co-opt Abdurrahman Wahid, the executive leader of NU. Accordingly, the regime continued developing close cooperation with the modernist Muslims within ICMI for the purpose of marriage of convenience: the regime made use of them to create a political balance to the military, meanwhile the modernist Muslims persuaded the regime to support their agenda for bureaucratization of Islam in the form of creating ‘Islamic society’ (masyarakat Islam) (Subianto, 2008, p. 176). In this regard, Wahid was critical of ICMI for its support of the autocratic regime as well as its agendas of bureaucratization of Islam, which
he considers, would hinder the development of religious communities playing the role of civil society.

Sub-ordination of Shari’a into national law

Wahid admits that the Republic of Indonesia is a kind of a secular state and this has been justified by the NU, the traditional Muslim organization. Indeed, he continued the legacy of the NU and considered the previous NU leaders had pursued correct responses to the existing political system. Wahid argues that the theory of secularization has similarity with the Fiqh paradigm which recognizes Islam and the state as having different identities. It is not surprising that he already develops the idea of sub-ordination of the Shari’a to the national law in 1975. Indeed, the Fiqh paradigm is a theory of a moderate secularization as it provides a religious justification for the secular state.

Based on the Fiqh paradigm, Wahid does not agree with the authoritarian secular Soekarno and Soeharto regimes which tried to incorporate culture into the state bureaucratization in the guise of a theory of an integralistic state, firstly introduced by Prof. Mr. Soepomo. Wahid argued that culture should be independent of the state’s intervention as the former functions as the sources of values as well as the standard of conduct of the state. As one of the value sources, Islam also should function to provide the standard of conduct of the state. As one of the value sources, Islam also should function to provide the standard of conduct of the state and accordingly, he challenged ICMI’s efforts of subordinating Islam to the state in the form of bureaucratization of Islam to the state.

Wahid developed the Fiqh paradigm into the Fiqh-plus paradigm as he incorporated the development of modern science into the Islamic tradition, namely the Fiqh paradigm. By so doing, he interprets Islamic tradition in the light of modern knowledge. In line with this, he understands liberal democracy as the modern implementation of syuro. Accordingly, he does not hesitate about justifying the Republic of Indonesia with Pancasila as its national ideology. Furthermore, he proposes to sub-ordinate Shari’a into the national law, as he no longer believes in legal formal Shari’a, but in the substantive Shari’a. By so doing, he argues that democracy is a kind of the substantive Shari’a which should be implemented in the societal system, including the political system. This is due to his scepticism about the idea of an Islamic state in which the rulers often rule autocratically. That is why he proposes democracy as a quasi-norm which should be respected by those who hold political authority. Wahid’s thought on democracy was his response to the Soeharto autocratic regime which did not tolerate different ideologies. It was also to revitalize Islam from its marginal role in the Indonesian national political system as well as to resolve the existing conflict between secular and Islamic aspirations (Abdurrahman Wahid, 1999b, p. 101).

His thought on democracy was also a response to ICMI’s sectarian understanding of democracy which pursued the dominant role for Islam (Leppenas, 1983, p. 34) and, moreover, to implement Islamic law (Shari’a) (Feener, 2007, p. 112). ICMI was established in the late 1990 and signified the success of the
modernist Muslims in approaching the secular President Soeharto who had been searching for a way to balance or counter the rise in the power of the military. It was just possible for Soeharto to approach them following the acceptance of Pancasila as the only foundation for socio-mass organizations as well as political parties in 1985. It was likely that the hegemonic political power of Soeharto forced the modernist Muslims to adjust to the acceptable political system by the regime. In this regard, they did not pursue their political Islam via political parties, but by securing bureaucratic positions as well as empowering social economic activities. In fact, they did not develop a socio-cultural approach, but a structural approach from modern ideology, as they tried to change the political structure of the state in the long run. I agree with Benny Subianto that ‘ICMI was obviously political in nature or had direct political implications’ (Subianto, 2008, p. 176).

Democracy as quasi-norm

Wahid has persuaded Muslims to accept the prevailing social systems as the most appropriate and perhaps only medium for implementing universal Islamic values. He understands that Islam and the social system in Indonesia are not exclusive of, but interrelated with each other. This is in line with the holistic character of Islam that the fulfillment of the spiritual aspect requires efforts from the material aspect. In other words, the fulfillment of spiritual values is closely related to the material activities happening in the societies or in the environment. For example, it is impossible to establish justice or freedom outside the framework of social systems. In the case of Indonesia, he accepts the prevailing socio-political system, namely the Republic of Indonesia with its national ideology of Pancasila, and considers it as the final political aspiration of Muslims in Indonesia. In line with this, he affirms the modern concept of democracy as the foundation of nation state and considers it as the modern application of the principle of syuro (deliberation). Wahid argued for the substantive form of Shari’a in the form of democracy as a quasi-norm which would direct the course of the state (Abdurrahman Wahid, 2007b, p. 303). By so doing, Wahid tried to synchronize the mission of Islam and that of the national state. In other words, Wahid’s adoption of democracy was a kind of subordination of Shari’a into the national law.

This subordination of Shari’a into the national law is the result of Wahid’s adoption of the political approach to the relationship between Islam and the state: that he did not want to establish an Islamic state, but to control the ruler in order to rule by the principle of syuro. This is due his scepticism about the idea of an Islamic state in which rulers do not always rule by Shari’a. Accordingly, he focuses on the idea of democracy as the standard for developing a relationship between people and the rulers. Wahid argues that religion, namely Islam, should civilize the secular nature of politics, but should refrain from being an Islamic state. Moreover, he believes that secularization happens when the state is stronger than Islam as he considers that Islam puts emphasis on its teachings, not on its
institutionalization (Bahar, 1999, p. 83). Spirituality plays a moral function in life, while in his approach secularity becomes a tool for experiencing spirituality. This is contrary to the modernist Muslims who try to Islamize the state so that it will not be a secular state, a strategy designed with the purpose of challenging world ideologies such liberalism and communism. Wahid considers this kind of thought as a legal formal approach that uses the state for implementing a legal formal Shari’

A. Wahid also commits to Shari’a, but not in the form of legal formal; rather he believes that democracy is the manifestation of the substance of Shari’a. By so doing, he tries to avoid the confrontation between Islam and other ideologies.

Wahid does not want to treat Islam as a kind of ideology because this is contrary to the Islamic tradition, as embodied in the Fiqh paradigm. It is not surprising that Qur’an, as the core of Islamic teachings and doctrines, is not a book on politics and only provides some moral ethics in order for the state to run effectively. He also believes that the state is a worldly affair, such as other kinds of social systems. He is also sceptical of the ruler’s ability to uphold democracy as one of the goals of Shari’a. Moreover, power tends to corrupt so that a ruler prefers to maintain the status quo by all means. Accordingly, it is likely for the ruler to be oppressive of followers of different understandings of Islam. Last but not least, an Islamic state tends to lead the politicization of Islam as well as the sacralisation of politics so that it endangers a healthy political system.

Wahid tried to employ democracy as the criteria for public reasoning in political affairs. In this regard, religion, namely Islam, is to tame the nature of politics which tends to rest on hard power. This is carried out by either a personal involvement in political processes to direct the run of the state within Islamic principles or an inclusion of substantive Islamic values in the political sphere. In other words, Wahid tries to infuse substantive Islamic values into public spheres and accordingly, religion enters into the public sphere. It is not meant to implement Islamic law (Shari’a) into government regulations formally, but it is to introduce the substantial meaning of Islamic laws, namely, universal values with the ambition of halting the secular trend of the modern era. For that purpose, the clergy and Islamic scholars are challenged to keep track of the development of Western sciences, especially social sciences, so that they are able to find out the truth in the context of the modern era so that they can understand theology in the new perspective.

Wahid’s thought on democracy could be considered as a theology of Islamic democracy as he developed his thought based on the Fiqh paradigm which considers worldly life from a religious point of view. Wahid considers Fiqh as not just the practical religious law, but also the philosophical foundation of the religious law, in line with Imam Abu Hanifah and Imam Syafi’i, the founding fathers of the school of Islamic jurisprudence. For that purpose, he turned to modern science and philosophy in order to revitalize Islam in the modern era. What Wahid had done with his concept of democracy was his effort of
accommodating the culture (‘adah) into Islamic norms. Wahid was able to formulate a theology of democracy because he studied modern sciences and philosophy alongside his mastery of Islamic civilization.

Religious communities to play the role of civil society

As early as 1973, Wahid was critical of the Soeharto autocratic regime which did not try to create the mechanism of checks and balance within the society as the precondition for the development of democracy. Wahid’s criticism of President Soeharto was not in the form of challenging the legitimacy of the regime, but expressed by advocating pesantren to play a role in civil society. This was likely Wahid’s counter discourse to President Soeharto’s understanding of modernization, namely the project of development. This move was to divert the marginalization of the pesantrens, considered inaccurately by the regime as the bastion of political Islam. It was not surprising that the pesantrens’ followers had been the supporters of the NU party, but they recognized Islam and the state as different identities because they were the supporters of the Fiqh paradigm. Indeed, President Soeharto did not feel comfortable with any independent socio-political forces, such as the NU party (Subianto, 2008, p. 170).

The state was the prime mover of modernization, but the Western countries ignored this reality as the Soeharto regime committed to combat the influence of communism and Islamism. By modernization, Soeharto tried to centralize the power, not create strong civil society, and, then, was successful in co-opting political parties and some elements of civil society. Wahid tried to protect pesantrens from the cooptation of the regime so that he tried to empower pesantren communities in order to have awareness about their rights. By so doing, pesantrens were not only playing a supplementary role to the regime, but also a complementary role: participating actively in the course of modernization. He did not want pesantren just to be used by the government to legitimize the development programs, but rather held they should play a complementary role: pesantrens should be involved in the formulation of the goals of the developmental programs, their methods, and their targets (Abdurrahman Wahid, 1981, pp. 5-9).

In line with a true socio-cultural approach, Wahid’s adoption of a structural approach was not to change the political structure of the state, but just political culture. In other words, this structural approach simply aimed to empower societies for having the role of civil society within the context of the Pancasila political system. In this regard, he does not agree with Marxists’ revolutionary methods to change the national political system, because he believes that this revolutionary method violates humanism, respecting the life of the individual. Wahid calls these structural changes by means of evolutionary methods a simultaneous freedom which happens when all people develop following their own desires. By these methods, people should find comrades or allies in the prevailing structure in order to avoid the formation of a new tyranny in the name of people. Wahid believes that a true
freedom movement is a freedom without any ideological justification, except the interest of human beings (Abdurrahman Wahid, 1999b, pp. 169-170). In this regard, Wahid views that, in the course of social changes, religion functions as supplementary, providing a medium for social transformation, not, conversely, a driver of social change. This is due to worldly affairs developing following its natural law, and religion influencing the course of it only as long as it is open to receiving the influence of religion. This implies that Wahid does not want to make Islam an alternative tool for power, which would be a transplantation of an alien paradigm into religion (Abdurrahman Wahid, 1999b, p. 167).

Wahid’s thought on the theology of Islamic democracy is a further elaboration of the theology of the social pillar. This theology of social pillar was his efforts of providing a philosophical framework for the manifestation of Islam in public life. By so doing, he argues that it is misleading to contrast Islam and liberalism, as in Islamists campaigning. Islamists repudiated a liberal state as it gives freedom to individuals. Indeed, they tended to control the individuals as were the cases in some Islamic states, such as in Saudi Arabia and Pakistan. Wahid analysed that the cause of this misleading perception was due to the Muslims’ neglect of the social pillar as the midway between the pillars of faith (Rukun Iman), which are naturally individual, and those of Islam (Rukun Islam), which are implying the public goods. Wahid argued that the Qur’an 2: 177 also informs about this intermediary pillars, but most Muslims understand \textit{ihsan} in terms of personal life. On contrary, Wahid understands \textit{ihsan} as public goods which would absorb the antagonistic natures of the individual and social life. In line with this, he believes that public goods are not aimed directly to both the Muslims and the God, but to all people, apart from their religious background. (Abdurrahman Wahid, 2001, p. 149).

Wahid’s theology of social pillar was also to respond to Soeharto’s adoption of Soepomo’s integralistic theory, arguing for centralizing power. In line with this, Indonesian culture was respectful to the leader and this implied that people would give more power to the leader, namely the president. In this regard, President Soeharto followed the previous regime of Soekarno (Nasution, 1992, pp. 90-103). Through theology of social pillars, Islam respects the rights of the individual, such as the Islamic concept of \textit{khulliyatul khams} (the five objectives of Shari‘a), which is similar to the Universal Declaration of human rights.

In line with the political approach, Wahid tried to develop religious communities, namely pesantren communities of the NU, to play a role in civil society, providing checks and balance to the state, as the crucial element for the efficacy of the democratic institution. For that purpose, he tried to empower pesantren as the agents of community development. By so doing, he developed the social economic basis of pesantren which would support their civil society role. Moreover, Wahid provided the theological base so that their role was broader than that of the Non-Government Organizations (NGOs), and this included the theology of social pillars as well as a theology of Islamic democracy. This theological base
enables pesantren to develop a mutual understanding amongst the followers of different religions as the backbone for the existence of civil society. Accordingly, Wahid tried to develop a series of dialogues to strengthen the mutual understanding. By so doing, the religious followers did not conflict with each other and accordingly, unified in an effort of controlling the cause of the state. These all came under his goal of developing a democratic culture in Indonesia.

Reference


The Influence of Walter Benjamin on Benedict Anderson

Anthony Taylor

Biodata: Anthony Taylor recently completed Honours in Indonesian studies at Monash University, Australia. He also holds a Bachelor of Laws degree. His research interests include Indonesian literature, law and politics. His contact email is taylor.af91@gmail.com

Abstract

The influence of Walter Benjamin is clearest in the late Benedict Anderson’s often-cited theory of nationalism. Anderson argues that the combination of print-capitalism and the ‘fatality of linguistic diversity’ made the origin and spread of nationalism possible. He interprets nationalism as a cultural phenomenon, not an ideology. In Imagined Communities, Anderson attempts describe the real historical spread of nationalism without making the claim that any particular nationalism was original or authentic.

The key texts from which these ideas are drawn are The Work of Art in the Age of Mechanical Reproduction and Theses on the Philosophy of History. From a reading of these texts, we can see that Benjamin has influenced Anderson’s understanding of the origin and spread of nationalism through: (1) the importance afforded to print-capitalism; (2) the linkage between ‘homogenous, empty time’, modernity and nationalism; (3) the image of the Angel of History.

Following an explanation of these three points of influence, two criticisms of Anderson’s theory of nationalism that relate to his interpretation of Benjamin are then considered. The first is that Anderson overuses Benjamin’s concept of aura in explaining the spread of nationalism, most clearly when he seeks to establish a clear binary between authentic, “popular” nationalism and inauthentic, “official” State nationalism. The second is that the idea of nation and modernity should not be as strongly linked as Anderson proposes; there should be something more emancipatory awaiting us in modernity. I argue that the use of cosmology in Anderson’s last major work on nationalism, Under Three Flags, is a response to these criticisms. It demonstrates that Anderson has taken into account the simultaneous optimism and pessimism that characterises Benjamin (particularly in his attitude towards Communism). The two criticisms considered were, implicitly, a claim that Anderson had overemphasised the optimistic or pessimistic side of Benjamin in his treatment of nationalism. Rather, Anderson acknowledges the relationship of nationalism, politics, State and modernity to be highly ambiguous.

Keywords: Benedict Anderson, Walter Benjamin, Indonesian Studies, nationalism.

Introduction

In Language and Power, the late Benedict Anderson acknowledged his scholarly debt to ‘three Good Germans: Karl Marx, Walter Benjamin and Eric Auerbach, who helped me think about the modern world’. 78 This essay will scrutinise Anderson’s reliance on the thought of Walter Benjamin, particularly his essay The Work of Art in the Age of Mechanical Reproduction (herein ‘Mechanical Reproduction’) and

Theses on the Philosophy of History (herein ‘History’). The overarching aim is to better understand how Benjamin influenced Anderson’s theory of nationalism.

I begin with an overview of Anderson’s theory of nationalism. The theory is presented in light of Anderson’s later modifications to the original theory in Imagined Communities. Following this, I analyse the elements of this theory that are most obviously inspired by Benjamin’s Mechanical Reproduction and History: the notion of print-capitalism, the notion of homogenous, empty time and the image of the Angel of History. Through a focus on these three points of influence, the broader commonalities between Anderson and Benjamin on questions of materialism, culture and politics emerge. Finally, I consider some critical responses to Anderson’s theory of nationalism that relate to the influence of Benjamin on Anderson. I argue that Anderson’s most recent comment on nationalism, Under Three Flags, makes clear both his relative fidelity to Benjamin and his subtle stance towards nationalism.

**Anderson’s theory of nationalism**

In Imagined Communities, Anderson seeks to define the nation and account for both the origin and spread of nationalism. For Anderson, the nation is an imagined political community that is imagined as limited (territorially) and sovereign (State). It is imagined as a horizontal community regardless of a hierarchical reality. Anderson emphasises that the nation and nationalism is a ‘cultural artefact’, rather than a political ideology.

How did nationalism first emerge? For Anderson, ‘print-capitalism’ – the tandem development of print technology and its use in capitalist enterprise made the nation something imaginable. The growth in markets for print commodities (particularly the demand for popular language material) undermined the sacredness of script languages, the legitimacy of international dynastic orders and of cosmological world-views. Basically, print-capitalism undermined old ways of imagining the world. Following this, Anderson argues that print-capitalism, combined with the fact of ‘the fatality of human linguistic diversity’, not only negated an old cultural imaginary but made the nation (as a new way of imagining

---

79 Both found in Walter Benjamin, Illuminations (Schocken Books, 2007).
83 Ibid., 4.
84 Ibid., 36.
the world) a positive possibility.\textsuperscript{85} The growth of print languages (and commodities) ‘unified fields of exchange below Latin and above spoken vernaculars’, gave a sense of antiquity, through fixity, to the print language which would be important for subjective ideas of nation, and created culturally central ‘languages-of-power’.\textsuperscript{86} The vernacular newspapers and novels that, more and more, came to be sold, were the key print commodities that made new forms of consciousness and subjectivity possible.

Anderson argues that nationalism, while owing a lot to historical forces in Western Europe, first became a political reality under the leadership of creoles in the Americas. The glass ceiling faced by talented creoles in the colonies is posited as a key factor in the development of nationalist opposition alongside the publication of provincial newspapers.\textsuperscript{87} Opposition to colonialism was what made the cultural imagining of the nation important politically. Once established, nationalism ‘became “modular”’, capable of being transplanted, with varying degrees of self-consciousness, to a great variety of social terrains, to merge and be merged with...a wide variety of political and ideological constellations.’\textsuperscript{88} Anderson goes on to describe the later “waves” of nationalism, including European nationalisms and twentieth century anti-colonial nationalisms.

Both the State and popular movements around the world could make use of the national “model” for their own purposes. In The Spectre of Comparisons, Anderson argues that collective subjects (including nations) are formed by unbound serialities (exemplified by print mediums such as newspapers, and by references to open categories like “worker” or “citizen”) and by bound serialities (exemplified by the counting of ethnic categories in a census).\textsuperscript{89} On the one hand, there is popular nationalism, seen in revolutions where the State is virtually disabled and where unbound seriality is dominant, and on the other is what Anderson calls ‘official’ nationalism, which is promoted by the State and is in line with dominance of the bound seriality.\textsuperscript{90} As well as allowing for analysis of contemporary nationalisms, the distinction between bound and unbound seriality is an important methodological clarification of how we should understand the process by which nationalism originated and spread. With the notion of seriality, there is no ontological distinction between the original historical national model and its replicas around the world; none should be evaluated in terms of authenticity or against the first historical nationalisms.\textsuperscript{91} As a (modern) cultural phenomenon, nations should be judged by their style (historical particularities, official/popular) rather than their

\textsuperscript{85} Ibid., 42-3. Note: ‘it would be a mistake to equate this fatality of linguistic diversity with that common element in nationalist ideologies which stresses the primordial fatality of particular languages...The essential thing is the interplay between fatality, technology and capitalism.’

\textsuperscript{86} Ibid., 44-5.

\textsuperscript{87} Ibid., 57.

\textsuperscript{88} Ibid., 4.

\textsuperscript{89} The Spectre of Comparisons : Nationalism, Southeast Asia, and the World., 29.

\textsuperscript{90} Language and Power : Exploring Political Cultures in Indonesia., 95-7.

\textsuperscript{91} Andrew Parker, “Bogeyman: Benedict Anderson's “Derivative” Discourse,” Diacritics 29, no. 4 (1999)., 43.
truth (fidelity to the authentic original). This allows for an account of the historical origins of nationalism in certain locations (Western Europe, the Americas) and in reaction to certain forces (colonialism) without privileging these historical facts as constitutive of the authentic nationalism.

The Influence of Benjamin

How is Anderson’s account of nationalism influenced by Benjamin? The key ways in which Benjamin has influenced Anderson’s understanding of the origin and spread of nationalism are in: (1) the importance afforded to print-capitalism; (2) the linkage between ‘homogenous, empty time’, modernity and nationalism; (3) the image of the Angel of History. Alongside this schema, it should be remembered that it is Benjamin’s views on materialism, culture and politics in modernity, as a whole, that inspire Anderson. Nevertheless, I elaborate on these three notions, focusing heavily on print-capitalism, in a way which hopefully also introduces and explains the most relevant aspects of Benjamin’s thought.

Print-capitalism

Anderson’s notion of ‘print-capitalism’ is inspired by Benjamin’s essay on Mechanical Reproduction. In the 1930s, Benjamin opens that essay with the premise that he is at a sufficient historical distance to reflect on the effect of the rise of the capitalist mode of production on art. He argues that:

For the first time in world history, mechanical reproduction emancipates the work of art from its parasitical dependence on ritual.92

Benjamin argued that before the development and spread of printing and other technologies that allowed for reproduction, art had possessed a more significant aura. Aura is that which is ‘authentic’; that part of an object which cannot be reproduced. In the case of the artistic object, authenticity had its basis in ritual and religion.93 To explain further the disappearance of aura, Benjamin argues that there are two poles that art can tend to: on the one hand there is the cult, where the art is rarely seen (for example, a religious statue that is mostly kept from public view), while on the other hand there is the exhibition (in which the public are encouraged to view the art as much as possible).94 Mechanical reproduction favours the latter pole significantly, to the extent that, for Benjamin, the quantity of the shift becomes qualitative.95

Mechanical reproduction, in favouring this latter (“exhibitory”) pole, changes the relationship between author and public, reducing the earlier divide between the two that was based on the genius or creativity of the author. With high circulations and publicity of modern forms of art, there are more readers than

92 Benjamin, Illuminations., 226.
93 Ibid., 226.
94 Ibid., 227.
95 The idea of a qualitative changing arising from a quantitative change comes from Hegel and Marx. Another example is when the quantity of private property becomes significant it marks a qualitative change in power relations.
before, and more of them, in turn, can become engaged as writers (I will explain later how this claim is important for Anderson). In the absence of (religious) aura, these new mass-produced mediums would serve a (secular) political purpose: they would foster a Communist collective subjectivity. Benjamin concedes that an alternative course is presented by Fascism, which seeks to ‘organise the newly created proletarian masses without affecting the property structure which the masses strive to eliminate’. Fascism does this by allowing the masses ‘expression’ rather than their ‘right’ through the aestheticisation of politics (as opposed to the politicisation of art); for Benjamin, the artistic glorification of war and military technology is an important example.

What does Anderson take from these ideas? For Benjamin, the development of ‘print is merely a special, though particularly important, case’ of mechanical reproduction, but one which is not as significant as film, Anderson, though, wants to refocus the attention on print. This is because while Benjamin seems to view meaningful levels of mechanical reproduction as coinciding with the emergence of industrial capitalism, Anderson’s holds that mechanical reproduction was significant much earlier. Anderson states that ‘at least 20,000,000 books had already been printed by 1500’ and so the age of mechanical reproduction had begun by that time. Essentially, Anderson takes the general trends that Benjamin attributes to industrial capitalism’s effect on art, and applies it to the impact of print-capitalism on an earlier cultural world of holy languages and imagined religious communities.

Anderson agrees that mechanical reproduction undermines the aura of cultural objects and therefore has potential political impact (through changed consciousness/subjectivity). However, given his own starting points, he finds that it is not the specific political impact that Benjamin had predicted. Rather than serving communism by being a type of the self-destructive tendency of capitalism that Marx had pointed to, the loss of ‘aura’ of religious world-views caused by print-capitalism made a national consciousness possible. Anderson explains (Marx and) Benjamin’s miscalculation thus: ‘whatever superhuman feats capitalism was

---

97 Lunn (and others) have noted that while Benjamin is optimistic in this essay, he was deeply pessimistic elsewhere about the same set of circumstances. His concerns about Fascism are perhaps a hint of this pessimism. Eugene Lunn, Marxism and Modernism (University of California Press, 1982), 255.
98 Benjamin, Illuminations., 243.
99 Ibid., 220. But see Reflections., 225.
100 Critics of Benjamin pointed out that mechanical reproduction had been around much longer than industrial capitalism. Anderson is therefore justified in shifting the focus from linking impacts of industrialism on culture and politics to the impact of a pre-industrial/non-industrial capitalism on culture. It is likely, given his brother’s involvement in Verso/New Left Review, that Benedict Anderson is aware of such criticisms. See Theodor; Benjamin Adorno, Walter; Bloch, Ernst; Brecht, Bertolt; Lukacs, Georg, Aesthetics and Politics (Verso, 2007), 108 n5. See also Marc Redfield, "Imagi-Nation: The Imagined Community and the Aesthetics of Mourning," Diacritics 29, no. 4 (1999), 64 n11.
102 In fairness to Benjamin, his references to Fascism suggest he was not blindly optimistic or set in his predictions.
capable of, it found in death and languages two tenacious adversaries’. What Anderson means is that firstly, capitalism has not destroyed our desire, traditionally religious, to moralise death, and secondly, capitalism has yet to eliminate global linguistic diversity, which continues to provide a grounding for territorially limited imaginings. In this way, nationalism is a cultural product of capitalism (but not only capitalism!), which in some ways has replaced religion (as a secular moralising of death tied to linguistic diversity). Nevertheless, Benjamin correctly pointed to the impact of mechanical reproduction on cultural objects and, in turn, the impact in such a context of culture on politics.

Anderson’s theory about the worldwide spread of nationalism also relies on *Mechanical Reproduction*. Since the idea of the nation circulates globally, there is no “authentic” nationalism. This idea that nationalism is modular or a series of replicas without an original, mirrors, to some extent, Benjamin’s hope that readers or viewers of mass produced art would increasingly become “writers” (of nations for Anderson, of Communism for Benjamin). Anderson’s view of the State (per his distinction between bound and unbound seriality) and its potential to co-opt nationalism seems also to mirror the concern of Benjamin that mass-produced and circulated art could lead to Communism (meaning genuine participation of the workers) or Fascism (a State-sponsored spectacle of participation).

**Homogenous, empty time**

The concept of homogenous, empty time that Anderson uses to distinguish cosmological and modern imaginaries comes from Benjamin’s *History*:

> History is the subject of a structure whose site is not homogenous, empty time, but time filled by the presence of the now [Jetztzeit].

*History* offers a more pessimistic outlook on modernity than *Mechanical Reproduction* and we gain more of an understanding of both Benjamin and Anderson from considering it. In *History*, Benjamin suggests that homogenous, empty time is the time of capitalism where one moment is equal to and regularly follows the next (basically, clock time). Our cultural common sense under capitalism is attuned to experience the world through this sense of time. It can be contrasted with a cosmological sense of time in which time is experienced as passing between important events. For Benjamin, a real sense of history does not...

---

104 Just as Benjamin had, with the benefit of hindsight, sought to critique the “liberal progressive” elements of Marxian thought, Anderson, looking back at Benjamin, could see Benjamin was overly optimistic (even taking into account his ambivalence elsewhere) about the link between international Communism and mass art.
106 Eugene Lunn argues that while *Mechanical Reproduction* was overly optimistic, most of Benjamin’s other works were decidedly pessimistic about the future. Overall, he was ambivalent but critical of vulgar Marxist views. See Lunn, *Marxism and Modernism*, 223. Habermas (and others) consider his views as unsynthesisable, see generally Jurgen Habermas, “Consciousness-Raising or Redemptive Criticism: The Contemporaneity of Walter Benjamin,” *New German Critique* 17 (1979).
see all moments as equal (revolutionary moments, are more important, for example). In History, Benjamin establishes this distinction to critique the idea of historical progress held by the Left, as he sees it as opening the door to Fascist technocracy. According to Lunn, Benjamin sought to reduce the remnants of liberal progressivism latent in Marx, replacing it with a ‘hope in the past’, or in Benjamin’s own words, rather than being future-oriented and motivated: ‘our image of happiness is indissolubly bound up with the image of redemption’.

Anderson puts the notion of the empty time of modernity to his own use. The nation is an imaginary possibility that was embedded in the experience of time as homogenous and empty that was not accounted for by Marxist theory, including by Benjamin. Benjamin never located nationalism in the category of cultural ideas alongside the idea of “progress”. Anderson does; and following from this re-categorisation, he argues that the imagining of events as taking place simultaneously in time, rather than allegorically (as part of a cosmological experience of time) constituted ‘a fundamental change...in modes of apprehending the world, which, more than anything else, made it possible to ‘think’ the nation’.

This ‘fundamental change’ was from a consciousness that understood the present as a ‘simultaneity of past and future’ – ‘something close to what Benjamin calls Messianic time’ to a consciousness that saw time as horizontal, flat, a series of events, though one in which different actors may be doing different things. Simultaneity of events moves from being seen as prefiguration and fulfilment to a temporal coincidence. The formal features of the novel and newspaper, two key print commodities, promoted a sense of flat, progressive time. Thus, they contributed to the breakdown of cosmological imaginings. In contrast to Benjamin’s pessimism towards the “progress” of homogenous, empty time, Anderson finds a silver lining in its facilitation of the imagining of egalitarian communities.

The Angel of History

The metaphor of the Angel of History also comes from Benjamin’s History. Anderson quotes the ninth theses in closing Imagined Communities, and also begins with a quote from it in the most recent introduction to Imagined Communities. As

---

108 Ibid., 261-2.
109 His critique is directed at the German Social Democrats. Ibid., 260.
110 Lunn, Marxism and Modernism., 228. This position made Benjamin more like an anarchistic Nietzsche; this is something of a return to his intellectual roots.
111 Benjamin, Illuminations., 254 and 260.
112 This is why Anderson quotes Tom Nairn, ‘The theory of nationalism represents Marxism’s great historical failure’, at the beginning of Imagined Communities. Anderson, Imagined Communities : Reflections on the Origin and Spread of Nationalism., 3.
113 Ibid., 22.
114 Ibid., 24.
115 Here Anderson is also drawing heavily on Eric Auerbach. His un referenced example of the importance of ‘meanwhile’ in modern as opposed to mediaeval literature – and the concomitant consciousness of each, is from Erich Auerbach, Mimesis, trans. William Trask (Princeton: Princeton University Press, 2013), 180.
116 Anderson, Imagined Communities : Reflections on the Origin and Spread of Nationalism., xi and 161-2. ‘His face is turned towards the past. Where we perceive a chain of events, he sees one single catastrophe which
has been alluded to already, Benjamin turned to Messianism as a hope of redeeming the past in the face of homogenous, empty time, while the Angel can be understood as a loss of that hope: it is the idea of progress as piles of ‘wreckage upon wreckage’. In choosing to conclude with the Angel, Anderson suggests he is more pessimistic than Benjamin, or, at least, does not endorse Messianism in the same way. From the ‘wreckage’, he salvages nationalism. In the following sections I further consider, in light of criticisms of Anderson, the way in which the use of the Angel reveals that Anderson’s stance towards Benjamin, and to nationalism, is more subtle than some critics would have it, and perhaps what this initial explanation can suggest.

Criticisms of Anderson

I now consider two criticisms of Anderson that relate to his reading of Benjamin. The first criticism is that Anderson sometimes stretches the application of Benjamin’s views on aura (namely, that when cultural objects are mass produced and circulated, they lose aura, or, authenticity) too far in explaining both the spread of nationalism and the maintenance of contemporary nationalism through bound and unbound serialities. For Redfield, Anderson’s use of this idea too strongly juxtaposes a lack of aura in late official nationalisms with a “genuine” popular imaginary. He believes that overstating the aura-less nature of official nationalist cultural objects does not do justice to the ambivalent relations between nation, State and modernity. Redfield does not appear to have read Language and Power in which Anderson propounds his view on the nation and State as discrete but intertwined, suggesting that Anderson would also accept a level of “ambivalence”. Nevertheless, Redfield may also be right that Anderson at times pushes the explanatory power of aura to its limits, perhaps like Benjamin himself.

keeps piling wreckage upon wreckage and hurls it in front of his feet. The angel would like to stay, awaken the dead, and make whole what has been smashed. But a storm is blowing from Paradise; it has got caught in his wings with such violence that the angel can no longer close them. This storm irresistibly propels him into the future to which his back is turned, while the pile of debris before him grows skyward. This storm is what we call progress.’, Benjamin, Illuminations., 257-8.


118 I agree with Harootunian that while Anderson has used other metaphors to explain the manner in which nationalism spread (telescope, spectre of comparison) they amount to much the same thing as the circulation of copies reducing the aura of the original. H.D. Harootunian, "Ghostly Comparisons: Anderson's Telescope," Diacritics 29, no. 4 (1999), 140.

119 Marc Redfield, "Imagi-Nation: The Imagined Community and the Aesthetics of Mourning," ibid., 72.

120 The fact that not many commentators on Imagined Communities read this volume is also noted in Pheng Cheah, "Grounds of Comparison," ibid., 4 n1. Anderson, Language and Power : Exploring Political Cultures in Indonesia., 95-7.

121 Anderson is most probably aware, and takes account, of criticisms of Benjamin’s Mechanical Reproduction essay such as those found in Aesthetics and Politics. However, he may not have addressed all of them. Adorno, Aesthetics and Politics., 106-8. Lunn argues that both Adorno and Benjamin had a tendency to see aesthetic theory as easily generalisable; perhaps this applies to Anderson also. Lunn, Marxism and Modernism., 140.
A second, more sustained criticism focuses on Anderson’s linking of homogenous, empty time to nationalism. Kelly, for example, argues that while Anderson begins with a critical stance towards nationalism, he ends by linking the nation intimately with modernity. Greater emphasis on Messianic time, since it ruptures homogenous, empty time and what is imagined in it, is needed in contrast to what is taken to be Anderson’s overly positive stance towards the nation. Kelly believes that Anderson’s decision to drop Benjamin’s Messianism (against the nation) plays into the hands of the status quo - the ‘fictional global genealogy of American geopolitics’.

Chatterjee extends similar concerns to the notions of bound and unbound seriality, and therefore, to Anderson’s hopes (‘utopian’ according to Chatterjee) for popular nationalism against official nationalism. Chatterjee argues that the real time of modernity is heterotopic and combines local particularities (customs, ethnicity) with global capitalism and its utopian time (the imaginary time of capital that makes markets, prices and nations possible). The real, those customs and ethnicities, is linked by Anderson to bound seriality. Chatterjee believes that Anderson’s views stem from his one sided view of modernity, one which emphasises the dominance of homogenous, empty time.

In the same collection of essays, Harootunian is sceptical of Chatterjee’s claims (and we can extend this scepticism to Kelly). Chatterjee misreads ‘Anderson’s view of the role played by capitalism in the serial spread of nationalism and modernity’, by assuming identity between capitalism and modernity. However, as Anderson stresses, death and linguistic diversity cannot be subsumed by capitalism but are part of the cultural imaginary of modernity. Chatterjee misunderstands or does not engage clearly with this point, only remaining hopeful that capitalism will undercut postcolonial nationalism, making room for an “authentic” alternative. However, capitalism destroys authenticity but has also allowed for the ‘spectre of comparisons’ in which anticolonial nationalism emerged.

---

122 In a longer essay I would elaborate how the first criticism and second criticism are complementary and overlap to some extent.
124 Kelly, "Time and the Global: Against the Homogenous, Empty Communities in Contemporary Social Theory.", 868. Kelly also believes a realist take on nationalism – the nation as collective will to power. This is not particularly related to Benjamin, however. In contrast, Redfield sees Anderson as part of a Romantic tradition that sees the nation as willed: Redfield, "Imagi-Nation: The Imagined Community and the Aesthetics of Mourning.", 65.
125 Partha Chatterjee, "Anderson’s Utopia," ibid., 130.
126 See generally ibid.
127 Ibid., 131.
130 Ibid., 141-144.
Anderson himself offers something of a response to Chatterjee and Kelly, implicitly, with Under Three Flags. I believe this text provides something of a counterpoint to his decision to place the Angel of History at the end of Imagined Communities (therefore it goes against both the interpretation I have mostly followed until now and to which critics such as Kelly responded to). Anderson introduces the text as ‘political astronomy’ aiming to make connections between various anti-colonial nationalisms and European anarchism of the belle époque.\textsuperscript{131} This is a cosmological approach, demonstrating Anderson’s willingness to engage with the Benjamin of History. But further, this cosmology is presented as a prefiguring of our own time: in our contemporary era of globalisation, according to Anderson, anarchism is again dominant on the Left.\textsuperscript{132} The title of the text makes clear that Anderson, while critical of some anti-nationalist cosmopolitans\textsuperscript{133} is not uncosmopolitan; one can be sympathetic to multiple flags (anarchism, nationalism). Against Kelly and Chatterjee, Anderson makes clear that he is not adverse to non-nationalist politics as they seem to think, but rather is suspicious of the State and governmentality\textsuperscript{134} and is willing to make use of Benjaminian cosmological ‘redemptive criticism’\textsuperscript{135} in the process. The real line of cleavage that remains, then, is not about whether Anderson discards Benjamin’s Messianism or even about nationalism but on the nature and (Left) political usefulness of the State.\textsuperscript{136}

Conclusion

In formulating his theory of nationalism, Anderson remains remarkably true to the spirit of the two texts by Benjamin that I have focused on in this essay: Mechanical Reproduction and History. Anderson shares a materialist and modernist outlook with Benjamin in which capitalism destroys religious imaginaries (or aura) and allows for new cultural meaning. The “optimistic” Benjamin was hopeful that new cultural meaning would be of political significance (for Communism). Analytically, Anderson sides more with this Benjamin, albeit moving the analysis to pre-industrial print-capitalism. As a result of this shift in focus, Anderson sees nationalism (rather than Communism), as a cultural product of fatality (death, language), capitalism and technology, which comes to be of political significance. Meanwhile, the “pessimistic” Benjamin was aware that the processes allowing for his optimistic view of mechanical reproduction were undercutting the thrust of Communism through the cultural idea of progress. Kelly comments that ‘the nation first commands Anderson’s attention as the killer of a utopian political aesthetic

\textsuperscript{131} Anderson, Under Three Flags: Anarchism and the Anti-Colonial Imagination, 1-2 and 5.
\textsuperscript{132} ‘It remains only to say that if readers find in this text a number of parallels and resonances with our own time, they will not be mistaken’. Ibid., 7-8.
\textsuperscript{133} The Spectre of Comparisons: Nationalism, Southeast Asia, and the World, 29.
\textsuperscript{134} See Lunn n31 above regarding Benjamin’s own anarchistic tendencies.
\textsuperscript{135} I take this phrase from Habermas, “Consciousness-Raising or Redemptive Criticism: The Contemporaneity of Walter Benjamin.”
\textsuperscript{136} Anderson seems to be aware of Benjamin’s own anarchistic outlook, perhaps more than the critics.
[Communism] and reveals this utopia as fantasy. In a sense, while Anderson shares less outward affinity with the “pessimistic” Benjamin, his starting point is the same. Benjamin offered redemptive criticism as a way out of the idea of progress. Anderson, while certainly eliciting a preference for the Angel of History over Messianism, does not ignore this option of redemptive criticism as much as some critics would have it.

Reference


137 Kelly, "Time and the Global: Against the Homogenous, Empty Communities in Contemporary Social Theory.", 847.